CHAPTER 14

Designing Compensation Systems to Respond to Equity Requirements

## Table of Contents

[EL 1: Case: Resolving equity issues with a point evaluation plan (from text) 1](#_Toc491425378)

[EL 2. Ranking jobs on the basis of what you think they should be paid 21](#_Toc491425379)

[EL 3. Carrying out a Point Job Evaluation on Benchmark Jobs 22](#_Toc491425380)

[EL 4. Case: Determining the External Equity of Jobs 34](#_Toc491425381)

[References 35](#_Toc491425382)

# EL 1: Case: Resolving equity issues with a point evaluation plan (from text)

One of the historical issues relating to pay discrimination was that inside workers (who were usually women) were paid at a lower rate than outside workers (who were generally men). The goal of point evaluation plans was to fairly determine the worth of a job based on factors agreed to be important to the organization.

 The point system requires evaluators to rate jobs on a factor-by-factor basis. Evaluators rate the jobs on the basis of each factor by defining the number of points (a rating of the job’s worth). Each job’s relative value in the organization is a measure of the total number of points assigned to it. This locates the job in the pay structure.

Your client, a local government organization, has asked you to review two job descriptions: a backhoe operator job which has traditionally been performed by males, and a Clerk job which has been historically held by women. One of the goals of pay equity is to encourage equal pay for work of equal value and reduce any wage differences in jobs where pay reflects the fact that they are ‘male’ or ‘female’ dominated jobs.

In the previous job classification plan, the administrative clerk’s job was paid at a lower rate. Your client has asked you to use CUPE’s job evaluation plan. You can use the job evaluation plan illustrate in table 14.1 and the job analysis questionnaire following the table.

 **Task:**

Working with a partner, your task as consultants is to assess whether a point job evaluation plan (like CUPE’s gender neutral plan) issbe useful for resolving internal equity issues for your client. Table 14.1 summarizes the factors and the weighting on each factor. You could change the weightings.

***Clerk Accounts Payable***

*Responsible for financial records work under supervision. The work involves preparation and maintenance of records, preparation and input of data to the Electronic Data Processing System and checking the results for validity, posting adjustments, maintaining files, and providing and obtaining information relative to the field of work. The work is checked for quality and quantity and problems involving interpretation of procedures or concerning policy decisions are referred to the supervisor. The work is differentiated from that of Clerk typist by the greater complexity of tasks and degree of independent action allowed*.

***Backhoe Excavator Operator***

*Reporting to the Foreman, the Excavator Operator is responsible for the safe and efficient operation of the construction excavator/hoe. Responsible for using mechanical controls to operate the boom, arm and bucket to excavate, level off and work the ground. Operate the excavator/hoe and other heavy equipment in a safe and appropriate manner. Perform routine cleaning and maintenance to ensure smooth operation of the machinery. Operate Excavator/Hoe on public roadways, maintaining proper awareness of ones surroundings. Ensure a sound understanding of the issues involving ground disturbance. Promote, execute and adhere to the safety program, and encourage all employees, subcontractors and consultants to adopt safety as a culture.*

1. You might connect to CUPE’s job evaluation manual by inserting the CUPE job evaluation in the web Brower. However, you might use the job evaluation plan illustrated in table 14.1 and the job analysis questionnaire following the table.[[1]](#endnote-1)
2. Begin with the job analysis questionnaire and refer to the job description of one of the jobs. Then, review the 11 subfactors in the job evaluation questionnaire to determine the level required.
3. After rating the job, go to table 14.1 and circle the degrees which correspond to each job on each of the subfactors. For example, you might rate the clerk’s account payable’s educational requirements as 5.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| *High school graduation plus an additional program/course(s) of over six months and up to one year or equivalent.* | *5* |

For this knowledge subfactor 1, this would receive 82 points. Continue rating the job on other subfactors. Then, rate the Backhoe operator in a similar fashion.

1. Add up the scores for each job on all the subfactors

 ***Clerk*** ***Accounts Payable*** points \_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 ***Backhoe/Excavator Operator*** points \_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. In the past, under the old job classification plan in 1980, the Backhoe Escavator position received a higher hourly rate. The rates in 2017 in a local government were similar at $28.12. The clerk position was in pay grade 8 (inside position listing) as was the backhoe operator (outside position listing).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Job  | Hourly rate in 1990 under job classification plan | Hourly rate in 2017 under point evaluation plan |
| *Clerk Accounts Payable* | $14.84 | 28.12 |
| *Backhoe/Excavator Operator* | $17.70 | 28.12 |

*Questions:*

1. Recognize that these differences don’t allow for inflation. But, based on your job evaluation using the point evaluation plan, are the jobs of similar worth?
2. The point plans put more value on certain factors (skill and knowledge vs. working conditions and physical effort). What is the downside of doing this?
3. In carrying job evaluations, employers have the responsibility to showing that their plans are gender neutral. In response, point job evaluation plans have been implemented to fairly judge each job using the same factors or criteria. In the past, jobs performed by males seemed to be rated higher and after introducing point evaluation plans, inside worker jobs (normally performed by females) were given more attentions. However, some pundits suggest that there might still be systemic biases in awarding more points to jobs held by males because of the choice and weighting of each factor. They suggest that the factor “supervisory responsibility” puts more weight on jobs more likely performed by males. In the same way, is there a systemic bias to giving weight to education?

