

Daf Hashvuah Gemara and Tosfos Rosh Hashana Daf 16
By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz
limudtorah.onlinewebshop.net
Subscribe free or Contact: tosfosproject@gmail.com

Daf 16a
New Sugya

The world is judged four times a year. On Pesach, it's judged on the grains.

Tosfos is bothered by the question: in Brachos it's implied by the story of a pious person who got in a fight with his wife on Erev Rosh Hashana that he heard two spirits speaking with each other what she heard from behind the heavenly curtain that anyone who plants during the first rains will be broken through hail. (This seems that they judge on Rosh Hashana what will happen with the grain.)

Tosfos answers: perhaps they announced on Rosh Hashana the judgment made on Pesach. Alternatively, it's like R' Yehuda's opinion (brought in the Gemara) that they judge on Rosh Hashana for all items, but they had the final ruling for grain on Pesach.

On Shvuos, it's judged on the fruit of the trees. On Rosh Hashana, the whole world passes single file before him like Bnai Maron (we'll explain it in the Gemara), as it says "who created their hearts together, who understands all their deeds." On Sukkos, it's judged on the waters (rain).

The Gemara asks: which grains do we refer to? Do we refer to the grains that are already standing (by Pesach)? If so, all that occurred to it until now, when was that judged? Rather, it refers to the grain that will be planted afterwards. The Gemara asks: this seems to suggest that each crop has one judgement on it. However, we learn that anything that happens to it, or anything detrimental that couldn't be helped; if it happened before Pesach, it was judged on the earlier year. If it happened after Pesach, it was judged at the present Pesach. If anything happens to a person,.....

Tosfos explains: 'Keri' is from the term of happenstance, as Biliam said "perchance I'll happen (to meet Hashem)." Alternatively, it's a term that means hardship, like the Pasuk says (by the Tochacha) "if you walk with me harshly."

..... or anything detrimental that couldn't be helped; if it happened before Yom Kippur, it was judged on the earlier year. If it happened after Yom Kippur, it was judged at the present Yom Kippur. Rather, Rava says: there are two judgments on each crop. Abaya says: therefore, if you see that your grain is prospering in the early crops (i.e., wheat and rye, and you see you had a favorable judgement), he should plant the later crops (barley) as early as possible, so by the time the next judgement day comes (Pesach) that crop would already started growing (and it probably won't be ruined, even with not such a favorable judgement).

The Gemara asks: who's the author of the Mishna? After all, it can't be R' Meir, nor R' Yehuda, nor R' Yossi nor R' Nosson. As we learned; R' Meir says that they're all judged on Rosh Hashana and they're final ruling is issued on Yom Kippur. R' Yehuda says that they're judged on Rosh Hashana and their final ruling is issued on each item according to their proper time. I.e., for grain, it's on Pesach. For the fruits of trees, it's Shvuos. For water, it's Sukkos. A person is judged on Rosh Hashana and has the final ruling on Yom Kippur. R' Yossi says that a person is judged every day, as the Pasuk says that "he's visited by morning."

R' Nosson says he's judged every hour, as the Pasuk says "at every moment you test me."

The Gemara suggests: perhaps it's R' Yehuda, and when the Mishna says these times, it refers to the final ruling (and not the initial judging). The Gemara says: this can't be. After all, then it would be difficult the person's judgment (that the Mishna says it's Rosh Hashana, and if the Mishna refers to the final ruling, it should say it's Yom Kippur).

Rava answers: the Mishna is the Tanna from the Beis Medrish of R' Yishmael. He says that the world is judged four times a year. On Pesach, it's judged on the grains. On Shvuos, it's judged on fruit of the trees. On Sukkos, it's judged on the waters (rain). People are judged on Rosh Hashana, and their final ruling is on Yom Kippur. When the Mishna says they're judged, it refers to the initial judgement.

R' Chisda says: what's the reason for R' Yossi? The Gemara interjects: his reason is as he Darshens the Pasuk "he's visited by morning." The Gemara explains: we mean why didn't he learn like R' Nosson? He explains: (the word by R' Nosson's Pasuk), 'testing,' only means to look into (his deeds, but not a full judgment). The Gemara asks: his word of 'visiting' also connotes looking into the deeds (and not a full judgement).

