

Daf Hashvuah Gemara and Tosfos Rosh Hashana Daf 8
By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz
limudtorah.onlinewebshop.net
Subscribe free or Contact: tosfosproject@gmail.com

Daf 8a

The Gemara asks: but Yovel is listed (and it depends on an action of blowing the Shofar). The Gemara answers: our Mishna's author is R' Yishmael the son of Yochanan b. Broka (that Yovel starts automatically at the beginning of Rosh Hashana).

Tosfos asks: what's the Gemara's assumption (that Yovel is a difficulty)? After all, the Mishna can't be established but like R' Yishmael the son of R' Yochanan b. Broka, as we'll say later.

R Ashi answers: the Mishna should be read "there are four Rosh Hashanos that fall on the four Rosh Chodeshim." The Gemara asks: the Mishna lists the first of Shvat as one of the Rosh Chodeshim, and that would make it like Beis Shammai. **(Tosfos says to read this as a question [i.e., how can you establish the Mishna Like Beis Shammai who we never Paskin like.]**) The Gemara answers: this is the way it should be read; three of those Rosh Chadashim is held universally, and (the fourth one), the first of Shvat, depends on an argument between Beis Shammai and Beis Hillel.

Tosfos points out that we can't establish the Mishna like R' Shimon, since he doesn't hold that the first of Elul is a Rosh Hashana (so you won't have four months). Rather, we must say it's R' Meir. However, we still need to say (as we said earlier) that Rabbi composed the Mishna according to an argument of Tannaim (so, it can't be completely R' Meir). After all, we count (Nissan to be the Rosh Hashana) for festivals (regarding the order for Baal T'achar), that can't be R' Meir (who holds you're transgressing by passing any one festival).

New Sugya

The Mishna brings an argument whether Rosh Hashana for Maasar Behaima is on the first of Elul or the first of Tishrei. R' Yochanan says that they both learn their opinions from the same Pasuk. "the flocks wear 'bedding,' (i.e., become pregnant)....."

[Tosfos brings the Targum to explain: the rams went onto the ewes. The Pasuk (writing it as a euphemism) is phrasing it in a clean way. Rashi, later, explains: this, that R' Yehoshua holds that the world was created in Nissan; we say that it's the time where domestic and wild animals mate (like the Targum). However, he doesn't explain it that way here. (He explains "the wearing" as becoming pregnant.)]

.....the valleys are covered with grain; they shout out and they sing." R' Meir says: when do the animals become pregnant; when the valley's covered in grain. It's covered during Adar. Thus, they get pregnant during Adar and give birth during Av. Therefore, the Rosh Hashana is (right after that) which is Elul. However, R' Elazar and R' Shimon say, when do they become pregnant; when the grain sing (i.e., when it's large enough to knock against each other in the wind, making sounds as if they're singing). That is during Nissan. Therefore, they get pregnant during Nissan and give birth in Elul, so the Rosh Hashana is right afterwards, on Tishrei.

The Gemara asks: according to the other opinion (i.e., R' Meir), it says that it sings (so why didn't

you learn that they get pregnant when they sing i.e., in Nissan?) The Gemara answers: that refers only to the later ones that get pregnant in Nissan, (but the average sheep is pregnant by Adar.)

The Gemara asks: according to the other opinion (i.e., R' Elazar and R' Shimon), it says that it covers the valley (so why didn't you learn that they get pregnant when it covers the valley i.e., in Adar?) The Gemara answers: that only refers to the early ones that get pregnant in Adar, (but the average sheep is pregnant by Nissan.)

The Gemara asks: I understand it according to R' Meir, since the Pasuk is read that they get pregnant by when the valley is covered (Adar), and some even get when they sing (Nissan). However, according to R' Elazar and R' Shimon, (since the main time is Nissan) the Pasuk should have listed them in the opposite order. They become pregnant when they sing and also there are some when the grain covers the valley.

