

Daf Hashvuah Halacha Gemara and Tosfos Taanis Daf 18

By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz

limudtorah.onlinewebshop.net

Subscribe free: tosfosproject@gmail.com

From the eighth day until the end of Peasach, they enacted, because of winning the dispute of scheduling the Yom Tov of Shvuos, not to eulogize on them. The Gemara asks: why did they enact from Rosh Chodesh? They should have only enacted from the second day of Nissan since Rosh Chodesh itself is a Yom Tov when it's forbidden (to fast and eulogize).

Rav answers: it's only needed to forbid the day before. The Gemara asks: the day before is anyhow forbidden for being the day before Rosh Chodesh. The Gemara answers: Rosh Chodesh is from the Torah, and Torah law doesn't need any extra support (to enact a prohibition for the day before). As we learned in a Braisa: they enacted to forbid the day before and the day after of the days written in Megilas Taanis. However, it's only forbidden on Shabbos and Yom Tov itself, but the day before and the day after are permitted. What's the difference between the two? Those (Shabbos and Yom Tov) are from the Torah, and Torah laws don't need extra support, and the others (Megilas Taanis) are rabbinic, and you need to give extra support for rabbinic laws.

When we said that they enacted not to eulogize from the eighth of Nissan until after Pesach, why not just enact until Pesach? After all, (they don't need to enact for Pesach) since it's a Yom Tov and is forbidden anyway?

Daf 18a

R' Pappa answers: like Rav said (regarding the earlier question), it's not necessary but to forbid the day before. Therefore, we can use a similar answer here, that we only coming to forbid the day afterwards.

The Gemara asks: who is this like? It's obviously like R' Yossi who forbids both the day before and the day afterwards. If so, then why must we say that the twenty-ninth day is forbidden because it's the day before the Yom Tov of establishing the Halachos of the Tamid? We should have said it's anyhow forbidden because it's the day after the Yom Tov of the twenty-eighth. As we learned (in Megilas Taanis it says) on the twenty-eighth (of Adar) a good tiding came to the Jews, that they don't need to break away from the Torah. After all, there was the king's decree that Jews shouldn't learn Torah and not to give their sons Milah and that they should desecrate Shabbos. What did Yehuda b. Shamua and his colleagues do? They took counsel from a certain noblewoman who the greatest Romans were always by her. She advised them to scream out (their plight) by night (when all the noblemen will hear and should take pity on them). They went to scream out at night "For G-d sakes, we're not brothers and we don't come from the same father or mother..

Tosfos says: the text should read "where is heaven." i.e., to Hashem they called out "why should the nations say where is your G-d." Then they said to them (the Romans) "we're not brothers etc."

Why are we chosen from all other people to be discriminated with harsh decrees?" Eventually, they canceled those decrees. On that day, they made a Yom Tov.

Abaya answers: we only need it for an expanded month (that it was made into a thirty day month, to forbid the thirtieth day, which would be the day before Rosh Chodesh).

Tosfos explains: they made Adar longer, since they didn't see the moon until (the end of) day thirty, so Rosh Chodesh was the thirty-first. Therefore, we couldn't forbid the twenty-ninth for being the day before Rosh Chodesh, since the thirtieth day separates them. Therefore, we need to forbid it for being the day after the twenty-eighth.

R' Ashi answers: even if we refer to a shorter month, we still need it. After all, when we forbid the day afterwards, that's only regarding fasting, but you could eulogize. However, now that the twenty-ninth is sandwiched between two Yomim Tovim, they gave it a status as a Yom Tov itself and forbid eulogies.

We already learned: from the eighth (of Nisnon) until after Pesach, they enacted not to eulogize because of the establishing the date for the Yom Tov of Shvuos. The Gemara asks: why does the Gemara need to say from the eighth? After all, they only needed to enact from the ninth, since the eighth was anyhow forbidden since it was part of the Yom Tov of establishing the Halachos of the Tamid.

The Gemara answers: (the reason why it's necessary to enact it for both Yom Tovs), for, if something happens that we would cancel the first Yom Tov, we would only cancel the first seven days, but the eighth day would still be forbidden since it was the first day of the Yom Tov of establishing the day of Shvuos.

Tosfos quotes Rashi: we should still say that the Yom Tov starts from the ninth. So, even if there is some enactment to cancel the first seven days (of Nissan) from being a Yom Tov, still, you wouldn't be able to fast on the eighth since it's the day before the ninth, where they won the argument when to establish Shvuos.

Rashi answers: this is not difficult. If they would cancel it from being a Yom Tov of winning the argument over the Tamid and allow fasting, we wouldn't say that it's forbidden to fast because it's the day before the Yom Tov of establishing the day of Shvuos. This is similar to the answer the Gemara gives later by the day of Turiynus.

The Gemara concludes: once we came on to that last answer, we can answer (why we need two Yom Tovim next to) the twenty-ninth (of Adar, and we don't say it's anyhow forbidden being next to the other) since, if they would cancel the twenty-eighth day Yom Tov, we would still forbid the twenty-ninth for being the day before the Yom Tov of establishing the Halachos of the Tamid.

