



Community Advisory Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes

Monday, May 16, 2022

6:00pm

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/84794506189>

Or join by phone:

Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):

US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 929 205 6099 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 312 626 6799 or 877 853 5257 (Toll Free)

Webinar ID: 847 9450 6189

Meetings are accessible to people with disabilities. Individuals who need special assistance or a disability-related modification or accommodation to participate in this meeting, or who have a disability and wish to request an alternative format for the meeting materials, should contact the Clerk of the Board at least 2 working days before the meeting at (510) 906-0491 or cob@ebce.org.

If you have anything that you wish to be distributed to the Committee, please email it to the clerk by 5:00 pm the day prior to the meeting.

C1. Welcome & Roll Call

Present: Members: Hernandez, Lakshman, Landry, Liu, Lutz, Souza, Sutter, Swaminathan, Vice-Chair Muetzenberg, and Chair Eldred

Excused: Members: Franch, Talreja, Pacheco.

Member Swaminathan joined the meeting at 6:15pm.

Member Souza served as an alternate for Member Pacheco (Central).

C2. Public Comment

This item is reserved for persons wishing to address the Committee on any EBCE-related matters that are not otherwise on this meeting agenda. Public comments on matters listed on the agenda shall be heard at the time the matter is called. As with all public comment, members of the public who wish

to address the Committee are customarily limited to three minutes per speaker and must complete an electronic [speaker slip](#). The Committee Chair may increase or decrease the time allotted to each speaker.

Member Swaminathan joined the meeting at 6:15pm.

Tom Kelly stated that rates that were set at EBCE's formation were based on a relationship with PG&E's generation rates, but EBCE's current generation rate for Bright Choice is 3.5% higher than PG&E, because PG&E is now enabled to charge a PCIA charge to its bundled customers, and that charge is higher than the one charged to EBCE customers, who are being overcharged for EBCE's electricity, which is dirtier by 3.5 times PG&E's current generation. Tom Kelly urged CAC to request an analysis of EBCE's generation rates to explain why this is happening.

Blair Beekman spoke about the importance of renewables and local procurement of renewables, and fears nuclear as a high price for clean energy, saying tough choices have to be made in order to say no to nuclear. Blair Beekman noted that IPR reports in 2020 stated that 2023 would be a year of plateaued solar power use, and although EBCE made adjustments at the time that were helpful, it must work toward a goal of making renewables first, not fossil fuels.

C3. Approval of Minutes from April 18, 2022

Member Landry motioned to approve the minutes. Member Sutter seconded the motion, which passed 9/0. Excused: Members: Franch, Talreja, Pacheco. Abstain: Member Souza.

C4. CAC Chair Report

- Chair Eldred reported the renewables procurement item passed at the last meeting and the Board took CAC's recommendation regarding the legislative update, including switching the support position to one of watch for a bill that will be included in this meeting's legislative update.
- Chair Eldred reported that EBCE's budget includes a suggested three-year commitment to the Community Innovation Grants and requested the CAC look at how it selects and administers those grants, and to look at ongoing support.
- Chair Eldred urged members wishing to be more involved in CAC to be prepared at the next meeting to discuss areas of interest.

- Vice Chair Muetzenberg will lead the next CAC meeting, as Chair Eldred will be absent.
- Chair Eldred stated that there would be items on the Board's agenda that CAC would not discuss at this meeting or take a position on, but if Members wish to comment on any of those items they should attend the Board meeting and make comments as an individual. If Members wish to comment to the Board on items that the CAC has taken a position on, they should first contact Chair Eldred, Vice Chair Muetzenberg, and the Clerk beforehand.
- Chair Eldred read absent Member Franch's comments on the meeting's agenda items and said Member Franch's comments on possible items for future agendas would be shared at the end of the meeting.

There were no speakers for public comment.

C5. Legislative Update (CAC Action Item) (20 Minutes)

Update on recommended bill positions and EBCE's bill tracker

Blair Beekman liked the way EBCE used the future of EBCE billing through tax incentive and tax purposes and how that is going in depth into a community and how a community works and functions. Blair Beekman hoped that EBCE would keep in mind they have to think about the future of real community involvement in this process and building on it and that they have to build a community purpose with this energy.

The Committee Discussed:

- Pursuing an amendment to AB 2765 so language protecting energy efficiency is in the bill.
- Size of funding for AB 2765.
- Implications of CAC not supporting AB 2765.

Member Sutter motioned that CAC support staff positions for SB 1020 and AB 2070, but remain on a watch or neutral position for AB 2765. Member Landry seconded the motion, which passed 10/0. Excused: Members: Franch, Talreja, Pacheco.