Rather, Rav says: everyone holds that they become pregnant when the valley is covered with grain, i.e., Adar. However, they argue about the following Pasuk. "Asser Taaser" (you should certainly take off Maasar). [Since it's written in a double Lashon], it refers to two types of Maasar, one on animals and one on grains. R' Meir holds that we make a Hekish between them. Just like the Maasar of grains that its Rosh Hashana is right after its finishing (i.e., Tishrei, since they had it dry in the fields all summer),.....

Tosfos is bothered by the question: it becomes fit to take Maasar off grain and olives when it grows a third, so the Maasar comes before their finishing.

Tosfos answers: it's not normal to harvest them until they're completely finished. (So, practically Maasar wouldn't be taken until it's finished.)

.....so too the Rosh Hashana of animals is next to when its finished. (I.e., its born in Av, so its Rosh Hashana is Elul.)

However, R' Elazar and R' Shimon hold that we make a Hekish between the Maasar of grain and animals a different way. Just as the Rosh Hashana of grain Maasar is Tishrei, so is the Rosh Hashana of Maasar Behaima is also Tishrei.

Tosfos explains how do we know that the Rosh Hashana of grain Maasar is Tishri: as we learned in our Mishna that it's the Rosh Hashana for vegetables, where we learn later on, it refers to Maasar.

However, Tosfos is bothered by the question: where is the Torah source for this? Tosfos answers: perhaps they learn it from "take Maasar from all your grain that comes out of the field, year after year." We'll learn a Gezeira Shava that it means Tishrei from "the beginning of the year," as we'll learn such a Gezeria Shava later regarding Shmita.

Alternatively, the reason is as Rashi explains in Kesuvos. As it says that the Jews were not obligated in Maasar until they started to count Shmita. Thus, the Torah made Maasar dependent on Shmita. So, we see Shmita's Rosh Hashana is Tishrei, (so, logic dictates that Maasar's Rosh Hashana should be then too).

New Sugya

The Mishna says that Tishrei is the Rosh Hashana for 'years.' The Gemara asks: regarding which

Halacha? R' Pappa says: regarding documents. As we learned that an earlier dated document is invalid, but a later dated document is valid. The Gemara asks: didn't we say that the first of Nissan is the Rosh Hashana for kings, and we ask there; regarding which Halacha is it considered its Rosh Hashana and R' Chisda answered; regarding documents. (So, is Rosh Hashana for documents Nissan or Tishrei?) The Gemara reconciles: it's not a difficulty. One is by Jewish kings (Nissan) and one is by non-Jewish kings (Tishrei).

The Gemara asks: is R' Chisda (who differentiates between Jewish and non-Jewish kings) teaching us the Halacha of the Mishna (without a Chidush? After all, this is the simple explanation to reconcile the Mishna, so, it's not a Chidush.) The Gemara answers: he comes to explain the P'sukim (that we brought before, how we know we count each one by their Rosh Hashana). Alternatively, he learns our Mishna like R' Zeira.

Tosfos explains: who learns the Mishna refers to the seasons. However, Tosfos is bothered why didn't the Mishna refer to being the Rosh Hashana for non-Jewish kings?

Tosfos answers: the Mishna was not referring to items that apply to non-Jews.

As R' Zeira says; this Halacha (that it's Rosh Hashana for years) is regarding the seasons. This is as R' Eliezer says that the world was created in Tishrei. (Therefore, we calculate the yearly seasons and the lunar calendar from Tishrei.) [Therefore, since the Mishna doesn't refer to documents for non-Jewish kings that needs a reconciliation, so R' Chisda is teaching us his own Chidush differentiating in that fashion]

Tosfos explains: we count the Molad of the moon and the seasons from the first day of Tishrei. However, R' Yehoshua holds that we count those from Nissan. There is a big difference in calculations if we would start the count a half of year earlier.

This, that we Paskin in Eirubin that the Nissan season always falls out on the quarters of the day, i.e., either the beginning of the day (or the beginning of the night, or by midday or by midnight). This is according to R' Yehoshua, as this Braisa that supports Shmuel (there) holds like R' Yehoshua.

