Captain or Crew? (Aeolus and the Bag of Winds)

Having your cake and eating it!



Imagine that there is a cake and that it is to be shared among your classmates. How do you think it should be divided up?







Many of you may think that it should be divided up equally, but are there any circumstances where it would be right to divide it up unequally?

Possible suggestions of why the cake should not be divided equally.

- *Deserving* some may think it fair that those deserving of the cake may be entitled to more than those undeserving.
- Need some may think that those in need of the cake should receive more.

- *Preference* some may think that those who don't like cake should give their portion to someone who does or who needs it.
- *The best* Some may suggest that it should go to the highest achieving members of the class.
- *Talent* Others may suggest that it should go to the most talented. Perhaps some kind of audition should be held.
- *The strongest* some may think that the strongest should get the most simply by the use of force.

Here are some more scenarios to consider:

What if it is someone's birthday - is it fair for the birthday person to get more cake?

Imagine there are two equally numbered football teams playing against each other. One of the teams has a team member sent off for an illegal tackle. Is it fair that the teams are now unequally matched?

Wealth distribution

One of the big questions in politics is 'how should the wealth in society by divided up?' This question is not so different from the cake scenario you have just been discussing. Some people think that wealth should be divided equally among the people in a society. However, others think that those in need should get more. What about those with talents? Should they be allowed to benefit from those talents - should a really good footballer, for instance, be able to get more than their fair share if people are willing to give them a little bit each to see them play?

Here's a thought experiment to try:



Imagine that tomorrow we all wake up with exactly the same amount of wealth. Nobody has any more wealth than anybody else. Would that be right?

Do you think it would stay like that for long? What would happen, do you think?