

**Daf Hashvua Gemara and Tosfos: Megila 19**  
**By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz**  
**LearnTosfos.com**

**Daf 20a**

The Gemara answers: really, R' Yehuda holds that you can even L'chatchila say it so low that you can't hear, and it's not difficult. One was said by him (i.e. even L'chatchila) and one was said by his teacher (i.e., only B'dieved). As we have a Braisa: R' Yehuda quotes R' Elazar b. Azarya: someone who reads Sh'ma needs to hear what he said; as the Pasuk says "Sh'ma Yisrael etc." Make it heard to your ears what you were saying. However, R' Meir says: from the Pasuk "which I commanded you today after your heart;" everything goes after your hearts intentions (and you don't need to hear it with your ears).

The Gemara concludes: once we get to this point, we can say that R' Yehuda agrees with his Rebbi (and only permits B'dieved). This, that we have the Braisa of R' Yehuda quoting R' Shimon b. Pazi that permits L'chatchila; we can say he holds like R' Meir.

**New Sugya**

R' Yehuda says: I was a minor and I read the Megila before R' Tarfon and the other elders in Lud. The Rabanan countered: we can't bring a proof from a (testimony of what you saw) when you were a minor.

Rebbi said: I was a minor and I read the Megila before R' Yehuda. The Rabanan responded: you can't bring a proof from the one with the lenient opinion (since his colleagues argued with him). The Gemara asks: why didn't they just tell him (like before) that you can't bring proof from what a minor saw? The Gemara answers: they were saying an extra reason besides that first reason. I.e., they're saying; for one thing, you can't bring a proof from a minor. Furthermore, you also can't bring a proof from the one with the lenient opinion.

**New Sugya**

You can't read the Megila, nor do Mila, nor Toivel, nor sprinkle (with the Para-Aduma waters), and a Shomeres Yom Keneged Yom can't Toivel, until sunrise. However, if they did it after dawn, they're Yoitzta. (Shomeres Yom Keneged Yom is if a woman sees blood one day or two consecutive days by the Ziva cycle, she goes to the Mikva the next day and she's clean as long as she doesn't see more blood that day.)

How do we know that Megila is read only by day? As the Pasuk says: "these days are to be remembered and done," that it's by day and not by night. The Gemara asks: this should

disprove R' Yehoshua b. Levi who says that someone needs to read the Megila at night and repeat it during the day. The Gemara answers: our Mishna is only referring to the day reading.

You can't do Mila at night, as it says "on the eighth day, you do the Mila."

**Tosfos asks:** in Shabbos, the Gemara uses this Pasuk to say that you do the Mila even on Shabbos. They learn that it can only be done by day from the Pasuk "and a eighth day old," and the Gemara brings a Braisa that Darshens the same way.

**Tosfos answers:** our Gemara brings the most simple Drasha (because it's not really getting involved with all the Drashos here). We see that there is a similar Gemara regarding the Kohain inspecting the Tzaras (by day; that the Gemara in one place learns it from one Pasuk, but another Gemara says that it's for a different Drasha, and learns that it's only by day from a different Pasuk.)

**R' Ephraim asks:** since Mila can't be done by night, it's a time-based positive Mitzva that women are exempt from. If so, why does the Gemara in Kiddushin say that you need a Pasuk 'him' to say that women are exempt from giving their sons a Mila? Why not say that they're anyhow exempt because it's a time-based positive Mitzva?

**Tosfos answers:** if it wasn't for the Pasuk 'him,' I would only say that women are only exempt from time-based positive Mitzvos when there is no Kareis associated with it, like Matza, Simcha on Yom Tov and Hakhel. Only they are excluded from this rule; but Mila that has Karies and had thirteen treaties cut on it, I would say even women are obligated to give their sons Mila, so the Pasuk 'him' teaches us otherwise. Alternatively, it's to teach us their exempt from Mila performed after its time (i.e., after the eighth day) according to the opinion that you can do Mila (after the eighth day) day or night.

You also can't Toivel or sprinkle Para-Aduma water, as the Pasuk says "a Tahor person sprinkles on a Tamai person etc. on the seventh day." We have a Hekish between sprinkling and Toiveling (to teach us that you also need to Toivel by day).

**Tosfos asks:** the Mishna in Para says: you can't Toivel, i.e., dip, the hyssop (in the Para-Aduma waters) and sprinkle it during the day, but he can Toivel himself at night and get sprinkled on during the day. However, here we say that you can only Toivel during the day.