***Table 14.1: CUPE’s Job Evaluation Plan***

***Factor and Subfactors and the points for different degrees***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Factors & Subfactors | Degrees |
|  | ***1*** | ***2*** | ***3*** | ***4*** | ***5*** | **6** | **7** | **8** | **9** |
| SKILL FACTOR |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Knowledge | 15 | 32 | 49 | 65 | 82 | 99 | 116 | 133 | 150 |
| 2. Experience | 10 | 21 | 33 | 44 | 55 | 66 | 78 | 89 | 100 |
| 3. Judgement | 10 | 28 | 46 | 64 | 82 | 100 |  |  |  |
| EFFORT FACTOR |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4. Mental Effort | 10 | 31 | 55 | 78 | 100 |  |  |  |  |
| 5. Physical Effort | 5 | 16 | 27 | 39 | 50 |  |  |  |  |
| 6. Dexterity | 5 | 16 | 27 | 39 | 50 |  |  |  |  |
| RESPONSIBILITY FACTOR |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7. Accountability  | 10 | 32 | 55 | 78 | 100 |  |  |  |  |
| 8. Safety of others | 8 | 32 | 56 | 89 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9. Supervision of others | 7 | 23 | 46 | 54 | 70 |  |  |  |  |
| 10. Contacts | 10 | 28 | 46 | 82 | 100 |  |  |  |  |
| WORKING CONDITION FACTOR |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11. Disagreeable conditions | 10 | 32 | 55 | 78 | 100 |  |  |  |  |

JOB ANALYSIS QUESTIONNAIRE

This CUPE GENDER-NEUTRAL JOB EVALUATION PLAN contains a rating manual which allows jobs to be placed in a proper relative order dependent upon their rated worth. This rating manual is based upon four (4) main factors: Skill • Effort • Responsibility • Working Conditions[[2]](#endnote-2)

### FACTORS & SUBFACTORS

### SKILL FACTOR

Subfactor I Knowledge

Subfactor 2 Experience

Subfactor 3 Judgement

### EFFORT FACTOR

Subfactor 4 Concentration

Subfactor 5 Physical Effort

Subfactor 6 Dexterity

### RESPONSIBILITY FACTOR

Subfactor 7 Accountability

Subfactor 8 Safety of Others

Subfactor 9 Supervision of Others

Subfactor 10 Contacts

### WORKING CONDITIONS FACTOR

Subfactor 11 Disagreeable Working Conditions

### SKILL FACTOR

### Subfactor 1: Knowledge Definition:

This subfactor measures the general knowledge and specialized or vocational training necessary to perform the job duties in a satisfactory manner and has no relationship to the academic achievement of an employee. The degree levels are normally expressed in terms of formal education or equivalent. Similar levels of achievement can be obtained through related experience, courses or self-improvement

*Degrees and description*

|  |
| --- |
| ***Degrees*** |
| *Less than high school graduation* | *1* |
| *Less than high school graduation plus an additional program/course(s) or equivalent.* | *2* |
| *High school graduation or equivalent.* | *3* |
| *High school graduation plus an additional program/course(s) of up to six months or equivalent.* | *4* |
| *High school graduation plus an additional program/course(s) of over six months and up to one year or equivalent.* | *5* |
| *High school graduation plus an additional program of over two and up to three years or three years undergraduate degree or equivalent* | *6* |
| *High school graduation plus an additional program of over two and up to three years or three years undergraduate degree or equivalent* | *7* |
| *Undergraduate degree - Four years or equivalent.* | *8* |
| *Graduate level.* | *9* |

### SKILL FACTOR

### Subfactor 2: Experience Definition:

This subfactor should be considered when the degree of knowledge is established. It serves as a scale of measurement for the amount of practical experience that an average individual having the appropriate theoretical knowledge, specific education and specialized training, would require to be able to perform the job duties. It includes the sum of (a) and (b):

a) Experience in any related work or work in lesser positions and other relevant work and life experiences which are necessary for performance of the jobs.

b) The period of training and adjustment on the job itself

1. Experience covers the time required to learn the practical application of theoretical knowledge to work problems, and to learn the necessary techniques, methods, practices, procedures, use of forms, routines, etc.

2. Under this subfactor, no consideration is given to the maturing of the individual.

3. It includes the years spent in an apprenticeship or similar training program excluding formal classroom time.

### Degrees and description

*How many months and/or years of experience (acquired either on the job or elsewhere) are needed to acquire the skills necessary to do your job satisfactorily, (i.e., the time required to learn internal and external procedures, resources, as well as specialized skills)*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| ***PERIOD OF TIME*** | ***PREVIOUS RELATED EXPERIENCE*** | ***ON THE JOB EXPERIENCE*** |
|  | *Up to one month* |  | *1* |
|  | *Over 1 up to 3 months* |  | *2* |
|  | *Over 3 up to 6 months* |  | *3* |
|  | *Over 6 months up to 1 year* |  | *4* |
|  | *Over 1 up to 2 years*  |  | *5* |
|  | *Over 2 up to 3 years* |  | *6* |
|  | *Over 3 up to 4 years* |  | *7* |
|  | *Over 4 up to 5 years* |  | *8* |
|  | *Over 5 years – specify:* |  | *9* |
| *Please give examples of the job duties you were considering in making your determination(s):* |

##### NOTES TO RATERS

1. Experience covers the time required to learn the practical application of theoretical knowledge to work problems, and to learn the necessary techniques, methods, practices, procedures, use of forms, routines, etc.
2. Under this subfactor, no consideration is given to the maturing of the individual. It includes the years spent in an apprenticeship or similar training program excluding formal classroom time.
3. Field time required for membership in a professional organization, designation, or requirements for a license should be considered under this subfactor.
4. This subfactor does not measure the actual experience of the incumbent(s) and bears no relation whatsoever to the hiring practice of the organization.
5. Life experiences to include categories such as homemaking, child rearing, participation in sports, clubs, volunteer work, etc.

### SKILL FACTOR

### Subfactor 3: Judgement Definition

This subfactor measures the judgement, choice of action and initiative required in applying methods, procedures, or policies to complete the job duties.

*Degrees and description*

1. The job requires the use of established guidelines that are well defined or detailed. There is little or no need for choice of actions
2. The job requires the application of established methods or procedures. Work may involve a choice of methods.
3. The job requires adapting established methods or procedures. Work involves a choice of methods or procedures.
4. The job requires that change be recommended to established methods or procedures. Work involves a choice of methods or procedures or sequence of operations.
5. The job requires the development of procedures.
6. The job requires that changes be recommended to established policies.

