CHAPTER 6

Recruiting a Diverse Workforce

**Contents**

EL 1: Case: Recruiting more women in policing: *Added Notes on Case in Text* 1

EL 2. What is the purpose of workplace diversity? 4

EL 2. Writing a briefing note reviewing different outsourcing options 6

EL 3. Assessing different recruiting options in selecting an HR management specialist 8

EL 4. Assessing different recruiting options in getting recruited 9

Guide for writing a briefing note report 9

EL 5. Another Side of the Story 12

#

# EL 1: Case: Recruiting more women in policing: *Added Notes on Case in Text*

Commissioner Green looked at the Fitzgerald Inquiry report in front of him and said, “They say there’s a lack of progression on recruiting women in policing…. And, they want to know what we can do about.”

Four men and one woman sat across from Commissioner Green, all seasoned veterans in the Queensland Police Force. They were gathered together to prepare a report updating progress and identifying goals and initiatives for removing barriers and improving the recruitment and promotion of women in policing.

Phil Dyer, pointing to a passage from the report, said “Back then, …guys in the Licensing Branch…they toured Brisbane’s brothels, nightclubs, gambling and gaming establishments… and charged only those who weren’t paying protection or whose competition was not welcome…” The Fitzgerald Inquiry in Australia, over 20 years ago, found a web of corruption and abuse of power perpetuated by a male culture of policing where physical strength and authority ruled.[[1]](#endnote-1) The report pointed to culture of policing illustrated by an unwritten police code of silence that ensured that criminal activities were unquestioned and immune from scrutiny. Using the code, police took advantage of opportunities to steal seized or forfeited property, use informants to dispose illegally acquired property, and accept money, property and sexual favours in exchange for information and warnings that police can provide.

The Fitzgerald Inquiry called for major changes in Queensland’s system of government and criminal justice, including recommendations for removing barriers and improving the recruitment and promotion of women. These recommendations were similar to others in the U.K. and the U.S. which indicated that women were less likely to engage in corruption. With women, they proposed, it was more likely that policing would begin to reflect a crime prevention rather than a confrontation and control emphasis.

The Fitzgerald report (‘8.4.3. Recruitment of Women’) pointed to the low proportion of women and called for eliminating discriminatory barriers in recruiting. But, despite, firm commitment to equity programs, gender parity has not been achieved in policing in Queensland. Women represent 30% of the police constables, 15% are non-commissioned officers and 6% of the commissioned officers. The gaps are even more evident in management.[[2]](#endnote-2)

The realization of gender parity has eluded many public and private organizations, let alone policing and the challenges are most recognized in management. It is possible that women are less interested in careers in policing and similar organizations where there has been a legacy of discrimination. Or, there might not be the commitment in policing and in government generally, to the advantages extolled of employing women, such as those relating to better services for victims, less reliance on force, less complaints, and better relations with the community. It has also been observed that the current generation of women is less interested in a career in one organization, let alone a police organization. As a result, any gains made in recruitment are lost because of separations for careers which are more flexible where one can work from home and play a central role as a homemaker and primary caregiver for children.

For others, the lack of progress results from an unsophisticated approach to gender equity where recruitment programs are adjusted to meet hard targets of equality vs. equity. While it is possible to use “off the shelf” equity strategies, they might give more attention to what works best in practice and the only way to do this is effective programs.

**Task 1:** Your initial task might be to define realistic goals for an equity program in policing in Queensland. Should the equity goals seek to establish an organizational profile that illustrates equal representation for men and women? You might first establish the goals and define the difference between employment equity and equality. What equity groups should be recognized and how do you balance the needs of equity and equality?

**Task 2:** A second task asks you to use the strategy map and table below and define strategic objectives, initiatives and measures to focus on the strategic theme: Improving diversity and inclusiveness of women in policing.

 

|  |
| --- |
| **Strategic Theme: Encouraging internal recruiting in public service organizations** |
| Objective | Initiatives | Markers or Measures | Time period |
| Customer or client perspective |
| Objective 1 | 1.2. |  |  |
| Objective 2 | 1.2. |  |  |
| Objective 3 | 1.2. |  |  |
| Financial  |
| Objective 4 | 1.2. |  |  |
| Objective 5 | 1.2. |  |  |
| Internal process |
| Objective 6 | 1.2 |  |  |
| Objective 7 | 1.2. |  |  |
| Learning and Growth |
| Objective 8 | 1.2. |  |  |
| Objective 9 | 1.2. |  |  |

