

Daf Hashvua:Gemara and Tosfos
By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz
Megila Daf 18
Learntosfos.com

Daf 18a

Once Yerushalayim is built, Dovid comes, as it says: "After the return of the Jews, and they search for Hashem and for Dovid their king." Once Dovid comes, then you have Tefila; as it says "I will bring you to my holy mountain and you will be happy in the house of my prayer." Once Tefila came, then there will be service (in the Mikdash), as the Pasuk continues: "their Olos and Zevachim will be brought to My satisfaction on My Mizbeiach." Once their is service in the Mikdash there will be thanks; as the Pasuk says "they'll honor Me with a thankful Korban." What made it seem fit to enact saying Birchas Kohanim after thanksgiving? As the Pasuk says "Ahron lifted his hands towards the nation and blessed them; he went down from bringing the Chatos, Olah and Shlomim." The Gemara asks: perhaps he blessed before the service (and not afterwards)? The Gemara answers: we shouldn't think that. After all, it says that he was going down from doing the service and not to do the service. The Gemara asks: let him say Birchas Kohanim directly after the Avoda (Ritzei)? The Gemara answers: because we had the Pasuk earlier "they'll honor Me with a thankful Korban," that it should be after thanksgiving. The Gemara asks: why do you chose this Hekish more than the one to Birchas Kohanim? The Gemara answers: since Avoda and thanksgiving is one concept (since thanking Hashem is a service to him). What did they see to place Sim Shalom after Birchos Kohanim? As the Pasuk says "I will place My name on the Jews, and I'll bless them," and Hashem's blessing is for peace, as the Pasuk says "Hashem blesses His nation with peace."

The Gemara asks: after a hundred and twenty elders, and among them many prophets, composed Tefila in order, what did Shimon Hapikuli compose? The Gemara answers: the composition was forgotten and he needed to reconstruct it.

The Gemara continues: after this point, it's forbidden to add onto the praises of Hashem, as the Pasuk says: "who will say the greatness of Hashem? He who can hear all of His praises." I.e., who is it nice for him to say Hashem's praises? He who can understand all his praises. (Since nobody can do it, you shouldn't continue.)

Rabbah b. b. Chana quotes R' Yochanan: if anyone overly speaks the praises of Hashem, he will be uprooted from the world. As the Pasuk says "shall it be told to him that I will speak? If someone will say, he would be swallowed up." R' Yehuda from the village Guvraya (or Gibur Chayil) says: what does the Pasuk mean by "for you, silence is praise." The best medicine is silence. When R' Dimi came from Eretz Yisrael, he said: if words are sold for a Selah, silence will be worth two (Selayim).

New Sugya

The Gemara asks: how do we know that you're not Yoitza if you read it by heart? Rava says: we learn a Gezeira Shava "Zechira, Zechira." It says by us "these days that you remember," and it says there (by remembering Amaleik) "this is the remembering in the Sefer." Just

like there you need to read it in a Sefer, so too here, by Megila, you need to read it inside a Sefer. The Gemara asks: how do we know that the 'remembering' by Amaleik is reading? Perhaps it's only thinking about it. The Gemara answers; we can't think that! After all, we learned: it says 'remember.' I might say it means by heart; however, when the Pasuk says "don't forget," from there I would know that you must remember (at least) by thinking in your heart. What does the Pasuk mean by adding 'remember?' To remember it by reading.

New Sugya

The Mishna says that you're not Yoitza if you read the Targum. The Gemara asks: what's the case? If it's written regularly (in Hebrew) and he said it in Targum, then he wouldn't be Yoitza anyhow since he said it by heart (because he didn't read words that were written in the Sefer). The Gemara answers: we refer to a case where the Megila is written in Targum and he read it (the way it was written) in Targum.

