

Gemara and Tosfos Daf Hashvua

Megila 17

By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz

Learntosfos.com

Daf 17a

As the master says: why does the Pasuk count Yishmael's years? In order to figure out Yaakov's years. As the Pasuk says "these are the year's of Yishmael's life; one hundred and thirty seven years." How much older was Yishmael than Yitzchok? Fourteen years, as the Pasuk says "Avraham was eighty six years old when Hagar bore him Yishmael." It also says: Avraham was a hundred years old when Yitzchok, his son, was bore to him." Then, it's written "Yitzchok was sixty years old when they (the twins) were born to him." So, how old was Yishmael when Yaakov was born? Seventy four years old. How many more years remained in his life? Sixty three more years. We learned similarly: Yaakov, our forefather, was sixty three years old when he got his father's blessing. At that time, Yishmael died, as the Pasuk says "Eisuv saw that his father blessed Yaakov etc. and Eisuv went to Yishmael and took Machlas the daughter of Yishmael (as a wife) the brother of Nevoyos." Once it says she was Yishmael's daughter, I could figure out that she was Nevoyos's sister. This teaches us that after he betrothed her, Yishmael died and Nevoyos, her brother, needed to marry her off. If you add this sixty three years with another fourteen years until Yosef was born, you get seventy seven. After that, it says "Yosef was thirty years old when he stood before Pharoh." That would make him one hundred and seven. Add another seven years of plenty and two years of famine (before Yaakov came down) you have a hundred and sixteen years. Afterwards, it says "Pharoh asked 'how old are you?' Yaakov answered: the days of my life is one hundred and thirty years." However, we just concluded that he was a hundred and sixteen at the time. Rather, we must conclude: we didn't count the fourteen years that he was hidden away in the Beis Medrish of Eiver. As we learned: Yaakov was hidden in the Beis Medrish of Eiver for fourteen years. Then he left and came to Aram Naharayim (to Lavan). Thus, when he stood by the well (waiting for Rochel) he was seventy seven. How do we know he wasn't punished for the learning years? As we learned: we see Yosef was away from his father for twenty two years, the same amount that Yaakov was away from his father. But wasn't he away for thirty six years? Rather, we must say that the fourteen years that he was in the Beis Medrish of Eiver wasn't counted in his punishment.

The Gemara asks: still he only was in Lavan's house for twenty years. The Gemara answers: since

he tarried for two years on the way. As we learned: he left Aram Nahrayim and arrived in Sukkos and he stayed there eighteen months, as the Pasuk says "Yaakov traveled to Sukkos and built for himself a house, and Sukkos for his livestock." He was six months in Beis El where he went to sacrifice his Korbanos (that he promised).

End Perek

Someone who reads the Megila backwards is not Yoitza. Neither is someone who reads it by heart, or if he reads the Targum or any other language. However, you can read it to foreign-language speaking people in their language, or if you read it to him in Hebrew, he's Yoitza.

If he reads the Megila a little at a time, or as he's drifting to sleep, he's Yoitza. If he reads it while he's writing it, or Darshening it, or editing it, he's only Yoitza if he has intent, but not if he doesn't have intent. If it's written with various color inks or on paper or on untreated hides, you're not Yoitza. You're not Yoitza unless it's written in the Ashura letters on Klaf and with regular ink.

The Gemara asks: how do we know that you're not Yoitza if you read backwards? Rava says: the Pasuk says "the way it's written and its times." Just like the times can't be backwards, (since you can't have the fifteenth before the fourteenth), so too you can't have the writings backwards. the Gemara asks: but that Pasuk was said by doing the Mitzvos of Purim and not the reading, as the Pasuk there said "to do these two days." Rather, we learn it from here: "these days are remembered and done." We have a Hekish between the remembering (reading the Megila) and the doing. Just like you can't preform the Mitzvos backwards (first on the fifteenth and then on the fourteenth) so too you can't remember, (by reading the Megila) ,backwards.

We learned: the same applies to Hallel, Sh'ma and Tefila (that they can't be read backwards). How do we know it applies by Hallel? Rabbah answers: since the Pasuk (in Hallel) says "from the (rise) of the sun in the east until it goes down." (Just like the sun doesn't go backwards, so can't you read Hallel backwards.) R' Yosef answers: the Pasuk (in Hallel) says "this is the day Hashem made." (Just like the day has a certain order, so too Hallel.) R' Aviya answers: the Pasuk (in Hallel) says "the name of Hashem shall be blessed." ("Shall be" implies the way it is, in order.) R' Nachman b. Yitzchok, or R' Acha b. Yaakov, answers: from this Pasuk (in Hallel) "from now and on," (in order).