C6. Amendment to Rate Setting Protocol (CAC Action Item) (20 Minutes)

Present proposed amendment to rate setting protocol

There were no speakers for public comment.

Chair Eldred read Member Franch's comments into the record.

- Guidance is needed on how to respond to the community's frustration regarding EBCE's rates and helping the public understand the separation between PG&E and EBCE's portion.
- Community workshops should be continued, even if there is no change in the value proposition, as a tool to receive community feedback and answer the community's questions.

The Committee Discussed:

- Keeping the requirement for community workshop meetings when there is no change in the value proposition as a tool to assist customers in understanding EBCE's rates relative to PG&E's rates, and because other ideas may come out of it.
- EBCE's value proposition is not simply being less expensive than PG&E's rates, but rather it is the local control of sourcing EBCE's electricity and the ability to use that for local development benefits.
- Discontinuing community workshops when there is no change in the value proposition because rate-setting protocol dictates that EBCE directors set the rates annually and there is no reason to spend staff time and effort when there is no change.
- The importance of the addition of online access for customers, such as virtual meetings.
- The importance of keeping three community meetings so they can be held in each part of Alameda County, giving people the opportunity to go in person, and the possibility of going to four community meetings.
- Going to two community meetings when there is no rate change because of low attendance rate.
- The conflict between businesses wanting to be efficient and the public wanting transparency.

Member Sutter motioned to support the staff recommendation. Member Swaminathan seconded the motion, which passed 6/4. Yes votes: Members: Liu, Swaminathan, Lakshman, Pacheco, Sutter, Muetzenberg. No votes: Members: Landry, Hernandez, Lutz and Eldred. Excused: Members: Franch, Talreja, Pacheco.

C7. Draft EBCE Budget FY 2022-2023 (CAC Informational Item) (60 Minutes)
Present draft FY 2022-2023 Budget

Audrey Ichinose, East Bay Clean Power Alliance, liked the items outlined in the local development area of the budget, but suggested EBCE not consider improving the value proposition for Renewable 100, because people who have opted for this choice are willing to pay more, and should if they have a higher income. Or if that is deemed unwise, perhaps it could be made optional for people who want to pay more.

Jessica Tovar, East Bay Clean Power Alliance, was glad to see \$2.25 million budgeted for Community Innovation Grants and appreciated that the CAC would be working to inform how that program would roll out. Jessica Tovar believed the Local Development Business Plan report was rushed. Jessica Tovar stated it would be good to get a bigger picture of community resilience funding and proposed requiring matching funds. Jessica Tovar also wanted clarity on savings, because it is helpful for the community to know how much in dollar amount they are saving per month or year by average. Jessica Tovar believed the \$15 million grant to Benioff Children's Hospital should be used towards prevention of asthmas triggers and asthma related to environmental impacts.

Chair Eldred read Member Franch's comments into the record.

- Asthma rates in our community, particularly where related to fossil fuel combustion and air pollution, is an important issue, but EBCE is not the right agency to be directing money toward facilitating public health initiatives.
- EBCE should focus on its core mission as an agency to transition to local, clean energy through investment in community infrastructure and generation capacity, which will have a greater return on investment since it is within the core competencies and functions of the agency.

The Committee Discussed:

- The length the \$15 million grant to Benioff Children's Hospital.
- Reason for jump in cost of human resources consulting, which would go toward working with staffing agencies to recruit for open positions.
- Concern that funding an asthma treatment center is outside of what EBCE should be doing, and that EBCE could treat the source of the problem more effectively with the \$15 million.
- Concern regarding starting a program that takes time to ramp up, because it is important to ensure there is duration of the program so funding does not end and program is shut down.
- Considering more energy related programs and the decision-making process.
- Whether CPUC funding for energy efficiency is multi-year funding, and if so, what other programs are contemplated?
- How Benioff Children's Hospital was selected for grant funding as opposed to other facilities that would treat adults as well.
- Addressing some of the other public health effects that are more closely related to electricity and what EBCE actually does.

C8. CAC Member and Staff Announcements including requests to place items on future CAC agendas

Chair Eldred reported that the issue of EBCE's dirty power label would be placed on a future agenda, hopefully in May or June.

Chair Eldred requested prayers for Reverend Ken Chambers as he undergoes transplant surgery.

Member Lutz reported that he had begun speaking with sustainability officers in East Bay cities and counties regarding coordinating their climate action plans with EBCE, and requested he be allowed to report on it at a future meeting.

C9. Adjournment to Monday, June 13, 2022 at 6:00pm