



A

בס"ד
Sukka 17
Intro

Today we will learn בע"ה of סוכה דף יז
Some of the topics we will learn about include the following:

The status of a סוכה with a gap between the walls and the סכך

The status of a סוכה with invalid סכך between the valid סכך and the walls

A

The status of a סוכה with a gap between the walls and the סכך

The status of a סוכה with invalid סכך between the valid סכך and the walls

B

A discussion regarding the amount of סכך pasul that invalidates the Sukkah -

The size of a gap in the סכך that invalidates the Sukkah -
Whether pasul schach and air-gaps combine to invalidate a סוכה?

B

The amount of סכך pasul that invalidates the Sukkah

The size of a gap in the סכך that invalidates the Sukkah

Whether pasul schach & air-gaps combine to invalidate a סוכה

C

Some of the key terms and concepts we will learn about include:

דופן עקומה - A bent wall. This principle allows us to regard invalid סכך as an extension of the wall if it's within four אמות of the wall. We consider the wall as if it's bent inwards and reaches the valid סכך.

זב - a person who has become טמא due to an emission from his body. In addition to טומאה by contact, he can make things טמא by sitting on them, known as טומאת משכב ומושב

C

דופן עקומה

זב

טומאת משכב ומושב



1 So let's review...

משנה זאגט; הרחיק את הסיכוך מן הדפנות שלשה טפחים פסולה
If the סכך was three טפחים from the wall it's פסול.

בית שנפחת וסיכך על גביו
אם יש מן הכותל לסיכוך ארבע אמות פסולה
If the roof of a house had a hole and סכך was placed over it, if the distance from the סכך to the wall is four אמות, the Sukkah is Posul.

Rashi explains that if it's less than four אמות the Sukkah would be Kosher, because the הלכה למה מסיני teaches the rule of דופן עקומה - a bent wall -

The סכך פסול on the sides of the roof are considered an extension of the wall, as if the wall bends, and reaches the edge of the סכך.

Rashi also adds that even if the sides of the roof are made of materials that are valid for סכך, it is still פסול סכך, because of תעשה ולא מן העשוי.

1 הרחיק את הסיכוך מן הדפנות שלשה טפחים פסולה



בית שנפחת וסיכך על גביו
אם יש מן הכותל לסיכוך ארבע אמות פסולה



רש"י
If it was less than 4 אמות the Sukkah would be Kosher because of דופן עקומה

2 The Mishnah gives two more examples of דופן עקומה:

וכן חצר שהיא מוקפת אכסדרה
סכך פסול וכן חצר שהיא מוקפת אכסדרה
A courtyard that is surrounded with porches, which are פסול סכך, and he put סכך over the courtyard - if the porches are less than four אמות wide, it would be a Kosher Sukkah, based on דופן עקומה. The porches are considered part of the wall. Also;

סוכה גדולה שהקיפוה בדבר שאין מסככין בו
אם יש תחתיו ארבע אמות פסולה

A large סוכה that was surrounded by material unfit for סכך, if it is four אמות wide, the סוכה פסול - If less than four אמות, the Sukkah is Kosher, based on דופן עקומה.

2 דופן עקומה Two more examples of

סוכה גדולה וכן חצר שהיא מוקפת אכסדרה
שהקיפוה בדבר שאין מסככין בו




אם יש תחתיו ארבע אמות פסול
If less than four אמות, the Sukkah is Kosher based on דופן עקומה

3 The גמרא begins by explaining why we need three examples of דופן עקומה:

If we had only learned the case of the house that had a hole in the roof, we would have said דופן עקומה works there because the walls were built for the house, but in the courtyard, the walls were not built for the porches so maybe דופן עקומה wouldn't work. We are told that it does. If we had only been taught these two cases, we would have said דופן עקומה works because the material being used is valid סכך, but in the third case, even the material is invalid and maybe דופן עקומה doesn't work. We are told that it does. צריכא, this is why we need all three examples.

3 Why we need three examples of דופן עקומה



דופן עקומה works here even though the material used is NOT valid סכך


דופן עקומה works here even though the walls were NOT built for the courtyard

דופן עקומה works here because the walls were built for the house

4 The Gemara goes into more detail about the size of open space or invalid סכך:
 רבה heard the students of רב saying in their Rebbe's name
 אויר פוסל בשלשה
 סכך פסול בארבעה
 A gap of empty space in the סכך invalidates the סוכה at a width of three טפחים, and a section of invalid סכך invalidates at a width of four טפחים.
 רבה however holds
 סכך פסול בארבע אמות
 A section of invalid סכך invalidates the סוכה only at a width of four אמות.

רבה questioned the Talmidim of Rav from our משנה where it seems that אויר indeed invalidates at three טפחים, but סכך פסול invalidates only at four אמות, not טפחים.

4 *More about the size of open space or invalid סכך*
רב heard the students of רב saying in their Rebbe's name



Our Mishnah

סכך פסול invalidates only at four אמות

invalidates at three טפחים

5 They answered that רב and שמואל both said that the משנה is talking about where the invalid סכך is מן הצד - on the side, next to the wall, and it's כשר up to four אמות based on עקומה, but באמצע - in the middle of the סוכה it's פסול even at four טפחים.

However, according to Rabbah, even in the middle, the shiur is four אמות.

5 רב - שמואל

The משנה talks about where the invalid סכך is מן הצד

However באמצע it is פסול even at four טפחים



רב

רב

Even in the middle the shiur is four אמות

6 רבה suggests that this Machlokes has bearing on the following scenario:
 סכך פסול פחות מארבעה
 ואויר פחות משלשה
 We have two sections in the middle of the סכך - one section has LESS than the shiur of סכך פסול - less than four טפחים, or less than four אמות respectively - and one section has less than three טפחים of open space - however, these two sections combined are MORE than four טפחים, or four אמות respectively.
 Is the Sukkah Kosher or Posul?