[The explanation to the above: the amount of time between one season and the other is 91 days and $7\frac{1}{2}$ hours. Times it by the four seasons and you'll get $365\frac{1}{4}$ days. Therefore, each season will be six hours later than it was the previous year. Therefore, since the sun and moon was hung at the beginning of the fourth night (Tuesday night), therefore, it's start will always be on the quarter of the day slots. However, Tishrei that started 182 days and fifteen hours after that first Nissan, started at "9 o'clock," will always be on the "six hours" cycle from then, i.e., either at 9 o'clock or 3 o'clock, day and night. However, according to R' Eliezer, it would be the opposite, that Tishrei will always fall either at the beginning of the day or the beginning of the night, or by midday or by midnight, and Nissan would always be at 3 or 9 o'clock.]

Really, R' Eliezer says the world was created on the twenty-fifth of Elul and R' Yehoshua on the twenty-fifth of Adar. Therefore, when Adam was created on the sixth day, (it was Rosh Chodesh) and he made Kiddush Hachodesh.

With this you can explain why, after making all the calculations working back to creation, that it's missing 7 days 9 hours and 642 Chalakim (there are 1080 Chalakim in an hour). The prevalent answer is because, the moon was in 'Cherem' when it made its claim (when he tried to

make the sun smaller), so it was in Cherem that amount. However, we never find any source for that.

Rather, the reason is: those who count from creation don't count Rosh Hashana until the sixth day that Adom was created. We see Adom was commanded about his Mitzvos in the 9th hour of the day (which is the 21st hour from the beginning of the sixth night) as it says in Sanhedrin. It's logical to say that he made Kiddush of the month then. We must say that the Molad happened six hours earlier, as we'll say later, the moon is covered (i.e., invisible) for six hours. It comes out, that the Molad was at the fifteenth hour of the day, which was a third of the daytime (four hours into the daytime). Therefore, the Molad was on Friday at the end of the fourteenth hour. After all, Rosh Hashana did not fall out until Friday where Adom could sanctify the month. Therefore, the world was created on the twenty-fifth of Elul. We count that year as the first year (although the overwhelming amount of the year didn't exist) since we even consider one day of the year as a full year.

If you calculate the Molad of that Nissan of this theoretical year that would have transpired before the Tishrei that Hashem settled the Earth, i.e., when he created Adom, the Molad of that Nissan would be on Wednesday at 9 hours and 642 Chalakim, since you have to subtract (from the Tishrei Molad) 2 days 4 hours and 438 Chalakim. *(Since the amount between one Molad and another is 29 days 12 hours and 793 Chalakim. Since 28 is divided by 7, regarding the days of the week when the next Molad will fall out, would be 1 day 12 hours and 793 Chalakim later. If you times that by six months, it would be 9 days 4 hours and 438 Chalakim. Subtract 7 days, that's a full week, and the Molad would fall out 2 days 4 hours and 438 Chalakim later in the week from the Molad six months earlier.)* With that calculation, if you figure out the Molad of Tishrei of the theoretical year (i.e., a year before Adom was created), it would be Monday at 5 hours and 204 Chalakim.

However, we count the seasons from Nissan of that theoretical year, so that it started the night of the fourth day (Tuesday night). *[See R'shosh who asks how can you say the seasons from Nissan and Molad from Tishrei if they're contradictory.]* Therefore, Tishrei season afterwards, when Hashem created the world, started (182 days and 15 hours later than the Nissan season) on Wednesday on the 15th hour (i.e., 9 o'clock in the morning). As we say in Eirubin that there is 91 days and $7\frac{1}{2}$ hours between seasons, so two seasons later would push it off fifteen hours in the week (since 182 days is divisible by seven). Therefore, the season of Tishrei started a day and 23 hours before the Molad. Therefore, it comes out that the Nissan season preceded the Tishrei Molad 7 days 9 hours and 642 Chalakim. After all, the time that a half of year of seasons is greater than the half of year of lunar months are 5 days and 10 hours and 642 Chalakim. When you add that to the one day and 23 hours, you'll get the missing 7 days 9 hours and 642 Chalakim.