Rather, R' Chisda says: the real reason for R' Yossi (is from this Pasuk); "to judge his servant (Shlomo) and his nation every day." As R' Chisda says: if a king and his nation come to be judged, the king is judged first. As King Shlomo said to Hashem "the judgement of your servant (Shlomo) and the judgement of your nation (the Jews)" What's the reason for this? Either, because it's not proper for the king to be waiting outside. Alternatively, (the king should be judged) before the Judge's anger increases (after judging many sinful people).

R' Yosef says: according to which opinion do we pray for the sick and the weak? Like R' Yossi (who says we're judged, every day, but to those who hold we're only judged once a year, the prayers won't help since the judgement was final.)

Tosfos asks: even according to the Rabanan, don't we pray (in Sh'moina Esrei) to heal us and to bless the years?

Another question: even R' Yehuda here who says that a person is judged on Rosh Hashana and the final ruling is made on Yom Kippur; says in Shabbos that, when you visit a sick person on Shabbos you say "Hashem should have mercy on you and all the sick of Yisrael." (So, we pray for him to be healed.)

R' Tam answers: we don't pray that someone shouldn't become sick if not for R' Yossi's opinion. However, we pray to heal the sick according to all opinions. After all, they decreed when they'll get sick but not when they'll get well. We say in Nedarim that the 'sick' is defined exactly as implied (a real sick person) and the 'weak' as the rabbis (who become weak from straining in their study). Thus, we pray for the sick that they should get healed, and for the weak, i.e., the rabbis, that they shouldn't get sick. (So, only this last idea we only pray for according to R' Yossi.)

This that we pray (according to all opinions) to bless the year (to have good crops), that's only like we say later that, if it's been decreed for a small amount of rain, Hashem should have them rain on (the most beneficial) time.

Alternatively, the prayers of a multitude are different, since their final ruling can be ripped

up, as we'll say later. We can also explain R' Yehuda's opinion in Shabbos (that you pray for the sick to be healed) that it's like the prayers of a multitude, since you pray for this sick person along with all other sick people.

Alternatively, it can be like the other Rabanan, like R' Yitzchok says: a crying out to Hashem helps for someone whether it's before or after the final ruling.

R' Yehuda quotes R' Akiva: why did the Torah say to bring the Korban Omar on Pesach? Since Pesach is the time of (the judgement) of grains. Therefore, Hashem says to bring the Omar on Pesach so he can bless your grain in the field. Why did the Torah required you to bring the two loaves on Shvuos? Since the time for fruits of the trees (to be judged) is on Shvuos, so Hashem says to bring the two loaves on Shvuos so I can bless your fruits of the trees. Why did the Torah say to libate water on Sukkos? Hashem says to libate water before him on Sukkos so that he can bless the yearly rain. (Hashem also says): say before me Malchiyos Zichronos and Shofros on Rosh Hashana. Malchiyos, so that you should accept my kingdom over you. Zechronos, so that you be remembered before me for the good. Shofros, how (do you bring up a good remembrance)? Through the Shofar.

R' Avohu says: why do we blow with a ram's Shofar? Hashem says: blow before me with a ram's Shofar so I should remember the binding of Yitzchok b. Avraham and I'll consider as if you bound yourself before me.

Tosfos is bothered: later in the third Perek, R' Yossi will allow blowing with a cow's horn. (So, why say that we blow explicitly with a ram's horn?)

Tosfos answers: since we Paskin like R' Yehuda there I the Gemara that only validates bent ram's horns.

R' Yitzchok says: why do we blow Shofar on Rosh Hashana? The Gemara injects: what do you mean why we blow? The Torah commands us! What we meant is: why do we make a Truah? The Gemara injects: the Torah also commands us to make a Truah, as it says "a remembrance of the Truah."

Daf 16b

Rather, why do we need to blow a Tekia and Truah when we sit and when we stand? The Gemara answers: in order to confuse the Satan.

Tosfos asks: are you not transgressing the prohibition to add to a Mitzvah (when you blow twice)? If you want to answer that, once you were Yoitza (with the first blowing), it's no longer the time of the Mitzvah where you don't transgress adding on (without intent), that can't be. After all, we say in the third Perek regarding Birchas Kohanim; you can't add an extra blessing from yourself (since you're adding onto the Mitzvah) and the time of the mitzvah didn't pass since you would make another Birchas Kohanim if you find another Minyan. So too here, if you find a Minyan that wasn't Yoitza yet, you would blow for them. *[R' Akiva Eiger asks that, when you blow for the other Minyan, you're not doing any Mitzvah, you're just helping them do their Mitzvah. The R'shas answers: since you're obligated to make sure that others do the Mitzvah, it's considered as a continuation of your own obligation.]*

Tosfos answers: it's not applicable to say someone's transgressed adding onto a Mitzvah by repeating it. Therefore, if a Kohain says Birchas Kohanim and repeats it in that Minyan, or if

someone repeats taking a Lulav or blowing the Shofar, (he doesn't transgress adding on). The same by putting the blood of a B'chor on the same corner of the Mizbeiach a second time, there is no prohibition of adding onto a Mitzvah. (When the Gemara says that this prohibition applies by the blood, that was only when you put it on a different corner.)