6 רבה



סכך פסול פחות מארבעה ואויר פחות משלשה

These two sections combined are MORE than four טפחים

כשר פסול?

7 רבה reasoned that according to his opinion of ארבע אמות, the Sukkah is Kosher. Why? Because, since the Shiur of ארבע אמות is mentioned in the Mishnah, it must be from the Shiurim of מסיני, which are arbitrary, and כיון דלא שוו שיעוריהו להדדי לא מצטרפי. Two items that have different Shiurim cannot be combined. However, according to Rav's opinion of ארבעה טפחים, the Sukkah is Posul, because, since it is not mentioned in the Mishnah, it must be a logical shiur that, as in other Halachos, an area of four טפחים is considered a separate רשות, and therefore, regarding סוכה, four טפחים of סכך פסול cannot be considered part of the Sukkah, which invalidates the Sukkah because of a lack of סכך. So too, אור שלשה טפחים is Posul because of lack of סכך. Therefore, they can be combined.



8 The Gemara challenges רבה's opinion that items with different measurements cannot combine from a משנה in כלים, where different materials have different minimum size requirements to be subject to טומאה. However, the Mishnah says that they CAN combine to the more lenient shiur and become Tamei?

8

The Gemara challenges רבה's opinion that items with different measurements cannot combine

מלכא כלי

Different materials have different size requirements to be subject to טומאה. However, they can still combine to the more lenient shiur and become Tamei?

9 רבה answers that the משנה itself answers this question. ר' שמעון says they all combine מושב לטמא וראוי לטמא, because they can all become טמא through sitting as was stated in another משנה; כמשהו, if they were trimmed down to a one by one טפח piece, they can become טמא. This small piece can be used as a patch on a donkey's saddle and if a זב sat on it, it would become טמא. The point is; since regarding one Halachah they all have a common shiur, they can combine even regarding those Halachos where they have different Shiurim. However, there is no Halachah where סכך פסול and אויר have a common shiur.

9

רבה answers...

Since regarding one Halachah they have a common shiur they can combine even regarding those Halachos where they are different

However, there is no Halachah where סכך פסול and אויר have a common shiur

10 The above discussion presented רבה and רב disagreeing about טפחים in the middle of a סוכה, whether the shiur is four פסול or four אמות. This was the version of סורא. In נהרדעא, it was presented as a dispute between רב and שמואל holds סכך פסול בארבעה Invalid סכך invalidates at a width of four טפחים, and רב holds סכך פסול בארבע אמות Invalid סכך invalidates the סוכה only at a width of four אמות.

10

<p>The above was the version of סורא presented רב and רבה</p> <p>רב סכך פסול פוסל בארבע אמות</p>	<p>נהרדעא it was presented as a dispute between רב and שמואל</p> <p>שמואל סכך פסול פוסל בארבעה טפחים</p>
--	--

11 After several challenges to the opinion of four טפחים are answered, the Gemara asks from the following Braisa: 'סככה בנסרין של ארוז שיש בהן ד דברי הכל פסולה If someone covered his סוכה with cedar boards of four טפחים wide, everyone agrees it is invalid. רבין בהן ד רבי מאיר פוסל ורבי יהודה מכשיר If they are less than four טפחים, מכשיר ר' יהודה מכשיר, ר' מאיר פוסל. מכשיר ר' says it's still Posul but ר' יהודה says it's כשר. ומודה רבי מאיר שאם יש בין נסר לנסר כמלא נסר שמוניח פסל ביניהם וכשרה If the space between the boards is equal to the width of the boards themselves, R' Meir says you can fill the empty space with פסל, any valid סכך, and the סוכה is כשר. According to רב that invalid סכך, even in the middle, invalidates the Sukkah only at four אמות, this ברייתא is not difficult. Each board is less than four אמות, and they are separated by valid סכך, so it's כשר. However, according to שמואל, that in the middle, invalid סכך invalidates the סוכה even at four טפחים wide, how can the סוכה be valid, each board is four טפחים wide?

11

? ברייתא

סככה בנסרין של ארוז שיש בהן ד דברי הכל פסולה

אין בהן ד

<p>רבי יהודה מכשיר</p>	<p>רבי מאיר פוסל</p>
----------------------------	--------------------------

ומוקדם רבי מאיר
 לאק יל בין נסר לנסר
 טאלא נסר
 למניח פסל ביניהם
 ובלא

?

שמואל

how can this סוכה be valid each board is four טפחים wide?

✓

רב

12 אמר רב הונא בריה דרב יהושע
 הכא בסוכה דלא הויא אלא שמנה מצומצמות עסקינן
 The Braisa is speaking of a Sukkah that is exactly eight by eight
 אמות, which is forty eight by forty eight טפחים,
 ויהיב נסר ופסל ונסר ופסל ונסר ופסל מהאי גיסא
 ונסר ופסל ונסר ופסל ונסר ופסל מהאי גיסא
 דהווי להו שני פסלין באמצע
 ואיכא הכשר סוכה באמצע
 He started from one side wall, and placed a board/פסל,
 board/פסל, board/פסל, each four טפחים, for a total of twenty four
 טפחים. $6 \times 4 = 24$. He repeated this from the other side. This way
 there are two strips of פסל next to each other in the middle, for a
 total of eight טפחים of valid סכך - enough for a valid סוכה in the
 middle.