**R' Tam answers:** there are two Tevilos associated with the Parah Aduma. The first was before the sprinkling, that prepares you to be able to receive the Tahara of the sprinkling. That one can be done at night, as we learned in Yevamos. The other one was done after sprinkling, and that was the one written in the Pasuk, and that one needs to be done during the day. This is also the implications of the Gemara in Kreisos that there is a

Tevila before the sprinkling. As it says; just like your forefathers came into Hashem's Bris with Mila and Teveila and sprinkling the blood (on the Jews). We learn that you need sprinkling the blood from the Pasuk "he sprinkled the blood." We learned there is Tevila, since there is no sprinkling without Toiveling first in order to be fit to receive the sprinkling. So, the sprinkling of the Parah Aduma water is in place of the blood sprinkling (so it also needs Tevila before). It also needs Teveila afterwards, as the Sifri says: if you Toiveled before the sprinkling, you didn't do anything.

Thus, there is a Tevila after sprinkling, as it says there (in Sifri) and one before, as it says in Kreises and many places in the Gemara that lists Tevila before sprinkling.

Tosfos asks: which Tevila are we referring to here? If it's referring to the first Tevila, which would seem to be the Mishna's implication by listing it before the sprinkling, but we said that it's valid if it's done at night, like we explained. If it refers to the one that's after sprinkling; why do we say that it's invalid since there is a Hekish to sprinkling? Say it's invalid since it was done before the sprinkling that can't be done by night. You can't say to invalidate if it was done at night after the day you had the sprinkling, which is the eighth night. After all, after the seventh day passed, it's simple that you can Toivel any time you want. Rashi also explains it this way, once the seventh day past, you can Toivel whenever you want.

Therefore, Riva explains: we refer to dipping the hyssop into the Parah Aduma waters. As we learned in Mesechta Para; that's why it says 'Toivel' first and then sprinkling. This is also implied in the Yerushalmi that brings the Pasuk of "you Toivel and sprinkle" to make a Hekish between Tevila and sprinkling, and it implies there that the Tevila is dipping the hyssop into the water.

However, Tosfos asks: that, which we say at the end of Yuma; the Zav, Zava or someone who became Tamai through a corpse may Toivel during the day (of Yom Kippur). [R' Yossi says you can't Toivel after Mincha, (since you don't need to be Tahor that day anymore since there is no more Davenings) since you can say Tefilas Neila by night.] However, you need to say that it was the day after you sprinkled the Parah Aduma. After all, it can't be the Teviiia before the sprinkling since it wouldn't be permitted to do on Yom Kippur. Even if you say that there is a Mitzva to Toivel on the exact day that you could, still, since the Rabanan forbade sprinkling the Para Aduma waters on Shabbos and Yom Tov, like it says in Pesachim; so how can you do the Tevila (before the sprinkling if there won't be any sprinkling)? If you say that it's on the eighth day, and they sprinkled on him Erev Yom Kippur, then this Tevila doesn't supersede washing yourself on Yom Kippur.

(Since he could have Toiveled the day before), it's not the Tevila in its proper time, (which there is no special Mitzvah to Toivel now than tomorrow).

**Tosfos answers: we must say that he received sprinkling from a minor, or an adult mistakenly sprinkled him, or purposely transgressed sprinkling.**

### **New Sugya**

The Gemara asks: why does our Mishna single out that the Tevila of a Shomeres Yom Keneged Yom needs to be Toiveled by day? After all, why should she be any different than any other Tamai person who needs to Toivel by day?

**Tosfos explains: if the above "you can't Toivel at night" refers to a person Toiveling, this question fits well why did it need to single out Shomeres Yom by itself (and not just let it be part of the first statement). If the Tevila refers to dipping the hyssop (and hadn't mention anything of a person Toiveling) we need to explain the question: why did the Mishna choose to mention Shomeres Yom needs Tevila by day more than any other person obligated to Toivel?**

The Gemara answers: I might think that she should be compared to the first seeing of a Zav (since it's also the beginning of the big Ziva and is only Tamai for one day) and there's a Hekish between him and a Baal Keri (someone who emitted semen) as it says "this is the laws of a Zav and one who emits semen." So, perhaps, the same way that a Baal Keri can Toivel the day he saw, so too a Shomeres Yom Keneged Yom. However, how can that be if the Pasuk says "all the days that she sees blood during the days of Ziva she's like a Nida?" Rather, perhaps she can count a clean period at night, and Toivel that night. So, we're taught otherwise. Since you need to count, and counting at night is not considered a valid counting.