The next Tosfos quotes the Aruch what it means by confusing the Satan: it says in the Yerushalmi; the Pasuk says "death will be swallowed up forever." It also says "it will be on that day they'll blow the great Shofar." When the Satan hears the sound of the Shofar the first time, he gets somewhat preoccupied by it (for, perhaps it's the blow of the great Shofar). When he hears it the second time, he says that this must be the great Shofar and it's time that I'll be swallowed. He gets confused and he doesn't have time to prosecute.

R' Yitzchok says; any year that they don't blow in the beginning, they make the end of the year bad for him. Why is this? The Gemara answers: since he didn't confuse the Satan.

Tosfos quotes the Bahag: this doesn't apply when it falls out on Shabbos (and we can't blow, but it happened during the week) and a circumstance beyond his control prevented him from blowing.

R' Yitzchok says; any year that they make themselves like the poor in the beginning of a year, they become wealthy at the end. As the Pasuk says "from the beginning (Reishes) of the year" (but that word is written without a 'Vuv' and it says 'Rashes,' poor). "Until the end," i.e., at the end there will be a fine future.

Tosfos explains: since the Jews are poor, their hearts are broken, so they receive mercy from heaven.

R' Yitzchok says; they don't judge a person but for what he is at that time (and not what he's destined to be). As the Pasuk says "Hashem heard the cry of the young lad for what he's then." (Although there was a question to save Yishmael since his descendants would cause the death of many Jews, but at that time he wasn't bad and merited to be saved).

R' Yitzchok says; there are three things that make his sins to be remembered (by the heavenly tribunal); having a leaning wall, investigating prayers and giving over (to the heavenly tribunal) a claim you have on someone (for them to give retribution).

Tosfos explains this here the same way it's explained in Bava Basra that says; people can't protect themselves (from transgressing) three things every day, and one of them was investigating prayers, i.e., that he doesn't concentrate on what he's saying. This is similar to what it says in the Yerushalmi; the great R' Chiya said "I had never concentrated in my prayers only once, when I tried to concentrate, I (lost concentration) and thought in my mind 'who would go in front of a king first, an officer or the Reish Gelusah'." Shmuel said that he counted the birds flying by. R' Bon b. Chiya said he counted the stones in the wall. R' Mana said that he has to be thankful to his head. After all, when I get to Modim, it bows by itself (without me intending to do so). Therefore, since he doesn't concentrate by Davening, Hashem remembers his sins.

However, Tosfos concludes: it's not applicable to give such an explanation. Rather the opposite, it refers to someone who strengthens himself to concentrate, and through that he has confidence that Hashem accepts his prayers, like we say in Brachos about someone who lengthens his prayers and investigates (into it if it gets fulfilled). This is apparent from the Gemara in the last

Perek of Brachos where it says; R' Yehuda quotes Rav that three things lengthen a person's lifetime, and one of them is if he lengthens his prayers. The Gemara asks: this seems to be that it's a good thing; but doesn't R' Chiya b. Abba say that if someone lengthens his prayers and investigates it, it will lead him to disappointment. As the Pasuk says "lengthen prayer will lead to sickness of the heart." This means that if he investigates and say in his heart that Hashem will fulfil his requests since he prayed with concentration, he'll be disappointed since He will not give you what you requested. 'Tocheles' of the above Pasuk means prayers, and it comes from the same root as "Vyichal Moshe" (and Moshe prayed). R' Yitzchok says that three things reminds Hashem about a man's sin, investigating your prayer. Through that, they investigate all his deeds since he's so confident in his merits, so, let us see what those merits are. So, the Gemara there answers: one is where he investigates that his requests get fulfilled and the other one is when he lengthens his prayers without investigation.

According to this explanation, it fits well that all those three things are in the same vein. For another item is if he passes a leaning wall, that he's confident in his merit to pass by (and it won't fall on him). Also, those who give over their claim on someone (to the heavenly tribunal) to punish, since he's confident on his merit that they'll punish his friend because of him.