##### NOTES TO RATERS

1. This subfactor deals with the range of choice of action which is within the scope of the job duties, and does not deal with the responsibly for decisions which is dealt with under the Responsibility factor.
2. Consider the initiative required in problem solving, analysis of situations and problems, the application of fundamental principles and the extent to which judgement must be exercised in deciding upon the appropriate choices of action.
3. Evaluate the judgement permitted within the parameters and constraints of the position. No consideration is given to the capabilities of the incumbent.

*Questions*

1. Describe some typical problems that you generally solve on your own, using experience and expertise
2. Describe some typical problems that you would usually pass on to your supervisor or a colleague
3. Describe some typical problems that you would solve by referring to manuals, policy books or industry codes
4. What guidelines, procedures and/or manuals assist you in carrying out your job duties.

### EFFORT FACTOR

### Subfactor 4: Concentration Definition

This subfactor measures the period of time wherein mental, visual and/or aural concentration is required on the job. Both the frequency and duration of the effort are to be considered.

Please describe those duties of your job which require periods of mental, aural (listening and visual concentration such as operating a switchboard, reading, driving, inputting data, or a combination of the five senses, sight, taste, smell, touch and hearing, are required in the course of doing the job that result in mental/sensory fatigue)

*Degrees and description*

1. Occasional periods of short duration.
2. Frequent periods of short duration;

*OR Occasional periods of intermediate duration.*

1. Almost continuous periods of short duration;

*OR Frequent periods of intermediate duration;*

*OR Occasional periods of long duration.*

1. Almost continuous periods of intermediate duration;

*OR Frequent periods of long duration;*

1. Almost continuous periods of long duration.

##### NOTES TO RATERS

1. Attentiveness is required for all jobs, rate tasks requiring concentration.
2. Concentration includes activities such as listening, interpreting, reading, watching, driving, inputting data, or when a combination of the five senses, sight, taste, smell, touch and hearing are required in the course of doing the job that result in mental/sensory fatigue.
3. Consider components such as interruptions and the requirements for simultaneous processing of information, (i.e. maintaining concentration despite frequent interruptions or changes in work priorities).
4. a) Duration of uninterrupted time is measured as follows:
* Short: Up to and including one hour.
* Intermediate: Over one hour, and up to and including two hours.
* Long: In excess of two hours.

4 b) Frequency relates to work carried out on a regular basis throughout the year.

* Occasional: Once in a while, most days.
* Frequent: Several times a day or at least four days per week.
* Almost: Most working hours for at least an average of four days per week.

### EFFORT FACTOR

### Subfactor 5: Physiclal Effort Definition

This subfactor measures the physical activity by the type and duration required to perform the job duties.

*Degrees and description*

1. Light activity of short duration.
2. Light activity of intermediate duration;

*OR Medium activity of short duration.*

1. Light activity of long duration;

*OR Medium activity of intermediate duration;*

*OR Heavy activity of short duration.*

1. Medium activity of long duration;

*OR Heavy activity of intermediate duration.*

1. Heavy activity of long duration

##### NOTES TO RATERS

1. Consider restriction of movement.

2. a) Types of physical exertion:

* Light: sitting, driving, walking on even surfaces, lifting up to 5 kg.
* Medium: standing, climbing stairs, walking on uneven surfaces, lifting up to 10 kg.
* Heavy: Stooping, kneeling, crouching, lifting beyond 10 kg.

2. b) Duration:

* Short: up to and including one hour.
* Intermediate: over one hour and up to and including 2 hours
* Long: in excess of two hours

### EFFORT FACTOR

### Subfactor 6: Dexterity Definition

This subfactor measures the level of dexterity required by a job. The levels of manual dexterity are determined by considering the elements of speed and/or hand/eye (or hand/foot> co-ordination. Movements can be either fine, coarse or a combination of the two.

*Degrees and description*

1. Job requires tasks that demand co-ordination of coarse movements, where, speed is a minor consideration.
2. Job requires tasks that demand the co-ordination of coarse movements, where speed is a moderate consideration;

*OR*

*Co-ordination of coarse and fine movements, where speed is a minor consideration.*

1. Job requires tasks that demand the co-ordination of coarse movements, where speed is a major consideration;

*OR*

*Co-ordination of coarse and fine movements, where speed is a moderate consideration;*

*OR*

*Co-ordination of fine movements, where speed is a minor consideration.*

1. Job requires tasks that demand the co-ordination of coarse and fine movements, where speed is a major consideration;

*OR*

*Co-ordination of fine movements, where speed is a moderate consideration.*

1. Employee is required to perform tasks that demand the accurate coordination of fine movements, where speed is a major consideration.

##### NOTES TO RATERS

Does your work require accurate hand/eye or hand/foot coordination? This can be a **fine movement** such as keyboard skills, arc welding, giving injections, drafting, repairing fine instruments/equipment, dispensing oral medications

Speed consideration is determined by the necessity of performing tasks within a

specific period of time.

* Minor: Speed is not a significant requirement when undertaking tasks.
* Moderate: Speed matters in undertaking tasks but other considerations are at least as important.
* Major: The speed with which tasks are undertaken is central to the nature of the work.

### RESPONSIBLITY FACTOR

### Subfactor 7: Accountability Definition

This subfactor measures the effect of actions on others and covers the relationship between the nature of the work, the loss of time and resources and the impact of the work on the organization.