New Sugya

The Mishna says: if you read to a foreign-language speaking people in their language, they're Yoitza. The Gemara asks: the beginning of the Mishna says that you're not Yoitza if you read it in any language. Rav and Shmuel reconciles: he's only Yoitza if he reads it in Greek. The Gemara asks: what's the case? If it's written regularly (in Hebrew) and he said it in Greek, then he wouldn't be Yoitza anyhow since he said it by heart (because he didn't read words that were written in the Sefer). R' Acha in the name of R' Eliezer answers: we refer to a case where the Megila is written in Greek and he read it (the way it was written) in Greek.

(R' Acha in the name of R' Eliezer also says: how do we know that Hashem called Yaakov 'El?' As it says ""he called it El Elokai Yisrael." If it means to say that this is what Yaakov called the Mizbeach, then the Pasuk should have worded it "Yaakov called it El." Therefore, we must say that "He called Yaakov El." Who called him that? "Elokai Yisrael," i.e., Hashem.

Tosfos is bothered by the question: It says also "he called its name Hashem is my miracle." Also, it says: "he called it Hashem is my peace." The Targum explains that this is they're prayer, (and not that they were called Hashem).

Tosfos answers: over there, the Mizbeach was called that because of a miracle that happened and the peace that happened. However, here, there was no action that Yaakov would call the Mizbeach 'El.' Therefore, if Yaakov was calling the Mizbeach 'El,' the Pasuk should have explicitly say that he was the one who was calling it.)

(Returning to our Sugya), the Gemara asks: we learned: if you read it in the following languages: Giftis, Ivris, Ilmis, Madyis and Greek, you're not Yoitza. (So, you're not Yoitza even in Greek.) Rather, we must compare the Mishna to the end of the Braisa: if you read Giftis to a Giftis-speaking person. Ivris to Ivrim. Ilmis to Ilmim, Greek to Greeks, you're Yoitza. The Gemara asks; if so, why did Rav and Shmuel establish our Mishna only by Greek? They should have established it to refer to all languages. The Gemara answers: really the Mishna is exactly like the Braisa, and Rav and Shmuel wasn't commenting on the Mishna, but saying their own statement: that if you read Greek to anyone, they're Yoitza. The Gemara asks: didn't we learn that you're only

Yoitza if you read Greek to Greeks? The Gemara answers: Rav and Shmuel hold like R' Shimon b. Gamliel. As we learned: R' Shimon b. Gamliel says they didn't allow writing Sefarim in other languages besides Greek. The Gemara asks: if so, just say that the Halacha is like R' Shimon b. Gamliel? The Gemara answers: if they would only say that the Halacha is like R' Shimon b. Gamliel, I might say it's only by other Sefarim and not by Megila since it says "like it's writing" (I would say it's only can be in the original way it's written), so, we're taught otherwise.

New Sugya

The Mishna says that you can read for a foreign-language speaker in Hebrew and he'll be Yoitza. The Gemara asks: but he doesn't know what they're saying, (so how can he be Yoitza?) The Gemara answers: (it's obvious that you don't need to know what they're saying), since they're no worse than women and ignoramuses (who are Yoitza though they don't know Hebrew). Raveina asks: (how can you have a thought that you're not Yoitza if you don't know all the words of the Megila?) After all, do we know what Achashtranim Bnei Remachim mean? Rather, we have a Mitzvah to read, and we need to publicize the miracle, (and if you don't know what was read, you can ask your friend). We can say the same by all people who don't understand Hebrew.

New Sugya

The Mishna says: if you read it Serugin (a little at a time), you're Yoitza. The rabbis didn't know what 'Sirugin' means. When they heard Rebbi's maid say, when the students were coming in a few people at a time, "why are the rabbis coming in Serugin, Serugin." (So they figured out what it means.)

The Rabanan didn't know what was 'Chaluglogos.' They heard Rebbi's maid say, when she saw a man that was scattering this vegetable that they called 'Parpechina,' "until when will you continue to scatter your 'Chaluglogos.'"