Table 6.2 Strategic Theme Worksheet

# EL 2. What is the purpose of workplace diversity?

 Practitioners and scholars offer different perspectives on the purpose of workplace diversity programs. For example, Thomas and Ely[[3]](#endnote-3) suggest that one conventional set of assumptions in improving diversity has been to comply with legal requirements in implementing diversity goals (a discrimination and fairness paradigm). Another perspective in implementing diversity is to be representative of society so that we have better access and legitimacy with key constituents (an access and legitimacy paradigm). The learning and effectiveness paradigm for diversity requires defining values of diversity based on learning, active participation of all members (and not just representation), carefully designing jobs to more fully utilize the diversity of talents, encouraging debate and constructive conflict, making people feel valued, reflecting the culture in the vision and mission statements, and encouraging an egalitarian structure which is welcoming of the exchange of ideas and values.[[4]](#endnote-4) Selden and Selden’s fourth paradigm of creating a multi-cultural organization by valuing and integrating, emphasizes processes of acculturation where non-dominant cultures can exist within a dominant culture.[[5]](#endnote-5)

 What is the purpose of a workplace diversity program? Some people would answer this by saying that the key purpose is to end discrimination because it is morally and legally wrong. The assumptions in improving diversity would be to comply with legal requirements in implementing diversity goals (discrimination and fairness paradigm) or implement diversity to be representative of society so that we have better access and legitimacy with key constituents (access and legitimacy paradigm).

What if we changed the assumptions of our plan and used the ‘learning and effectiveness’ paradigm;focusing on integration rather than assimilation as a theme? Workplace diversity is more than recognizing our differences, but using our differences to add value to what we do. In using this paradigm, we might begin by using the questions in the table 6.1 as a basis for developing a shared understanding of what people mean by diversity. Developing a new paradigm for diversity requires defining values of diversity based on learning, active participation of all members (and not just representation), carefully designing jobs to more fully utilize the diversity of talents, encouraging debate and constructive conflict, making people feel valued, articulating the culture in the vision and mission statements, and encouraging an egalitarian structure which is welcoming of the exchange of ideas.[[6]](#endnote-6)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1. Leadership understanding of diversity and what it means. | How would the leadership define diversity within: (i) the discrimination and fairness paradigm? (ii) the access and legitimacy paradigm? How would we define diversity within the learning and effectiveness paradigm and its key ‘values’? What are important values for each designated group and for all employees?  |
| 2. Leadership recognizes the challenges & outcomes. | How does the leadership see the advantages and disadvantages of the learning and effectiveness paradigm? What are the challenges in implementing the values of this paradigm? What are ways to overcome these challenges? What are the long-term outcomes? |
| 3. Culture values high performance standards. | Given our values for learning and effectiveness, what are the performance standards for everyone? How can the learning and effectiveness metaphor be used in building performance norms? |
| 4. Culture values personal development. | To what extent do the values of the present culture stimulate personal development? How can the values of the learning and effectiveness paradigm be used in recognizing personal development? |
| 5. Culture emphasizes openness. | To what extent do the values of the present culture emphasize openness of expression? How can the learning and effectiveness metaphor be used in recognizing personal openness in each diverse group? |
| 6. Culture makes all people feel valued. | To what extent do the values of the present culture make people feel valued? How can the values of the learning and effectiveness metaphor be used in showing how people are valued? |
| 7. Culture has well articulated and understood mission. | To what extent are the values of the present culture articulated and understood to emphasize diversity of perspectives in problem solving. How can the learning and effectiveness metaphor be used in defining our mission and vision for learning and effectiveness? |
| 8. Organization has a relatively egalitarian, non-bureaucratic culture.  | To what extent do the values of the present culture encourage an egalitarian, non-bureaucratic involvement? How can the learning and effectiveness metaphor be used in developing a more egalitarian organization? |

# EL 2. Writing a briefing note reviewing different outsourcing options

Human resource management and the human resource management function have traditionally been an integral part of the organization they serve. Chapter 1 (pages 5-9) provides a snapshot of the history leading to a more strategic emphasis in HRM. In reducing costs, HR ‘has been called upon to play a primary role in shifting the operation of government by implementing changes involving decentralization, outsourcing, decreasing the number of people with special employment status, developing flexible career paths, changing the collective agreements, and implementing equity procedures’. New delivery models of human resource management such as the account management model and the shared services model are being used in different organizations.

**Task**

Identify 3-4 models, one of which is the traditional in-house model for delivering HR. A second model might define a range of core strategic services to be maintained and those which are less core as those to be outsourced. A third model might include sharing services in certain areas. Another model might identify peripheral services which might be outsourced.

In this assignment, you should identify 4-5 key concepts or criteria to guide your identification and assessment of the different models. Examples of concepts/criteria could include: cost improvement, impact on culture, and so forth.

You should also identify the advantages and disadvantages of outsourcing and explain under what conditions you think outsourcing would be beneficial to public sector organizations. It is often helpful to use to table to help the reader grasp your assessment. As a note, a table is simply an illustration and you should guide the reader through it and point out its main features in your paragraphs.