Which statement best describes the likely consequences of an **error** in doing your work. Please give examples of significant **errors** which could be made in your job, and indicate the consequences such as: delays, financial loss, effect on others, disruption or delay of service. What would be the effect of errors on others in terms of the loss of time, the effect on the work or the impact on the public image of the most serious errors that could be committed in the carrying out of your job duties. How would such errors be discovered, corrected and resolved

*Degrees and Description*

1. An error would have little or no direct consequences on others. I could correct it myself. Explain:
2. An activity involving others could be delayed or an error would result in minor loss of resource. Explain:
3. Others could suffer damages or some physical/psychological discomfort; or an error would result in significant loss of time or resource. Explain:
4. Others could suffer significant physical/psychological harm; probable errors could involve considerable expenditures of time or resource or significant embarrassment within the organization. Explain
5. Others could suffer permanent physical/psychological impairment; probable errors could involve major expenditure of time or resource or cause severe embarrassment within the organization. Explain:

##### NOTES TO RATERS

1. Consider the nature of the more serious probable errors of the job (regardless of the type or cause), at what stage errors would be detected and their effect.
2. Consider accountability in terms such as:

• handling money

• damage or loss involving equipment, supplies or property

• disruption or delay of service

• loss of time in detecting and correcting an error

• inaccuracy of reports or records

• safeguarding of restricted information

• morale of others

• the seriousness of an error

• embarrassment to the organization, department

### RESPONSIBLITY FACTOR

### Subfactor 8: Safety of Others Definition:

This subfactor measures the degree of care required to prevent injury or harm to others.

*Degrees and description*

1. Little degree of care required to prevent injury or harm to others.
2. Some degree of care required to prevent injury or harm to others.
3. Considerable degree of care required to prevent injury or harm to others.
4. High degree of care required to prevent injury or harm to others.

##### NOTE TO RATERS

1. This subfactor is not to be seen as conflicting with any and all Health and Safety Regulations in the workplace, nor is it an evaluation of such regulations.
2. It is recognized that all incumbents have a self-disciplined responsibility for the welfare of others which includes their fellow workers. However, some jobs and their locations have more potential hazards than others and it is in this context that the relative differences of “little”, “some”, “considerable” and “high” are used.

Before rating this subfactor raters should define under degree of care the meaning

of “little”, “some”, “considerable” and “high degree” as it applies to the

workplace. Consider the following examples as a guide:

Little: Closing of file drawers

Some: Post of ‘wet floors’ signs, stacking supplies

Considerable: Putting up bed rails, use of heavy equipment, yard duty

High: Use of hazardous material, administering medication, driving a school bus

### RESPONSIBLITY FACTOR

### Subfactor 9: Supervision of Others Definition:

This subfactor measures the extent to which an employee is required to supervise the

work of others such as students, volunteers, employees (full-time, part-time, casual, etc.)

of the employer, employees of other organizations.

*Degrees and description*

1. Supervisory responsibility is not normally part of the job requirement, but there maybe a requirement to show others how to perform tasks or duties.
2. The job requires the employee to periodically assume some of the normal supervisory responsibilities over others.
3. The job requires the employee, on a continuing basis, to assume some of the normal supervisory responsibilities over others.
4. The job requires the employee to assume, on a continuing basis, the normal supervisory responsibilities over others. May perform some duties similar to those of the employees supervised.
5. The job requires the employee to assume, on a continuing basis, the normal supervisory responsibilities over others. The work is typified as a full-time supervisor.

##### NOTE TO RATERS

1. “Periodically” as used in the second degree means intermittently but with reasonable regularity.
2. To qualify for the third or higher degrees under this subfactor, supervisory responsibility must be a definitely established part of the job requirement and must not be just transient or experimental phenomena.
3. “Normal supervisory responsibilities” must include a portion of each of the following:

a) Planning, organizing, scheduling, co-ordinating of work.

b) Assigning of work and/or personnel.

c) Maintaining quality, accuracy, quantity of work.

d) Giving advice, guidance, instructions, direction.

e) Developing of work methods, procedures or standards.

### RESPONSIBLITY FACTOR

### Subfactor 10: Contacts Definition:

This subfactor measures the nature and purpose of the contact necessary when

communicating with others, be they co-workers, members of the public or clients. These

communications may be in writing, or oral, induding sign language, and carrying varying

degrees of responsibility for the handling of contacts tactfully and harmoniously.

*Degrees and description*

1. Maintain working relationships.
2. Explain, exchange data or information.
3. Deal with or settle requests, complaints or clarification of information.
4. Handle contacts of a difficult or specialized nature, for the discussion and resolution of problems by presenting or obtaining detailed information.
5. Frequent contacts of a difficult, specialized or sensitive nature for such purposes as influencing, persuading or securing the co-operation of others.
6. Considerable communication and human relations skills for such purposes as influencing, persuading, motivating, or negotiating with others, and in dealing with highly sensitive issues.

##### NOTES TO RATERS

1. Contacts of a normal supervisory nature are not considered under this subfactor.
2. It is important to analyze the purpose of the contact in conjunction with the nature of the contact. The level of the person contacted is relevant to the extent that it serves as a check on the nature and purpose of the contact.
3. Working relationships mean contacts with other staff regarding a work activity.
4. Contacts of a difficult or specialized nature are those dealing with a subject area that is complex and typically requires specialized formal training or extensive experience to enable the participants to communicate in a meaningful fashion.
5. Communication skills include such skills as oral presentation skills, writing skills, (reports, correspondence> listening and observation skills.
6. Human relations skills include such skills as empathy, sensitivity, understanding of human and organizational behaviour, motivational techniques and counseling skills.

### WORKING CONDITIONS FACTOR

### Subfactor 11: Disagreeable Working Conditions Definition:

This subfactor measures the type and frequency of disagreeable conditions or hazards

under which an employee is required to carry out the job duties throughout the year.

*Degrees and description*

1. The work is performed in an environment with little or no exposure to disagreeable conditions or hazards.
2. The work is performed in an environment with occasional exposure to minor
	1. *OR*
	2. *little exposure to major disagreeable conditions or hazards.*
3. The work is performed in an environment with regular exposure to minor
	1. *OR*
	2. *occasional exposure to major disagreeable conditions or hazards.*
4. The work is performed in an environment with frequent exposure to minor
	1. *OR*
	2. *regular exposure to major disagreeable conditions or hazards.*
5. The work is performed in an environment with frequent exposure to major disagreeable conditions and hazards.