The Rabanan didn't know the meaning of the Pasuk " 'Salsela' and I will lift up. One day, Rebbi's maid said to a person who was turning his hair, "until when will you continue to M'salsel' your hair."

The Rabanan didn't know the meaning of the Pasuk "throw on Hashem your 'Hav' and He'll sustain you." Rabbah b. b. Chana said: I once was traveling with this Arab merchant. I was carrying a load, and he told me "take your 'Hav' and put it on my camel.

The Rabanan didn't know the meaning of the Pasuk " 'Tatasey with a 'Mtatah' of destruction." One day, Rebbi's maid said to a friend " 'Tatai' (sweep) the house.

Daf 18b

New Sugya

We learned: if you read it a little at a time, you're Yoitza. If you read it backwards, you're not Yoitza. R' Mona quotes R' Yehuda: even if you read it a little at a time, if you wait in the middle for enough time to finish reading the Megila, you need to return to the beginning. R' Yosef says the Halacha is like R' Mona quoting R' Yehuda. Abaya asked R' Yosef: does he mean from

where you're up to until the end, or from the beginning to end? R' Yosef answers: from the beginning to end, or else you're giving many amounts for this (and the Chachumim always give a definitive Shiur).

R' Abba quoting R' Yirmiya b. Abba quoting Rav says: the Halacha is like R' Mona. Shmuel says that the Halacha is not like R' Mona. This is how Sura taught it, but Pumbedeisa has the version; R' Kahana quoting Rav says: the Halacha is like R' Mona. Shmuel says that the Halacha is not like R' Mona. R' Bibi taught the opposite. Rav says: the Halacha is not like R' Mona. Shmuel says that the Halacha is like R' Mona. R' Yosef says to take R' Bibi's version as correct since we know that Shmuel is the one who takes a singular opinion into account. As we see that R' Yehuda b. Bava says that if you have a Shomeres Yavam (a woman who's husband died without children and she's in line to get Yibum or Chalitza) who's sister received Kiddushin from one of her husband's brothers; the brother needs to wait to make Nessuin and take her to live with him until another brother does an action (Yibum or Chalitza). (However, before that, he's still considered somewhat attached to the Shomeres Yavam, and he can't marry the sister of someone who he's attached to, since it's similar to marrying a wife's sister.)

Tosfos says that this only applies when he made Kiddushin, so we say to wait to do Nesuin (until his brother exempts the Yavama) since she's only an Arusa, and not a full wife, it will look as if he's marrying his Yavama's sister. However, if he already made Nesuin, she's fully his wife and you don't need to wait at all, since the attachment to the Yavama completely falls off. This also only applies if the Kiddushin took place after the Yavama fell to him (i.e., after the first brother died, and he has an attachment already to the Yavama). However, if he made Kiddushin before the brother died, then he doesn't need to wait at all, since the sister was never attached to him. The reason for R' Yehuda was because he held there is a Halachic attachment, (i.e, she becomes a quasi wife), between the Yavama and the brother. (However, the Rabanan held there is no Halachic attachment, and she never was considered to be anything of a wife, so, when he marries her sister, it doesn't look like he's marrying his wife's sister.)

Shmuel says: the Halacha is like R' Yehuda b. Beseira.

Tosfos says: the Halacha is that we don't need to go back to the beginning, since the Halacha is like Rav, (when he argues with Shmuel) in non-monetary Halachos, who Paskins that way. Especially when R' Yochanan in Mesechta Rosh Hashana holds like him. As he says that, if you hear nine Shofar blows in nine hours, you're Yoitza. The Gemara concludes that there is a Braisa like him. Also, it asks that R' Yochanan quotes R' Simon b. Yehotzodok that, if you wait for enough time that it takes to finish the whole thing, you need to return to the beginning. The Gemara answers: that's only quoting his Rebbi's opinion, but he holds not like that. Therefore, since there is a Brasia like him, it's a proof that the Halacha is like him. On this, the Ri relied on (when he didn't start Shemona Esrei with the Tzibor), to wait in the Bracha of Emes V'yatziv so he can say with the Tzibor Kedusha, Barichu and Yehei Shmei Rabbah.