Nowadays, we're accustomed to count from Tishrei of that theoretic year (since it existed a few days at the end of that year (we say that one day in a year is considered a year. However, we count the seasons from Nissan and the Molad from Tishrei, which starts in the theoretical year on Monday at five hours and 204 Chalakim. Therefore, we need to subtract 7 days 9 hours and 642 Chalakim.

However, Tosfos asks: how can R' Yehoshua and R' Eliezer argue when was the start of the Molad? (As we see later that the rabbis counted the seasons like R' Yehoshua from Nissan and the Molad from Tishrei like R' Eliezer.) After all, couldn't they check out the position of the moon. As

we see later that the moon is only not seeable for twenty four hours between the old and new moon, as it says in Erichin. However, they have a difference between them 2 days 4 hours and 238 Chalakim. They shouldn't be able to make such a mistake of two days.

R' Nachman b. Yitchok answers: it's the Rosh Hashana for years regarding Hashem's judgement. As it says "from the beginning of the year until the end of the year." It's judged in the beginning of the year what would happen at the end of the year.

The Gemara asks: how do we know it refers to Tishrei? The Gemara answers: it says "blow in the month of Shofar in the 'Keseh' (covering) of the day of our Chag."

Daf 8b

Which Chag is the month covered in? This is Rosh Hashana. It then says "since it's the law to the Jews and the judgment of Yaakov's G-d."

Tosfos explains: since the moon is not visible then to those that are far, like to the people in the West (Eretz Yisrael) in the morning and to the people in the East (Bavel) towards evening, since it's so small, since it's right by the new moon period, like Rashi explains.

R' Tam brings a proof to this from the Medrish: the Pasuk says "blow in the month of Shofar in the covering of the day of our Chag." Isn't Nissan the beginning of the month and has a Chag during it? Rather, we must say that it has a Chag that day (on Rosh Chodesh). There is no other month that when the moon is covered that has a Chag that falls out that day than Tishrei.

However, R' Tam also explains 'Keseh; as 'prepared.' As we see the Gemara in Sanhedrin says "the day of 'Keseh' " regarding Amon and Moav who were bad neighbors to Eretz Yisrael etc. (who came on the appointed day (when the Jews went into exile) and cut out the Pasuk from the Torah that says that they can't join into the Jewish people.)

R' Meshulem explains: the day that the month is covered to mean that the Chatos usually brought on Rosh Chodesh was not brought on Rosh Hashana. As it says "besides the Olos of the Chodesh and its Menachos," and it doesn't say "besides its Chatos and Olos."

R' Tam asks: we must say they brought that goat. As the Tosefta says; they brought thirty-two goats during the year. It counts twelve of them that they brought on Rosh Chodesh. We wouldn't have twelve if we don't count the one on Rosh Hashana. Also, we see R' Eleizer Hakoler write in his Pizmon "Chayos etc." that the Musof of the Chodesh (brought on Rosh Hashana) is eleven. These are two bulls and one ram and seven year old lambs and the goat to atone.

R' Meshulam answers: I never meant that they didn't bring it at all. Rather, the Pasuk doesn't explicitly mention it in the Pasuk of 'besides' about the Chatos like it mentions Olos.

Another explanation: we don't mention the P'sukim of Rosh Chodesh's Musaf in the Tefilah. As we see that R' Shimon b. Gamliel had a son who had a good voice. He approached the Amud to Daven. He arrived at the part to mention the Rosh Chodesh's P'sukim, he remained quiet. He rationalized: it's better for the worthy to atone for the guilty and not have the guilty atone for the worthy. The explanation is that the Musaf of Rosh Chodesh is called the guilty since Hashem says to bring an atonement for himself (for making the moon smaller).

R' Tam was accustomed to mention it by saying “besides the Olos of the month” and end “two goats to atone,” one for Rosh Chodesh and one for Rosh Hashana.

We learned: it says “since it’s the law to the Jews and the judgment of Yaakov’s G-d.” This teaches us that the heavenly court doesn’t start the judgement until the human Beis Din sanctified the month (i.e., first the Jews’ law, then Hashem’s judgement).