##### NOTES TO RATERS

1. Raters should consider the many and varied conditions that prevail in the workplace.
2. The types of disagreeable conditions are as follows:

*MINOR*

Conditions:

Minor conditions of dust, dirt, fumes, heat, cold, noxious odours, noise, vibration, poor lighting, inclement weather, poor ventilation, congested workspace, interruptions, lack of privacy, limited travel, radiation from equipment.

Exposure to rudeness or profanity.

Hazards:

Minor health and accident hazards involving more serious cuts, bruises, muscle strain

or some exposure to disease or contamination and the possibility of lost time.

*MAJOR*

Conditions:

Extreme conditions of dust, dirt, fumes, heat, cold, noxious odours, noise, vibration, poor lighting, inclement weather, poor ventilation, congested workspace, lack of privacy, travel 50% of the time, radiation from equipment.

Exposure to verbal and physical abuse, behaviourally difficult clients, residents, patients, members of the public, etc.

Hazards:

Health and accident hazards of a serious nature involving aggressive clients,

dangerous equipment or procedures or work with hazardous materials. Exposure to infectious disease, serious injuries that require medical attention and involves lost time.

1. The frequency of exposure to undesirable working conditions must be related to work carried out on a regular basis throughout the year.
* Little Condition/hazard seldom occurs;
* Occasional Condition/hazard occurs once in a while (i.e. once in a while on a daily basis or several times daily, but not every day);
* Regular Condition/hazard occurs often (i.e. several times daily, not constantly exposed);
* Frequent Condition/hazard occurs almost every day (constantly exposed, almost all of the time).
1. In being fair in establishing general equity, how should the weighting of the factors be adjusted in the Degree table?

###

# EL 2. Ranking jobs on the basis of what you think they should be paid

It is common for people to rank jobs and their pay on the basis of what we think they should be paid. The goal of this exercise is to test your perceptions and compare your results with other people.

**Task:**

Working with a partner, after reviewing the job descriptions, rank each of the jobs – based on your estimate of their value – on the form below.

Rank these jobs in order of importance. The job YOU believe to be most important should be marked with a “1”; the second most important with a “2”; and so on. Note: try not to assign the same ranking to more than one job.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Job Title** | **Rank Order** |
| 1. Library Technician
 |  |
| 1. Director of Improvement Services
 |  |
| 1. Cashier/Office Clerk
 |  |
| 1. Senior Secretary
 |  |
| 1. Director, Regulatory Inspection
 |  |
| 1. Accounts Supervisor
 |  |
| 1. Information Clerk
 |  |
| 1. Unit Secretary
 |  |
| 1. Senior Payroll Clerk
 |  |
| 1. Structural Design Engineer
 |  |

*Questions:*

1. Compare your rankings with those of others.

2. What are the strengths and weaknesses of this method?

3. What difficulty did you have in assigning a ranking to the jobs?

# EL 3. Carrying out a Point Job Evaluation on Benchmark Jobs

A job evaluation committee will pick **benchmark jobs** which will serve to anchor the job evaluation plan and against which other jobs can be compared. In large organizations, a sample of 20-25 jobs is chosen to represent different job types and levels. The jobs below might illustrate a wide selection of benchmark jobs of different levels.

An ideal benchmark job is one that is stable in the organization and is common enough to be found in wage and salary surveys.[[3]](#endnote-3) These benchmark jobs could be jobs that managers would hold across organizations and are key jobs that represent what the organization does.

The benchmark jobs are used for three purposes in developing a compensation plan. (i) Using the benchmark jobs, it is possible to see the wage profile or hierarchy of what one key job is paid in relationship to others in the organization. (ii) These key jobs can be compared to other jobs in other organizations in helping managers establish external equity. (iii) The training in evaluating benchmark jobs can also be valuable to the committee for developing norms and working principles about how to evaluate jobs.

***Overview of Task:*** Working with a partner, you are asked to assume the role of an analysts in a job evaluation committee that is implement a point job evaluation plan.

***Job Evaluation Task***

The following exercise asks you to evaluate 10 jobs using the point job evaluation.

You will be evaluating the same 10 jobs for each of the job evaluation methods. The 10 job descriptions are included at the end of this exercise for you to review.

1. First, review the 10 job descriptions.

2. Then, for apply the point job evaluation method using the tables provided.

## Point Job Evaluation Form

Evaluate these jobs according to the POINT RATING GUIDE provided in the following pages. In the form below, each letter (A to G) corresponds to a factor in the point evaluation guide.

Starting with the first job (library technician), enter the point value you would give to each factor. Proceed by reviewing the 2nd job and so on.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Job Title | A | B | C | C | E | F | G |  | Total |
| 1. Library Technician
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Director of Improvement Services
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Cashier/Office Clerk
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Senior Secretary
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Director, Regulatory Inspection
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Accounts Supervisor
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Information Clerk
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Unit Secretary
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Senior Payroll Clerk
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Structural Design Engineer
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Point rating guide

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Component** | **PointValue** | **Degree** |
| A. Training and | 75 | Grade X plus some experience |
|  Experience | 100 | Grade XII plus some experience |
|  | 125 | Grades X to XII plus two years’ practical experience |
|  | 175 | Grades X to XII plus four years’ practical experience; OR technical diploma plus some experience |
|  | 225 | Grades X to XII plus six years’ practical experience; OR technical diploma plus up to two years’ experience |
|  | 275 | Grades X to XII plus eight years’ practical experience;OR a technical diploma plus up to four years’ experience;OR a university degree plus some experience |
|  | 350 | Grades X to XII plus up to 12 years’ practical experience;OR a technical diploma plus up to seven years’ experience; OR a university degree plus up to four years’ experience |
|  | 475 | Technical diploma plus up to nine years’ practical experience;OR a university degree plus seven years’ experience; OR a post-graduate degree plus four years’ experience |
|  | 575 | A university degree plus nine years’ experience; OR a post-graduate degree plus six years’ experience |
|  | 675 | A university degree plus 12 years’ experience; OR a post-graduate degree plus eight years’ experience; OR a doctoral degree plus six years’ experience |