**Tosfos says: this Gemara is a question to Rashi in Pesachim. As the Gemara there asks, according to R' Yossi who says that "we count part of the day as if it's the whole day" and therefore, if a Zava sees blood on her seventh day, she doesn't retroactively break the whole seven clean days. (I.e., although she needs seven clean days, we count the the beginning of the seventh day as the end of the clean days. Although she sees blood that day, since we considered as if the whole seven days passed, we don't say that seeing during the seventh day is seeing during the seven clean days.) The Gemara asks: (according to this), how can you even become a great Zava (that requires seeing blood three days in a row, if we consider a moment after the day starting as the finish of the day [because part of a day is like a whole day in this aspect]?) The Gemara answers: when she saw blood during the whole two Bein Hashmashes that are between the three days. However, this is difficult. Why don't you just say that she saw at night? After all, you can't count the time at night as**

anything, so we must count the day as Tamai since she already saw blood coming into the day.

**Tosfos answers: R' Yossi also holds that the end of the day can be counted as a clean day like at the beginning of the day. (So, even if she saw blood at night and you can't count the beginning of the day as part of a clean day, but she can count the end of that day as part of a day that's clean.) This is the implications from the Gemara in Nazir that asks: how can you have a great Zava according to R' Yossi? After all, if she sees in middle of the day, the other half of the day can count as a clean day.**

**Tosfos asks: if so, that R' Yossi holds of this type of "part of the day is like a whole day," (i.e., the last second of a day is like one day), then, the Gemara should have asked: does R' Yossi hold like the Kusim (who hold of this type of "part of the day is like a whole day,") like the Gemara asks on Rav (who seemed to hold this position).**

**Tosfos answers: the Kusim think that even the end of the first day she sees will be counted as one day (i.e., that it works for the beginning of a count). R' Yossi only says this to be the end of the seventh day (or its equivalent, which is the end of a one day counting).**

**Daf 20b**

**New Sugya**

The Mishna says that if you do all the Mitzvos by dawn, you're Yoitza. The Gemara asks: how do we know this? Rava says: since the Pasuk says: Hashem called the light 'day.' We'll explain: he called when the light comes in as day. The Gemara asks: if so, when the Pasuk similarly says: he called the darkness 'night,' that it's night when it starts becoming dark. (Is this correct?) After all, we Paskin that it's not night until Tzeis.

**Tosfos asks: since we Paskin that night is only by Tzeis, why does R' Yossi and R' Yehuda argue about Bein Hashmashos? After all, they just should say it's day until Tzeis.**

**Tosfos answers: there are discrepancies in when Tzies Hakochovim is, since some stars can be seen by day (and they argue about; what size stars are needed to be seen by Tzeis).**

Rather, R' Zeira says: we learn it from here; 'we did work, and half of them held spears, from dawn until Tzeis' The Pasuk continues "we guarded by night and worked by day." The Gemara asks: why do we need the second Pasuk? (why isn't the first Pasuk a proof in itself?) The Gemara answers: perhaps it's not yet day by dawn, and it's already night by sunset, but these people

rose earlier than daytime, and stayed later than nightfall. So the Pasuk says "we guarded by night and worked by day."

**Tosfos asks: we have the same Sugya in Brachos to prove that Tzeis is nighttime. However, it says there that this Pasuk is not a proof to it, but just as a hinting towards it. However, why is it not a real proof like the Gemara here says?**

**Tosfos answers: over there, they want to prove that the time to sleep regarding Sh'ma is Tzeis. (After all, Sh'ma is not dependant on when it's night, but when it's time to sleep). Therefore, it says there that it's not a true proof. Granted it's night at that time; still, it's not necessarily sleeping time for the average person.**

### **New Sugya**

You can do the following during the whole day: read the Megila, read Hallel, blow Shofar, take Lulav, Daven Musaf, bring the Korban Musaf, say Vidoy on the bulls (i.e., brought for the sins of the Jews from a mistaken P'sak from Beis Din, or of the Kohaim Gadol), and Vidoy on Maasar and Vidoy on Yom Kippur, Smicha, Shchita, waving Korbanos, bringing the Mincha to the Mizbeach, Kemitza, burning on the Mizbeach, to do Melika on bird Korbanos, to receive blood, to sprinkle it, to give a Sota to drink from the bitter waters, to chop the back of the neck of an Egal Arufa, and for the Tahar ceremony of the Metzora.