New Sugya

We learned: If the scribe left out some letters or P'sukim, and he read it like the one who reads Targum (i.e., by heart), he's Yoitza. The Gemara asks: if the letters are rubbed out, or ripped; if you can make out the words he's Yoitza. If not, he's not Yoitza. (So, you're not Yoitza if you don't read it in a Megila.) The Gemara answers: you're only Yoitza if you read some of it by heart, but not all of it.

We learned: if the reader skipped a Pasuk, he shouldn't say he'll finish the Megila and go back to that Pasuk, but rather, he should read from that Pasuk and on. If someone enters a Shul and they're in middle of reading the Megila, he can't say that he'll hear half of it with the congregation and then read the first half later by himself. Rather, he must read it from beginning to end.

New Sugya

If he reads when drifting to sleep (Misnamnam) he's Yoitza. The Gemara asks: how is this? He's asleep, but not really asleep. He's awake, but not really awake. you call him and he answers you. He can't explain any logic, but if you remind him of a logical idea, he will remember it.

New Sugya

The Mishna says: If you read while you write a Megila, you're Yoitza if you had intent. The Gemara asks: what's the case? If he's preparing the Pasuk to write by saying it, and then he wrote it, why would he be Yoitza even with intent? After all, he's reading it by heart. Rather, he's writing the Pasuk and then reading it. The Gemara asks: still, how can he be Yoitza? After all, Rav says that the Halacha is like the one who says you must read the whole Megila. Also, even according to the one who holds that you may read it from "Ish Yehudi," he needs the Megila to be completely written before him. Rather, the Gemara answers: we refer to a case where he has a fully written Megila before him and he reads the Pasuk in it before he writes it in the new Megila. The Gemara suggests; perhaps this will be a proof to R' Yochanan who says that you can't write one letter without seeing it first written down. The Gemara rejects the proof; perhaps, it happened that the Sofar had it, (but it's not necessary).

New Sugya

We learned: R' Yochanan says that you can't write one letter without seeing it first written down. The Gemara asks; we learned in a Braisa R' Shimon b. Elazar says that there was a story with R' Meir who went to make a leap year in Asya; but the town didn't possess a Megila. So, he wrote the Megila by heart and read it. R' Avohu answers: R' Meir is different since he was a fulfilment of the Pasuk "your eyelids will see straight before you." As Rami b. Chama asked R' Yirmiya from Difs; what does it mean by "your eyelids will see straight before you?" He answered: this refers to Torah, where the Pasuk says "you direct your eyes by it, and it's gone.' Yet, to R' Meir, it was straight before it (i.e., he was a great expert in the Torah, so, he doesn't need to copy from what's already written).

The Gemara brings a case not like this: R' Chisda met R' Chananel who was writing Sefarim without another Sefer before him. R' Chisda says: even though the whole Torah could be written from your mouth (since he knows the whole Torah by heart), yet, the rabbis says not to

write even one letter without seeing it written in a Sefer. So, even though he said "the whole Torah could be written from your mouth" which would be included in the Pasuk "your eyelids will see straight before you," yet, he's not allowed to write it without a written Sefer. The Gemara asks: didn't R' Meir write it without a Sefer? The Gemara answers: it was a time of need (since there was no written Megila available).

Abaya allowed writing Tefilin and Mezuzos without looking in another one. This is like the following Tanna: R' Yirmiya says that Tefilin and Mezuzos can be written from a Sefer and they don't need to have a scratch under the words. However, we Paskin that Tefilin don't need a scratch, [**Tosfos quotes R' Tam: this is the true Halacha**], but Mezuzos do need a scratch. However, both don't need to be written when looking in a written one since everyone is very familiar with it.