To make this relevant, we would like you to address this issue in reference to a specific context such as public sector or not-for-profit organizations. You might wish to review the relevance of the outsourcing model for the Cool Aid Society case which is included in the initial chapters of the text. However, you might wish to situate your work in another organization you are familiar with. Or, you might wish to review and provide recommendations for public sector organizations generally.

The paper should be written in a briefing note (report) format where you review and assess various options. In this report, we are asking that you make extensive use of the relevant literature on outsourcing, shared services, and related services. This means that you need to structure the paper and provide an introduction that defines the issue, purpose and background. We ask you to identify a conceptual framework or set of criteria for assessing the various options in making your decision. You should then describe each option before assessing the relevance of each option based on your framework (criteria). In your conclusion, you should discuss why a certain option might be more important than others and how the chosen option might be implemented. Please ensure that you include a bibliography containing all your sources as well as footnotes (or endnotes) for any direct quotes in your paper. We want you to use good literature sources or higher quality journals and articles. You may use APA style or any other reference style as long as you use it consistently throughout your paper.

# EL 3. Assessing different recruiting options in selecting an HR management specialist

In guiding HR managers, you are asked to assess the usefulness of 3-4 different recruitment strategies for accessing a pool of talented people who represent different designated groups (women, minorities, and others). Working in groups, following the structure which asks you to identify the issue and purpose, define key criteria, assess the options, and make a recommendation. You should present your analysis in a table which reviews how each option responds to the criteria identified. The general structure includes:

**Introduction**

*Issue (also called Topic, Purpose)*

*Background*

*Current Status*

**Discussion**

*Key Considerations:* A summary of considerations or criteria to guide the decision. Criteria might include: reliability of the tool, validity in getting good applicants, cost of development, cost of administration, fit (does the tool fit the type of people being sought), diversity balance (Is the approach useful to get people to illustrate diversity, such as attracting women, visible minorities or others) and pick up (will people respond to the recruiting approach).

 *Options:* You should define and then review 3-4 options which potentially have value. You should assess these options against the criteria and use a table to illustrate this.

**Conclusion and/or Recommendations**

This will include a short summary of your key findings before stating your recommendations.

# EL 4. Assessing different recruiting options in getting recruited

In guiding students, you are asked to assess the usefulness of 3-4 different recruitment strategies you would recommend students focus on in getting recruited for key positions. Working in groups, following the briefing note structure which asks you to identify the issue and purpose, define key criteria, assess the options, and make a recommendation. You should present your analysis in a table which reviews how each option responds to the criteria identified.

# Guide for writing a briefing note report

A briefing note is a short paper that quickly and effectively informs a decision-maker about the advantages and disadvantages of different options in resolving a problem or issue. A briefing note distils complex information for decision-makers. Briefing notes usually deal with issues but are also prepared for any topic someone needs to be informed about such as assessing the value of different recruitment or selection approaches or a review of diversity models that decision-makers might implement.

 A well-prepared briefing note quickly and efficiently defines the issue and reviews the options before making a recommendation. In writing a briefing note, be clear about why you’re writing the briefing note (your purpose), who you’re writing the briefing note for (your reader) and how you will structure your information.

 Briefing notes often follow a standard format, but THERE ARE MANY VARIATIONS on that format. The following structure is a guide:

* Introduction (usually stated as the issue, need for the study, purpose)
* Discussion – key considerations or criteria and analysis of options
* Conclusion and Recommendations (a conclusion and recommendation or other advice, or both)

**Introduction**

 The introduction might include distinct paragraphs describing the issue, background, current status (need) and purpose.

 ***Issue.*** A concise statement of the issue or problem sets out the area to be discussed.

 ***Background***. The background provides a bit of history (how a situation arose, previous decisions/problems, actions leading up to the current situation). Typically, this section gives a brief summary of the history of the topic and other background information. What led up to this problem or issue? How has it evolved? Do not repeat information that you’re including in the Current Status section.

 ***Current Status (Need)***. Describes only the current situation, who is involved, what is happening now, the current state of the matter, issue, situation, etc. and ‘why’ we ‘need’ to focus on resolving the issue.

 *Purpose.* This describes the clear purpose of the briefing note.

**Discussion**

**This section includes a review of the key considerations and the assessment of the options.**You need to define a number of factors (criteria) or apply a framework for improving something. An important part of this section is to be conceptual and logical. In being conceptual, your criteria should be more than a listing of factors. They should be logical in relationship to your problem. For example, in buying a car, you can define a list of factors or criteria which are important. However, in being conceptual, your factors or criteria should make logical sense in relationship to each other, for your purpose. You might include a table to summarize the advantages of each option againstthe criteria.

 ***Key Considerations/Criteria***. In assessing different options, it is useful to define the key criteria that should be considered in resolving the problem. These should be defined and logically defended.