**Tosfos asks: why does it need to say that the Vidoy Yom Kippur is the whole day? After all, it already said that you can do Smicha the whole day, and Vidoy is done by the Smicha.**

**Tosfos answers: if it wasn't for teaching us about Vidoy, I would say that Vidoy is not the whole day, and it will cause the Smicha for these Korbanos not to be able to be done the whole day like other Smichos. Therefore, it needs to teach us that Vidoy is the whole day.**

The whole night is Kosher for the following: cutting the Omer, to burn the fats and limbs (of Korbanos brought the day before).

**Tosfos quotes R' Tam: if you forget to make a Bracha (and count the Omer at night) you can't make a Bracha on it by counting during the day, as our unnamed Mishna implies here (that the Omer was only by night). Even though that there is an unnamed Mishna in Menachos that says: if you cut the Omer during the day, it's Kosher B'dieved; still, the unnamed Mishna here is better since it list it along with other settled P'sakim (of the other Halachos that can only be done at day or at night). Also, it seems, even the one who says it's Kosher B'dieved if cut by day will agree that you can't count the Omer by day since the Pasuk repeats it, which is a sign that you can't be Yoitza without it. As the Pasuk**

says 'complete,' and you can't have complete counting unless you count them all at night. Hilchos Atzeres says the same.

The Bahag writes: if you forget to make the Bracha (and count) at night, you should count the next day without a Bracha. This is the Halacha. However, if you forget both by night and by day, you can't count anymore with a Bracha, since you need complete days of counting, and you don't have it.

After you make a Bracha on the counting, you say Yehi Ratzon Sheybaneh etc. (it should be Hashem's will to rebuild the Beis Hamikdash), which we don't say by Shofar and Lulav (although they're all no longer applicable from the Torah, and the Rabanan just enacted it to remind us of the times of the Mikdash when they were from the Torah, just like counting the Omer). This is because it's only a remembrance to the Beis Hamikdash's time (since it's only saying words) while Shofar and Lulav are actions. *[See R'shas who asks why is Shofar in this category since it's still a Torah obligated Mitzvah.]*

This is the rule: anything that the Mitzva is during the day, you may do it anytime during the whole day. Anything that the Mitzva is during the night, you may do it anytime during the whole night.

The Gemara asks; how do we know this for the Megila (that you may read it all day)? The Gemara answers: it says "these days remember." How do we know this by Hallel? From the Pasuk says ""from the rising sun on the East until it sets." R' Yosef says: from "this is the day that Hashem made." How do we know this by Lulav? From "and you shall take for yourself on the first day." How do we know this by Shofar? From "a day of Truah shall be for you." How do we know this by Musaf? As it says "the daily thing." The rabbis made the Tefilas Musaf to mirror the Korban Musaf. How do we know this by the Viduy on the bulls? We learn it from a Gezeira Shava "Kapara, Kapara" from Yom Kippur. As we learned: it says by Yom Kippur "it should atone for him and for his family," which refers to atonement through speech (i.e., Viduy). We see that this atonement is by day, as it says "this day should atone you." How do we know this by Viduy Maasar? From the Pasuk "you should say before Hashem "and you should say before Hashem I removed the Kodosh from the house," and right afterwards, it says "this day, Hashem commanded you."

How do we know this by Shchita and Smicha? As it says "he made Smicha and Shechted," (so we have a Hekish between Smicha and Shchita) and it says by Shchita "the day of your Shchita (of the Korban)." How do we know this by waving? From "the day that you wave the Omer." How do we know this by bringing the Mincha to the Mizbeach? Since there is a Hekish between it and waving, as the Pasuk says "the Kohain took the Mincha of jealousy from the woman's hand and waved and brought it." How do we know this by Melika, Kemitza, burning the Korban and sprinkling the blood? From "the day that you commanded the Jews."

**Tosfos explains: but we can't learn Smicha from this Pasuk, since it's not an Avoda, since a non-Kohain may do it, and this Pasuk refers to Avoda, as it says "to Makriv their Korbanos." This is the same reason we don't learn waving and bringing the Mincha to the Mizbeach; since you don't need a Kohain for a Mincha until Kemitza.**

How do we know this by giving the Sota to drink? As we learn a Gezeira Shava "Torah, Torah." As it says by the drinking "and the Kohain does this whole Torah," and it says there "on all the Torah that You showed and all the judgment etc." Just like judgment is by day, so too is this drinking is by day.