Point rating guide

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Component** | **PointValue** | **Degree** |
| B. Supervision  Received | 75 | Under very close supervision; little or no judgement exercised, and refers problems to supervisor |
|  | 125 | Under supervision exercises very little judgement |
|  | 175 | Under supervision exercises limited judgement by selecting from among alternative courses of action |
|  | 225 | Under supervision requires the ability to operate with some independence. Supervision received is general and relates to unit policy |
|  | 300 | Under general supervision, or under direction, determines own work methods. Resolves all but most unusual cases |
|  | 375 | Under general direction, determines work methods. Supervision received relates to Branch policy |
|  | 500 | Under limited direction directs the functions of a small Branch |
|  | 600 | Under limited direction directs the functions of a larger or more complex Branch |

Point rating guide

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Component** | **PointValue** | **Degree** |
| C. Supervision | n/a | None |
|  Exercised | 75 | May provide technical direction |
|  | 125 | Supervises one or two employees directly |
|  | 175 | Supervises three or four employees directly |
|  | 250 | Supervises up to a dozen staff |
|  | 350 | Supervises up to twenty staff |
|  | 475 | Supervises in excess of twenty staff |
| D. Job Knowledge/ | 75 | Very limited complexity; simple tasks |
|  Technical | 100 | Requires the ability to follow specific instructions |
|  Complexity | 125 | Requires the ability to follow instructions, and/or exercise a facility with work related equipment and/or procedures |
|  | 225 | Requires the ability to interpret instructions, work unit policy; or select information to be posted |
|  | 275 | Requires a thorough facility with tools, equipment, and/or machinery; or a complete knowledge of a limited area of operations; or a complete knowledge of restricted regulations |
|  | 350 | Requires a knowledge of running a small operational work unit; or an ability to interpret Branch policy to establish or modify procedures across several work units |
|  | 500 | Requires the ability to organize and administer one large or several small operational work unit(s); or an ability to devise new Branch policies |
|  | 650 | Requires a thorough understanding of the operations, policies, and functions of a Branch, with the ability to act as final authority in devising and interpreting policy |

Point rating guide

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Component** | **PointValue** | **Degree** |
| E. Responsibility/ | 75 | Responsibility limited; initiative restricted |
|  Initiative | 100 | Responsible for performing activities or services requiring the exercise of some judgement |
|  | 150 | Responsible for performing activities or services of moderate responsibility, and that require exercise of judgement |
|  | 225 | Requires exercise of substantial amounts of judgement in conducting significantly responsible duties |
|  | 325 | Exercises a very significant amount of independent judgement in performing highly responsible tasks |
| F. Impact of | 75 | Little impact on work unit operators |
|  Decisions | 125 | Work unit operations impacted. Limited by scope of duties. Public may be affected |
|  | 200 | Some impact on development or modification of work unit procedures |
|  | 300 | Moderate impact on industry/client group |
|  | 450 | Substantial impact on industry/client group/Branch policy |
|  | 600 | Decisions have profound impact on some aspect of Provincial policy |

Point rating guide

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Component** | **PointValue** | **Degree** |
| G. Contacts | 125 | Contacts are restricted to the work unit, or to one or two others |
|  | 175 | Contacts may include several offices and the general public in order to explain Branch policies, or to obtain or provide information. Purposes of contacts require liaison with junior staff levels |
|  | 250 | Contacts are fairly broad and frequent, requiring constant interface with the public and/or officials in other Branches or industry. Contacts may include some more senior officials |
|  | 325 | Contacts require liaison with more senior officials on a frequent basis in order to gather or provide policy-related data; or may involve very sensitive issues requiring exercise of more than standard diplomacy and tact |
|  | 425 | Contacts are extensive, with only the most senior staff |

## Job Description 1

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Library Technician |
| Supervision Received: | Under very general supervision of the Branch Director |
| Supervision Exercised: | None; provides technical direction to the Desk Clerk |

### Duties

Co-ordinates administration of the audio-visual collection including cataloguing, classifying, and preparing purchase requisitions; assisting line staff by advising them of film contents and of related films. Provides research services and recommends reference materials. Co-ordinates subscriptions to over 300 different journals; resolves subscription problems; and places all orders. Interprets Library policy to Ministry personnel, other Ministries, and outside organizations.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus a minimum of four years’ practical experience in performing complex library functions; OR; Grade XII plus two years’ formal library technology training and some experience cataloguing/filing.

Job Description 2

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Director of Improvement Services |
| Supervision Received: | Under limited direction of an Executive Director |
| Supervision Exercised: | Supervises directly one professional engineer, and three senior technical supervisors; provides technical direction to six regional professional engineers |

### Duties

Position is accountable for developing, directing, co-ordinating, and administering various operations of the Maintenance Services Branch including maintenance management, centre-line marking, roadside development, landscape, and snow avalanche control. The position reviews costs and recommends expenditures; monitors performance budget; approves contract expenditures; develops standards and policies; and maintains communication with Regional Highways Engineer and Regional Maintenance Operations Engineers.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus a Bachelor’s degree in bridge and road construction and maintenance engineering; registration as a member of the Association of Professional Engineers of B.C.; plus a minimum seven years’ experience as an engineer responsible for road/bridge construction and maintenance, at least three years of which should have been spent supervising major projects. Requires additional knowledge of equipment capabilities and administration of technical office organization.

