

**Daf Hashvuah Halacha Gemara and Tosfos Taanis Daf 4**  
**By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz**  
**limudtorah.onlinewebshop.net**  
**Subscribe free or to sponsor: [tosfosproject@gmail.com](mailto:tosfosproject@gmail.com)**

**Daf 4a**  
**New Sugya**

The Mishna says: we don't ask for rain until close to the time of rain. The Gemara assumes that this 'asking' means mentioning, (i.e., Mashiv Haruach). Who's the Tanna (who says you only mention rain near the rainy season, and not before)? Rava says: it's R' Yehoshua who says that you start mentioning it when you place down the Lulav, (i.e., Shmini Atzeres). Abaya responded: it could even be R' Eliezer (who says to mention it at the beginning of Sukkos), and we'll say that mentioning and asking are two separate things, (and R' Eliezer admits that you don't say V'sain Tal U'matar until after Sukkos).

**Daf 4b**

Another version: the Gemara suggests; let's say our Mishna is R' Yehoshua who says that you start mentioning it when you place down the Lulav. Rava answers: it could even be R' Eliezer (who says to mention it at the beginning of Sukkos), and we'll say that mentioning and asking are two separate things

**New Sugya**

The Mishna says: R' Yehuda says: on the first day of Pesach, the first Chazon (for Shachris) mentions Mashiv Haruach, and not the second one (Musaf). The Gemara asks a contradiction from the following Braisa; from when do you ask for rain? R' Yehuda says until it passes the days of Pesach, and R' Meir says until the days of Nissan end. R' Chisda answers: it's not difficult. The Braisa refers to asking for rain (i.e., V'sain Tal U'matar) and the Mishna refers to mentioning rain (Mashiv Haruach). You ask for rain (for the whole Yom Tov, but you stop mentioning Mashiv Haruach by the first day of Yom Tov).

Ulla says that R' Chisda's answer is as difficult as vinegar is to the teeth and as smoke is to the eyes. After all, in the beginning, before we ask for rain, we mention the concept of rain. So, when we are still asking for rain, we should still be mentioning it. Rather, (we need to reconcile) to say that there was a Tannaic argument what was R' Yehuda's opinion.

R' Yosef answers: what does the Braisa mean by "until Pesach finishes?" Until the first Chazon goes down on the first day of Pesach. Abaya asks: is there asking for rain on Yom Tov (to say that they ended during the first day of Yom Tov)? (After all, we don't say any of the regular middle Brachos on Yom Tov). R' Yosef answers: we refer to the translator of the Drasha (who usually made a Bracha for the rain by the Drasha). Abaya asks: does the translator ask something that's not necessary for the congregation? (After all, it's the end of the season, and it's not necessary anymore.) Rather, the correct answer is like Ulla.

Rabbah answers: what does the Braisa mean by "until Pesach finishes?" Until it passes the time for Shechting the Korban Pesach, (which was by midday Erev Pesach). We'll say that the end (of mentioning and asking) is like the beginning. What do we see in the beginning, that we mention Mashiv Haruach without asking V'sain Tal U'matar. So too by the end, we end up mentioning Mashiv Haruach without asking V'sain Tal U'matar. Abaya asks: it makes sense when we do this before asking, since mentioning it is an appeasement leading up to the asking. However, what appeasement for rain would it be to mention it in the end? Rather, the correct answer is like Ulla.

R' Assi quotes R' Yochanan that the Halacha is like R' Yehuda. R' Zeira asked R' Assi: did R' Yochanan really say this? After all, the Mishna says; the Tanna Kama says we ask for rain on the third of Cheshvon, and R' Gamliel says on the seventh. R' Elazar says that the Halacha is like R' Gamliel.

**Tosfos explains: so, how can you say that the Halacha is like R' Yehuda as he's brought in the Mishna regarding the ones going to the Amud on Shmini Atzeres, the last one (the Baal Musaf) mentions it, and the first one (the Baal Shacharis) doesn't mention it. After all, earlier, we compared asking to mentioning, as we asked a contradiction (on mentioning) from the Braisa "until when do we ask for rain, until it passes etc."**

**Then we answered that how can you ask a contradiction from two separate people's opinion.**

R' Assi answered: are you asking a contradiction between two separate people? (Even if R' Elazar disagrees, why is this a question on R' Yochanan.)

Alternatively, R' Yochanan refers to mentioning rain, and R' Elazar refers to asking for rain. R' Zeira asks: doesn't R' Yochanan say that whenever we ask for rain, we mention rain. (This implies that, when we don't ask, we don't mention.) The Gemara answers: that refers to the time we stop asking for rain, we stop mentioning.

**Tosfos explains: the Gemara answers: that's for the stoppage. I.e., in the time you stop asking, you stop mentioning. However, when you start saying it, we mention rain earlier (than asking for it). The reason is; mentioning appeases Hashem to help the asking. Therefore, there is no problem if they mention it earlier.**

The Gemara asks: but R' Yochanan said; when we start mentioning rain, we start asking for rain. When we stop asking for rain, we stop mentioning rain. The Gemara answers: it's not difficult, that's only to them (the people of Eretz Yisrael), however, (when we say that we push off asking) refers to us (in Bavel). The Gemara asks: what's the difference by us (that we push off asking) because our fruit are still in the fields (to dry out, since it needs to dry out longer because its damper).

**Tosfos explains: to the people of Bavel, they wait until after the seventh of Cheshvon, since they have fruit in the wilderness. However, in Eretz Yisrael, there is no concern, since their fruit can dry out without bringing it out in the wilderness.**

**The next Tosfos explains: in Eretz Yisrael, they can ask for rain as soon as they mention rain.**

So too in Eretz Yisrael, (you need to push off the rain) for those returning from coming up to Yerushalayim for the Regel. The Gemara answers: R' Yochanan only says (that you ask as soon as you mention it) in the time where there is no Beis Hamikdash. Once we came to this, we can answer that both refer to them (the people of Eretz Yisrael), one (i.e., when they pushed it off asking) is when the Beis Hamikdash stood, the other, (when we ask right when we start mentioning rain), is after the Beis Hamikdash no longer existed.

The Gemara inquires: to us (i.e., the people of the Diaspora) who have two days Yom Tov (of Shmini Atzeres). Rav says that they mention it by the first day Musaf. Stop saying it by Mincha, Maariv and the next day Shacharis, and start saying again by Musaf. Shmuel said: go and say to Abba (i.e., Rav, this was his real name); after you made the day Kodesh (Shmini Atzeres), you'll now make it weekday? (After all, we don't mention rain by Mincha of Chol Hamoed). Rather, Shmuel says: we start saying by Musaf and Mincha. We stop for Maariv and the next morning's Shachris, and we say it again by Musaf.

### **Daf 5a**

Rava says: once you start saying it (by the first day Musaf) you don't stop. R' Sheishes said the same thing. Even Rav reversed his decision. After all, R' Chananel quoted Rav: you count twenty one days (from Rosh Hashana) the same way you would count ten days from Rosh Hashana until Yom Kippur, (which, the next day is the first day of Shmini Atzeres) and you start mentioning it, and once you start, you don't need to stop. The Halacha is: once you start, you don't need to stop.