How do we know you need to read Sh'ma in order? As we learned: Rabbi held that Sh'ma can only be said as written, i.e., in Lashon Hakodesh. The Chachumim hold it can be said in all languages.

Tosfos says: it seems that the Halacha should be like the Chachumim. For one thing, the Halacha is like the majority against a single opinion. Secondly, (we'll see) they hold like the opinion that you don't need to read it loud enough for you to hear to be Yoitza, and we Paskin like that opinion, i.e., the Tanna Kama who argues with R' Yossi, in Brachos.

Daf 17b

What's the reason for Rabbi? For the Pasuk says "it shall be" which connotes the way it is, in Lashon Hakodesh. What's the reason for the Rabanan? The Pasuk says "Sh'ma," listen, in all languages that you can listen and understand. The Gemara asks: according to Rabbi, it also says the word Sh'ma. (So, what does he Darshen with it?) The Gemara answers: that's to teach us that you must hear what comes from your mouth (i.e., you must say it loud enough for you to hear it.) However, the Rabanan hold that you're Yoitza if you don't hear what you're saying.

The Gemara asks: what does the Rabanan use "and it shall be" for? The Gemara answers: it teaches us that you (need to read it the way it is) and can't read it backwards. The Gemara asks: where does Rabbi know that you can't read it backwards? He learns it from the extra 'Hey' in 'Had'varim.' However, the Rabanan hold the 'Hey' in Had'varim is not extra.

The Gemara suggests: let's say that Rabbi holds that the whole Torah was written in all languages (i.e., usually you may say it in all languages).

Tosfos quotes Rashi who explains: you can read a Sefer Torah in any language. Tosfos asks: but Torah reading is only rabbinic besides for Parshas Zachor.

Therefore Tosfos explains: all readings that the Torah requires, like Parshas Chalitzah, Eglah Arufah, Viduy Maasar and Bikurim. All these are listed in Mesechtas Sotah (about which language you can read them in).

After all, if it was written only in Lashon Hakodesh, why does the Pasuk need to say "it shall be" (to teach us to say it in Lashon Hakodesh if the default of saying Torah is always in that language anyways)?

The Gemara answers: (really all Torah must be read in Lashon Hakodesh. However, here) I might have thought you would Darshen Sh'ma like the Rabanan do (to make reading Sh'ma the exception that it may be read in all languages), so we're taught otherwise with "it shall be."

The Gemara suggests: let's say that the Rabanan hold that the whole Torah was written in Lashon Hakodesh (i.e., usually you may say it in Lashon Hakodesh). After all, if it was written in all languages, why does the Pasuk need to say "Sh'ma" (to teach us to say it in all languages if the default of saying Torah is always in all languages anyways)?

The Gemara answers: (really all Torah could be read in all languages. However, here) I might have thought you would Darshen "it shall be" like Rabbi does (to make reading Sh'ma the exception that it must be read in Lashon Hakodesh, so we're taught otherwise with "Sh'ma."

Tosfos asks: the Gemara in Sota needs these Drashos for all opinions, whether it's usually said in Hebrew or all languages (since it doesn't ask, like it does here, let's say that he usually holds etc.)

Tosfos answers: the Gemara there is trying to establish the Halacha according to everyone. (You don't need a Pasuk to say it in Hebrew according to the one who usually holds that it's said in Hebrew. Nor do you need a Pasuk that it's said in all languages if that's the law usually). However, even the one who says that it's usually said in all language can hold here that you need a Pasuk to say this is only in Hebrew. Also, to the one who says it's usually in Hebrew, you need a

Pasuk to say here it can be said in all languages.

How do we know that Tefila can't be Davened backwards? As we learned: Shimon Hapikuli composed the eighteen Brachos before R' Gamliel in order in Yavneh. R' Yochanan, or a Braisa, says; with one hundred and twenty elders, and among them were many prophets, they enacted the eighteen Brachos in order.

Tosfos says: this Gemara is difficult to what Rashi says in Brachos to explain "the middle Brachos don't have an order" that; if you forgot a middle Bracha, you may insert it when you remember it, and then finish the Tefila from where you left off. After all, if so, you're saying it backwards, and we say here that Shimon Hapikuli enacted to say it in order.