Job Description 3

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Cashier/Office Clerk |
| Supervision Received: | Under immediate supervision of the Office Manager |
| Supervision Exercised: | None |

### Duties

Completes application forms, receives payment, and completes revenue forms; periodically performs visual tests, licence exams, and licence form and photograph completion. Processes debt payments and information to central unit, answers routine inquiries, and may calculate licence fees and premiums.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus some general office experience. Requires basic arithmetic and typewriter skills, and the ability to use office equipment.

## Job Description 4

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Senior Secretary |
| Supervision Received: | Under supervision of the Branch Director |
| Supervision Exercised: | Supervises two junior typists |

### Duties

Transcribes and types technical reports, circulars, revised policies and procedures, and routine correspondence and memoranda approximately 35% of time. Supervises junior typists by allocating and reviewing workload and performance to ensure quality and timeliness; orients new staff and performs employee appraisals; supervises technical files and library maintenance; and participates in selection panels.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus a minimum of three years’ related practical experience. Requires the ability to type 50 words per minute, and to co-ordinate and supervise two junior typists.

##

## Job Description 5

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Director, Regulatory Inspection |
| Supervision Received: | Under limited direction of the Assistant Deputy Minister, Transport Policy |
| Supervision Exercised: | Supervises directly an Assistant Chief Inspecting Engineer plus a staff of 24 gas and oil pipeline, railway, and aerial tramway inspectors |

### Duties

Manages a Branch responsible for regulating industrial and recreational railways and pipelines operated by 150 companies; and for 250 aerial tramway installations. The Director acts as senior regulatory officer, sets Branch objectives, and manages finances. Policies are developed through consultation with industry officials and government agencies.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus a Bachelor’s degree in mechanical engineering, and a minimum seven years’ experience inspecting gas and oil pipelines, railway cars and track, and aerial tramway lines and equipment; with four years’ progressively more responsible supervisory experience.

## Job Description 6

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Accounts Supervisor |
| Supervision Received: | Under general supervision of the Financial Operations Manager |
| Supervision Exercised: | Directly supervises two more-junior supervisors, each responsible for supervising five employees |

### Duties

Organizes, directs, and controls the processing of Ministry accounts by: ensuring efficient and accurate accounts processing; answering general and policy enquiries; resolving difficult accounts problems; identifying potential effects of policy change proposals and participating in policy reviews; assisting more-junior supervisors to select and supervise staff; providing policy/procedural direction; and reviewing disciplinary matters.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus some formal accounting training, and approximately five to six years’ related experience, of which at least two years should have been at a supervisory level.

## Job Description 7

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Information Clerk |
| Supervision Received: | Under supervision of the Group Leader, Information Centre, and technical direction of the Lead Information Clerk |
| Supervision Exercised: | None |

### Duties

Answering a large volume of routine telephone and counter inquiries relating to driving records and driver status and to provide information to the Courts, Police, I.C.B.C., Motor Licence Offices, etc.; receiving and accounting for monies received; examining incoming mail and determining appropriate courses of action necessary to resolve inquiry/documentation function; providing Reviewing Offices and Adjudicators with supporting and/or non-routine information; and accepting surrendered driver’s licences.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus two years’ general office experience, of which at least one year must have been spent in performing work related to driver records. Position requires ability to enter, edit, re-call data via computer terminal, telex, typewriter, and word processing equipment for 65% of time.

Job Description 8

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Unit Secretary |
| Supervision Received: | Under supervision of the Unit Manager |
| Supervision Exercised: | None |

### Duties

Spends approximately 55% of time taking, transcribing, and typing dictation; opens and distributes mail; composes and types routine correspondence; obtains travel warrants. Spends approximately 40% of time receiving cheques, issuing receipts, and preparing deposits for revenue; coding documents and invoices; typing purchase orders; and maintaining a small petty cash fund. May search files, deliver parcels, etc.

### Qualifications

Grade X plus ability to type 40 words per minute, take dictation, and process forms. Requires a minimum one year’s general office experience.

## Job Description 9

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Senior Payroll Clerk |
| Supervision Received: | Under general supervision of the Payroll Supervisor |
| Supervision Exercised: | None; provides more-junior clerks with technical direction |

### Duties

Processes payroll by completing pay forms; calculating deductions; preparing pay action forms for retroactive pay, overtime, and substitution pay; explaining procedures and regulations concerning payroll matters; ensuring employee pay files are kept up to date; compiling monthly statistics; closing files; recovering overpayments; and maintaining contact with Central Pay, Superannuation Branch, Personnel, Line Managers, etc.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus three years’ practical training in accounting and payroll.

## Job Description 10

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Job Title: | Structural Design Engineer |
| Supervision Received: | Under direction of the Supervising Bridge Engineer |
| Supervision Exercised: | None |

### Duties

Responsible for designing plans for bridges, culverts, retaining walls, and related structures; assisting principal design engineers on larger projects; and conducting design investigations of hoists and cranes.

### Qualifications

Grade XII plus a Bachelor’s degree in structural engineering, and a minimum three years’ related experience; registration in the Association of Professional Engineers of B.C.

### Name:

## Job Evaluation Rating Form

Point System Method

Evaluate these jobs according to the POINT RATING GUIDE provided in the following pages. Enter each factor point score under the corresponding letter space for each job below. Use box H for the total score of each job.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Job Title** | **A** | **B** | **C** | **D** | **E** | **F** | **G** | **HTotal** | **Rank** |
| 1. Library Technician
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Director of Improvement Services
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Cashier/Office Clerk
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Senior Secretary
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Director, Regulatory Inspection
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Accounts Supervisor
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Information Clerk
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Unit Secretary
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Senior Payroll Clerk
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Structural Design Engineer
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

*Questions:*

1. Compare your total scores for each job.

2. Do your scores differ from how you would have ranked them without using the point plan?

3. What difficulty did you have in assigning a rating to the jobs?

# EL 4. Case: Determining the External Equity of Jobs

Through part of the job evaluation process, we focus internally on creating an understanding of the equitable relationship or worth of the various jobs in an organization. The goal is to achieve an internal equity. The downside of relying too much on this is that while we might have constructed an equalitarian rating, we might be way out of touch with the market.