As R' Avin says; anyone who gives over their claim on someone (to the heavenly tribunal) gets punished first (for any bad he did). As we see the Pasuk says: "and Sarai told Avram 'my anger is upon you,'" and afterwards it says "Avraham came to eulogized Sarah and to cry over her." (I.e., she died first.)

R' Yitzchok says: there are four things that rip up someone's final ruling; charity, crying out (in prayer), a name changed and a change in one's deeds. We see this by charity since the Pasuk says "Tzedaka saves from death." We see this by crying out (in prayer), as the Pasuk says "They called out to Hashem when they had trouble, and they then left their problems." We see this by a name changed, as the Pasuk says "you shouldn't call your wife 'Sarai' but 'Sara.'" Then it says "I will bless you and give you a son." We see this by a change in one deeds, as the Pasuk says "Hashem saw their deeds" and then says "He changed His mind on the bad He said he'll do to them and didn't do it." Other say that even changing a place (rips the final ruling), as the Pasuk says "Hashem said to Avram 'go for you and I'll make you a great nation.'" The others (who don't count this) hold that this is different because the merit of Eretz Yisrael helped (and not just any change of place).

R' Yitzchok says "a person is obligated to greet his Rebbi during Yom Tov, as the Pasuk says "why are you going to him today? After all, it's not the beginning of the month or not Shabbos." This implies that one needs to go in the beginning of the month and on Shabbos.

R' Yitzchok says: a person is obligated to make himself Tahor for Yom Tov, as the Pasuk says "you should not touch their carcasses." We have a similar Braisa; "you should not touch their carcasses," I might think that Jews re commanded not to touch carcasses, so the Pasuk says "tell the Kohanim, the children of Aharon." Only Kohanim are commanded to keep away from Tumah and not regular Jews. It's even a Kal V'chomer. After all, what do we see that by strict Tumah (corpses), only Kohanim are commanded to refrain from them and not regular Jews, of course they're not commanded to refrain from a more lenient Tumah (of carcasses). If so, what does it mean by "you should not touch their carcasses?" It refers only to Yom Tov.

R' Yochanan says: there are three books opened on Rosh Hashana. One is for the truly wicked, one for the truly righteous and one for the people in the middle. The truly righteous are written and sealed right away to life. The truly wicked are written and sealed right away to death. The people in the middle final ruling is suspended from Rosh Hashana until Yom Kippur. If he merits it, he's written for life. If he doesn't merit

it, he's written for death.

Tosfos explains: since it counts people in the middle (implying he has half merits and half sins), it implies that the righteous are those who have more merits than sins and the wicked are those who have more sins than merits.

Tosfos is bothered by: sometimes, the righteous are sealed for death and completely wicked people for life. As it says "I will pay back my enemies on their face to destroy them," (that they get paid for any good during their lifetime, so they have nothing left for the next world) in which we explained at the end of Kiddushin; someone who has more merits than their sins (Hashem punishes them) and it's as if they burned the whole Torah and didn't leave even one letter. If he has more sins than merits, (he's rewarded) similar to one who kept the whole Torah and didn't leave even one letter out.

Tosfos answers: that, which we said here that the wicked die and the righteous live, that's for the next world.

R' Avin says: what does the following Pasuk mean; "erase from the book of life, and don't write him with the righteous?" "Erase from the book" that the book of the completely wicked. "Of life," that's the book of the completely righteous. "And don't write him with the righteous" this is the book of the people in the middle.

R' Nachman b Yitzchok taught it from here: "if not, please erase me from your book that you wrote." "Please erase me," that's from the book of the wicked. "From your book" this is the book of the righteous. "That you wrote" this is the book of the people in the middle.

Beis Shammai says: there are three groups to the future day of judgement.

Tosfos explains: this refers to when He'll make the dead alive, as the Pasuk seem to say. Although they were already judged after their deaths if their souls will be brought to Gan Eiden or Gehenim, there is another judgement if they will merit the next world that lasts for eternity. (Even if they didn't merit it in the past), there are those who already received their full punishment in Gehenim, and because of that, perhaps they'll merit it this time.

One is the completely righteous, one is the completely wicked and one is the people in the middle. The completely righteous is written and signed right away for the eternal life. The completely wicked is written and signed for Gehenim. As it says "many of those lying in the ground awakes, these are for eternal life and the others to descend to eternal embarrassing."