Rather, Tosfos explains "the middle Brachos don't have an order": that they're not like the first and last Brachos, that if you make a mistake in one of them, you need to start at the beginning of the three Brachos set. However, the middle Brachos, you only go back to the one you made a mistake in and you finish from that Bracha on in the proper order. However, if the Chazon forgets to say Aneinu by a fast day, he never goes back once he passed its place (since you're Yoitza without saying it, and you'll need to repeat all the Brachos that are after it that you already said, and the first time you made those Brachos will be L'vatala). We also say, by Megila, since you missed one Pasuk, you need to go back to that Pasuk and read from there and on (in order).

New Sugya

We learned: how do we know that we say in Davening the Bracha of Avos? As the Pasuk says "ascribe to You, Hashem, the children of might." How do we know we say Gevuros (Mechayei Hameisim)? As the Pasuk says "ascribe for Hashem his honor for His name and power." How do we know to say Kodosh? As the Pasuk says "ascribe to Hashem the honor of His name. Bow to him to the beauty of his holiness." Why do we say a Bracha for understanding? As the Pasuk says "they shall sanctify the Holy One of Yaakov, and we'll stand in awe of the G-d of Yisrael." Right afterwards, it says; "The mistaken souls will know understanding."

Why do we say a Bracha of repentance after understanding? Since the Pasuk says "his heart will understand and he'll return and be healed." The Gemara asks: if so, we should say the Bracha of healing after repentance. The Gemara answers, we shouldn't think so, since the Pasuk says "they'll return to Hashem, and He'll have mercy on them, and to Hashem because He has a lot of forgiveness." The Gemara asks; why do you rely on this Pasuk (that places forgiveness next to returning), rely on the other one (that places healing next to repentance)? The Gemara answers: because another Pasuk says "you forgive all my sins, you heal all my sicknesses, you redeem from death to life." The Gemara asks: does this mean to say that redemption and healing is after forgiveness? But doesn't the Pasuk say "he'll return and be healed?" The Gemara answers: that's not healing from physical ailments, but healing by forgiveness (of sins).

The Gemara asks: why did they see to have redemption as the seventh Bracha? Rava answers: since we'll eventually be redeemed during Shevious. The Gemara asks: we learned; that sixth year will be la lot of noise. The seventh year will have wars, and Moshiach will come on Moitzie Shvius. The Gemara answers: the war is also the beginning of Moshiach's coming.

The Gemara asks: why did they decide to have healing for the eighth Bracha? R' Acha says: since Mila is given to be done on the eighth day, and it needs healing. Therefore, they put this Bracha to be the

eighth.

The Gemara asks: why did they established Parnasah for the ninth Bracha? R' Alexandri says: because of those (who hoard produce) and make the prices to go up, that the Pasuk said on them "break the arms of the wicked," and Dovid said it in the ninth Mizmor.

Tosfos quotes Rashi: although it's really in the eighth Mizmar, however, (what we consider to be the first Mizmar is really two) since Ashrei Ha'ish and Lamah Rugshu are two separate Mizmorim.

However, Tosfos asks: the Gemara in Brachos considers it to be one Mizmor, as it says that every Mizmor that was particularly dear to Dovid started with Ashrei and ended with Ashrei, like the first one that starts with "Ashrei Ha'Ish" and ends with "Ashrei Kol Hachosem Bo," which is the end of the Mizmor of "Lama Ragshu."

Rather, Tosfos answers: we need to say that "Lamnatzei'ach Al Mos" and "Lama Hashem Tamod B'ruchok" are really two (and are the eighth and ninth Mizmorim respectively).

The Gemara asks: why did they enact a Bracha for gathering the Jews from exile after the Bracha for Parnasa? The Gemara answers: since it says "and you, the mountain of the Jews, give out your branches that will take out fruit for my nation, Yisrael, so they're close to come." After the gathering of the exile, they'll judge the wicked, as the Pasuk says "I will bring back my hand upon you and I will purge your dirt with lye," and then it says "I will return your judges like I used to." Once judgment is done to the wicked, the sinners, (whether if he does it in spite, or on purpose because of desire), as the Pasuk says; "you break the spite and purposeful sinner together." Once the sinners are gone, the "horn of the righteous" can be lifted. As the Pasuk says "all the horns of the wicked get chopped down, and it will lift the horn of the righteous." It will include the righteous convert with the righteous. As the Pasuk says "you shall stand before elders, and you shall honor the face of the old" and right next to it, it says "when a convert lives among you." Where will the horn be lifted? in Yerushalayim. As the Pasuk says "pray for the peace of Yerushalayim, may they prosper and love You."