The procedure for determining external equity is similar to the one for defining internal equity, except that we survey the external market on what other organizations are paying. We collect information externally – through surveys, interviews, and professional wage summaries – on our key benchmark jobs to identify pay, benefits, pensions, and performance pay. While understanding the “going” wage for key benchmark jobs, one important purpose of the market survey is to understand market changes and trends, as for example new pay packages or incentives that other employers are using.[[4]](#endnote-4)

Using Informal Surveys. Many managers rely on their network of fellow managers and associates in carrying out informal telephone interviews to gain information on salary. These informal interviews or discussions are gain reliable information because they are carried out among people who generally trust and respect each other’s roles and the confidentiality of the information they share, even though there might be fierce competition between them.

*Using a Variety of Consulting Firms and Website Sources*. Even though several companies view salary information as confidential, consulting organizations, like the Haygroup and Watson Wyatt, have the inside track as they have a large database of clients who they have worked for. They also provide free reports for HR professionals. It is also possible to access some of these data sources from professional associations like the Conference Board, Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM), the American Management Association (AMA), and a general internet search for sources.[[5]](#endnote-5) Labour agreements are also a good source.

One of the advantages of such surveys is that the information can be gathered quickly and easily, particularly information from government sources. The disadvantages are that is not possible to know if they aggregated data is relevant for the context that the organization experiences. The jobs reported, might reflect the average pay rate rather than one for a specific region. Other disadvantages are that the data might be out-of-date and might not provide information on aspects of pay (incentives, benefits) which might explain why pay rates are higher or lower on average.

*Picking a Representative Sample of Organizations to Contact*. Sampling is one of most important choices to make in conducting a survey, carrying out informal surveys or trying to compare with other organizations summarized in generally professional surveys. The sample is shaped by the purpose of making sure that the organization has a competitive pay rate and benefit package so that employees do not feel a sense of equity. This assures that the employer is competitive in attracting and retaining employees.

**Case:**

A report from the B.C. government comptroller general in 2008 said that B.C. Ferry executives are paid too much and it’s too easy for them to earn bonuses. The CEO was paid over $1 million, which included $494,923 base salary, plus pension contributions and performance-based incentives. The other four top executives were being paid between $485,000 and 562,000 each, including base salary and benefits.

According to the comptroller general report, the process of setting executive compensation was “flawed” because they benchmarked themselves against private, high profile companies that are likely to be paying top dollars. Among the companies they surveyed to set salaries were Coca-Cola Bottling Company, Ford Motor Company of Canada, Nike Canada, and McDonald’s Restaurants of Canada.[[6]](#endnote-6)

The comptroller general report also suggested that “our concerns regarding BC (Ferries) compensation are compounded by the fact the BC Ferries board approves the executive compensation without accountability to the independent (BC Ferries) Authority.”[[7]](#endnote-7) The report indicated that this was a conflict of interest as the board approved the compensation plans for themselves and for their executives. The board chairman has a salary of $154,000, and directors earned between $67,000 and $91,000, retainers that were three to five times higher than those permitted at other B.C. Crown corporations.

*Questions:*

1. Many organizations carry out salary surveys with top companies or organizations in other fields. Do you agree the actions of the CEO of this public corporation? Why and Why not?
2. The CEO’s salary is more than double that paid at large public sector bodies such as BC Hydro, B.C. Lottery Corp. and WorkSafe B. C. But, the CEO argues that this organization is at a different level. Do you agree? If you don’t agree, an obvious solution is for the government to claw some of the money back, as everyone else in the public sector is taking a hit.[[8]](#endnote-8) What are other solutions?
3. Is it unreasonable to compare public sector compensation with the private sector? Do public sector corporations compete with the private sector the attract top quality executives

# References

1. ## CUPE has many examples of evaluation plan and encourages their use by management and unions. This plan was adapted from CUPE 1334 at the University of Guelph, Canada, a plan in CUPE plan in Nova Scotia and my experience with the CUPE plan. See examples as <https://www.uoguelph.ca/hr/managers-job-design-job-evaluation/job-evaluation-forms> . See the CUPE Nova Scotia plan at <https://humanrights.novascotia.ca/sites/default/files/CUPE%20GenderNeutral%20JobEval.pdf> . Accessed on August 21, 2017

 [↑](#endnote-ref-1)
2. Adapted from: Pfeiffer, J.W., & Jones, J.E. (1971). A handbook of structured experiences for human relations training, Iowa Cit, University Associates, Prisoner’s Dilemma, 60-63. [↑](#endnote-ref-2)
3. Kilgour, J.G. (2008) Job evaluation revisited: The point factor method. *Compensation and Benefits Review,* July/Aug.: 37-46. [↑](#endnote-ref-3)
4. Kilgour, J.G. (2008). Job evaluation revisited: The point factor method. Compensation and Benefits Review. 40, 37-46. [↑](#endnote-ref-4)
5. See examples of internet sources such as those referenced in: Tobin, N. (2002). Can technology ease the pain of salary surveys. Public Personnnel Management, 31,65-77. [↑](#endnote-ref-5)
6. Kines, Lindsay, (2009). Ferry executives paid too much: comptroller general. Times Colonist, November 7, 2009. P. 1 [↑](#endnote-ref-6)
7. Major BC Ferries and Translink reforms needed: report. cbcnews. Accessed from [http://www.cbc.ca/canada/british-columbia/story/2009/11/06/bc-translink-ferries-comptroller-general-report.html on November 8. 2009](http://www.cbc.ca/canada/british-columbia/story/2009/11/06/bc-translink-ferries-comptroller-general-report.html%20on%20November%208.%202009). f [↑](#endnote-ref-7)
8. Leyne, L. (2009). Soaring Ferries’ pay lands on Liberals. Comment in Times Colonist, p. A14. November 7, 2009. [↑](#endnote-ref-8)