We learned: it says “since it’s the law to the Jews,” I might think that judgement only applies to the Jews, how do we know it applies also to the non-Jews? The Pasuk says “and the judgment of Yaakov’s G-d.” (If we’re going to end up saying a universal judgement), why does the Pasuk need to say “since it’s the law to the Jews?” It teaches us that the Jews get judged first. This is like R’ Chisda’s statement: if a king and his nation come to be judged, the king is judged first. As King Shlomo said to Hashem “the judgement of your servant (Shlomo) and the judgement of your nation (the Jews)” What’s the reason for this? Either, because it’s not proper for the king to be waiting outside. Alternatively, (the king should be judged) before the Judge’s anger increases (after judging many sinful people).

New Sugya

The Mishna lists the Rosh Hashana of Shmita as the first of Tishrei. The Gemara asks: how do we know this? As it says “and the seventh year is a year of rest for the land,” and we learn a Gezeira Shava from the word ‘year’ from Tishrei, as it says “from the beginning of the ‘year.’” The Gemara asks: let them rather learn this Gezeira Shava to Nissan (where it also says the word ‘year’). As we see the Pasuk says “it’s the first of the months for you.” The Gemara answers: we rather learn the Pasuk that says the word ‘year’ without the word ‘month’ from another Pasuk that only says the word ‘year’ and not the word ‘month,’ and we don’t learn the Pasuk that says the word ‘year’ without the word ‘month’ from another Pasuk that says both ‘year’ and ‘month.’

New Sugya

The Mishna lists the Rosh Hashana of Yovel as the first of Tishrei. The Gemara asks: is it true that Yovel starts at the first of Tishrei? After all, Yovel starts at the tenth of Tishrei. As the Pasuk says “you blow the Shofar on Yom Kippur (that triggers Yovel).”

Tosfos points out: this question is according to R’ Ashi who says that our Mishna lists four Rosh Hashanos on four Roshei Chodeshim. However, according to R’ Chisda who explained earlier; the festival (that falls during Nissan) is the Rosh Hashana for festivals, could answer the same here (that the Rosh Hashana of Yovel falls out during Tishrei). [Maharsha points out that the text should be that the Gemara doesn’t ask according to neither R’ Ashi or R’ Chisda, since we can say that we’re not counting Yovel as one of the Rosh Hashanas because it doesn’t fall on the first just like he doesn’t count festivals within those Rosh Hashanas since it doesn’t fall on the first.]

The Gemara answers: the Mishna’s author is R’ Yishmael the son of R’ Yochanan b. Broka. As we learned: the Pasuk says “you sanctify the fiftieth year.” What does this come to teach us? Since it says the above Pasuk about Yom Kippur. I might say that it’s only gets the holiness of the Yovel year from Yom Kippur. So, the Torah says “you sanctify the fiftieth year.” It teaches us that it’s sanctified from the beginning of the year (first of Tishrei). From here, R’ Yishmael the son of R’ Yochanan b. Broka says; from Rosh Hashana to Yom Kippur, the slaves don’t take leave to their houses but they’re not obligated to work for their masters. Rather, they eat and drink and be merry and it’s like they have crowns on their heads. Once it

reaches Yom Kippur, the Beis Din blows the Shofar and the slaves leave to their houses, (sold) fields return to their original owners.

The Gemara asks: what do the Rabanan (who say that Yovel only starts by Yom Kippur) do with that Pasuk (“you sanctify the fiftieth year”)? The Gemara answers: they learn that you only sanctify years but not months. (This is like the opinion that Beis Din never needed to say “it’s holy, it’s holy” for months no matter if the last month was twenty-nine days or thirty.)

We have another Braisa: it says “it’s Yovel.” What does this teach us? I might think, (according to R’ Yishmael the son of R’ Yochanan b. Broka), since it says “you sanctify the fiftieth year” that teaches us that Yovel starts from the beginning of the year, it should last longer even after Yovel (until Yom Kippur). Don’t think this to be a difficult assumption since we have the concept of adding onto a holy day from a weekday. So, the Torah says “it’s Yovel the fiftieth year.” Only the fiftieth year is Yovel and not the fifty first year.