 ***Assessment of options***. This is where we should review the strengths and weaknesses of different options. You should define each option and then review its strengths and weaknesses against the different criteria. You could illustrate your analysis in a table which reviews how each option responds to the criteria identified. For example, table 1 provides a reader with an overview of each option. However, the writer should guide the reader through the table and illustrate its key features. That is, the writer should include paragraphs to describe the contents of the table.

Table 1 – Assessment of 3 Models

|  | **Models** |
| --- | --- |
| **Criteria** | **Shared services** | **Peripheral Outsourcing** | **Core Outsourcing** |
| **Type of transaction outsourced** | Both transactional and transformational can be outsourced | Transactional (high-volume, routine)  | Transformational (strategic).  |
| **Cost Efficient** | Yes – number of service employees can be reduced and efficiency gained (Su et al, 2009, p. 383) | Yes, in a non-dynamic environment (Gilley & Rasheed, 2000) |  |
| **Effective** |   |  |  |
| **Value-add** |  |  |  |
| **Risk** |   |  |  |
| **Outsourcing Intensity** |  |  |  |

You should present all the details required for the reader to be informed or to make an informed decision. Keep the reader’s needs uppermost in your mind when selecting and presenting the facts. Remember to substantiate any statements with evidence and to double check your facts. Additional details may be attached as appendices.

**Conclusion and/or Recommendations**
The conclusion summarizes what you want your reader to infer from the briefing note. Many readers jump immediately to this section, so be sure it covers the points you most want your reader to be clear about. Do not introduce anything new in the Conclusion. If you are including a recommendations section, it should offer the best and most sound advice you can offer. Make sure the recommendation is clear, direct and substantiated by the facts you have put forward.

**Task:**

Review the briefing note guide and what you would put in each section in reviewing (i) different outsourcing options and (ii) external vs. internal recruiting options.

# EL 5. Another Side of the Story

“I am a male nurse and, while I am a strong supporter of equity programs, there is another side of the story.”

Jeremy Trotac works in the Intensive Care Unit (ICU) of a Neonatal Nursing unit in one of Sydney’s largest hospitals. Neonatal nursing is a subspecialty in nursing care for newborn infants where nurses deal with a variety of problems such as prematurity, birth defects, infection, traumatic births, and other problems. While the neonatal nursing is defined as the first month of life, some newborns are sick for months. The work requires special skills and training. Sydney Central’s nursing unit has approximately 120 nurses and 5 of these are male. The Director of Nursing is a male as is one of two Neonatal Unit managers. Jeremy has been in nursing for 8 years, 4 of which were in the Neonatal unit and is a valued employee.

Jeremy quit his job because he was unable to schedule an annual leave. Other older female employees have experienced the same difficulties of being unable to schedule a three week leave because the hospital cannot guarantee their time off. Some employees have accrued three months of leave. Managers are reluctant to grant long term leave because they need employees to cover for those requiring maternity leave and flexible schedules for meeting family needs.

“I think some people are abusing the system as they know a maternity leave and work schedule flexibility for child care is a policy,” according to Jeremy. After returning from maternity leave, many people fail to give up their position and ask for schedules that make it difficult to recruit other people or which restrict the leaves of others. “They tell the managers that they only want to work on Monday and Friday mornings and the managers have to find people to fill in at other times.”

“So, I quit. In my four years of working in the Unit, I was twice denied a leave of over a week long. I also had two leaves cancelled. I wanted to go on an extended vacation of 5 months and I couldn’t get a leave. So, I quit.”

I don’t blame my managers, as I would do the same thing. You cannot predict when people are going to say they want maternity leave. In the most recent cases where we hired 8 new nurses, four of them said they were pregnant only months after they signed on.” I don’t say we should not hire a person because they a pregnant. But, not knowing creates a lot of problems for my planning and that of others.

Task: How do you plan for maternity leave and work flexibility? Should the Nursing Unit seek to recruit people (males and older females) to provide wider representation of different groups of workers? Why or why not?[[7]](#endnote-7)

1. Fitzgerald, G.E., (1989) Report of a commission of inquiring pursuant to orders in council. Brisbane: Government Printer. [↑](#endnote-ref-1)
2. Prenzler, T., & Drew, J. (2013) Women police in post-Fitzgerald Queensland: A 20 year review. *Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 72: 459-472. [↑](#endnote-ref-2)
3. Thomas, D.A., & Ely, R.J. (1996) Making differences matter: A new paradigm for managing diversity. *Harvard Business Review,* September/ October: 79-90. [↑](#endnote-ref-3)
4. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-4)
5. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-5)
6. Ibid., The questions in the table are meant to assist people ask questions in meeting the needs of the 8 preconditions identified by Thomas and Ely (1996). [↑](#endnote-ref-6)
7. There is a happy ending in this story. Jeremy did quit and toured the world for 6 months. He was offered his job back on his return [↑](#endnote-ref-7)