New Sugya

R' Chiya b. Assi quotes Rav that the Halacha is like R' Yossi, and Shmuel says that the Halacha is like R' Meir. The Gemara asks: does Shmuel really hold this way? After all, the Braisa says that R' Shimon b. Gamliel says; the Braisa of Megilas Taanis says (forbidding eulogizing) “on them” twice. This implies that it's only forbidden on those days and not on the day before and the day after. Shmuel says that the Halacha is like R' Shimon b. Gamliel. (Therefore, how can we quote him to Paskin like R' Meir who sometimes forbids the day before?)

The Gemara answers: (he held that you should always take the most lenient opinion in these Halachas.) Therefore, he originally thought that there is no Tanna who was more lenient than R' Meir, so he Paskined like R' Meir. However, once he heard R' Shimon b. Gamliel's opinion who was more lenient, he said that the Halacha is like R' Shimon b. Gamliel.

Also, Bali quotes R' Chiya b. Abba that R' Yochanan Paskins like R' Yossi. R' Chiya told Bali that R' Yochanan only Paskined like R' Yossi on those days that you don't fast (that you can't fast the day before either. However, the Halacha is not like him that the day after is forbidden for days that you can't eulogize.)

Tosfos asks: once we say that the Halacha is like R' Yossi (that you can't fast before a Yom Tov), how do we fast the day before Purim? Although we canceled Megilas Taanis in general (after the Churban), but we didn't cancel Purim and Chanuka.

Tosfos answers: although we said they didn't cancel Chanuka and Purim, that's only to make themselves a Yom Tov, but they canceled the prohibition to fast the day before.

Alternatively, since they canceled the Yom Tov that was held the day before Purim, we say that they canceled it from being forbidden from being the day before Purim. As we say later regarding the day before Yom Niknar and Yom Tov of Turinos. Once they canceled them from being a Yom Tov for themselves, they canceled it from the prohibition of being the day before. Therefore, the same here, if they canceled the day before Purim from being a Yom Tov, it shouldn't be forbidden for being the day before Purim.

The Gemara asks: does R' Yochanan really say this? After all he always Paskins like an unnamed Mishna, and we learned in Megila; although we say (that they can read earlier), they're permitted to fast and to eulogize.

Daf 18b

If we refer to a person (who lives in a walled-city) that should read on the fifteenth, and he (went to a unwalled city and) read on the fourteenth, would that allow him to fast on the fourteenth? After all, we learned in Megilas Taanis: the fourteenth and fifteenth are days of Purim that you can't eulogize. Rava explains (that it doesn't need to say that it's forbidden on the day that you celebrate Purim, since that's definitely a Yom Tov.) It's only needed to forbid those who keep the fourteenth to be forbidden to fast and eulogize on the fifteenth, and vice versa.

Rather, we must refer to a case where he lives where you keep the fourteenth (but you visited a village) and heard the Megila on the thirteenth. The Gemara asks: however, since it's a Yom Tov (of the day of Niknor), how can you fast then? Rather, we must refer to a case where he lives where you keep the fourteenth (but you visited a village) and heard the Megila on the twelfth. The Gemara asks: it's the Yom Tov of Turinus, (so, how can you fast?)

Rather, we must refer to a case where he lives where you keep the fourteenth (but you visited a village) and heard the Megila on the eleventh, and yet it says that it's permitted to fast and eulogize; (and we don't say that it's forbidden to fast the day before the Yom Tov of Turinus like R' Yossi, so this unnamed Mishna is not like R' Yossi.)

The Gemara answers, really we refer to a case where he lives where you keep the fourteenth (but you visited a village) and heard the Megila on the twelfth. If you're going to say that it's forbidden since it's the Yom Tov of Turinus, but that Yom Tov was anyhow canceled because of the murder of Shmaya and Achiya, his brother. As we see that R' Nachman decreed a fast on the twelfth. The Rabanan asked how can you? After all it's the Yom Tov of Turinus, He answered: that Yom Tov was anyhow canceled because of the murder of Shmaya and Achiya, his brother.

The Gemara asks: we should assume it's forbidden anyhow since it's the day before the Yom Tov of Niknor. R' Ashi answers: once we cancel its own Yom Tov, will we enact a prohibition to forbid fasting for being the day before Niknor?

.....

New Sugya

We learned in the Mishna that we don't decree fasts on Rosh Chodesh, but if you already started to fast (and during that series, it comes out Rosh Chodesh) you fast, but you don't finish the day without eating. The Gemara inquires: what's considered starting? R' Acha says three fasts and R' Assi says even with one fast.

R' Yehuda quotes Rav: this is R' Meir's opinion who quoted R' Gamliel. However, the Chachumim say to finish the fast. Mar Zutra Darshined in the name R' Huna: the Halcha is that you must finish the fast.

Tosfos explains: we only Paskin to finish fasting by Rosh Chodesh. However, you can't fast at all on Chanuka and Purim since they're days of feasts and drink

End of Perek