

Daf Hashvuah Halacha Gemara and Tosfos Taanis Daf 12
By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz
limudtorah.onlinewebshop.net
Subscribe free or to sponsor: tosfosproject@gmail.com

Daf 12a

R' Chisda says: on this, that we said, that you can fast for some hours, that's only if you didn't taste anything until night. Abaya asks: (if he doesn't eat the whole day) this is a complete fast (and not just one for hours). R' Chisda answers: it's needed in a case where he changed his mind (i.e., he didn't plan to fast in the morning, but found himself not eating the first part of the day and decided to continue to fast that day.)

Tosfos says: All this we explained in Mesechta Avoda Zara, even about Moshe's shirt without a hem, and the whole P'sak about fasting for some hours. After all, we'll say that you need to accept every Taanis in the Bracha Shomea Tefila in Tefilas Mincha of the day before, or if it was Shabbos, in Elokai Netzor. He all needs to say "tomorrow I will be in an individual fast" so that we shouldn't be in doubt that he accepted to be in a congregational fast.

[See there in Avoda Zara that Tosfos explains: this fast is only if, the day before by Mincha, he accepted it on condition that, if he ended up not eating the first six hours of the day, he would make it into a fast. Alternatively, even though it doesn't have a status of a fast, and on the contrary, he's considered to be a sinner (since it's not an official fast), but he needs to finish the fast because he needs to keep his vow to finish the day fasting.

Tosfos there also explains why Moshe didn't wear the Bigdei Kehuna, since those Bigadim did not receive Kedusha until after all seven days. Alternatively, since they took apart the Mishkon every night, it didn't have the status yet of a Mishkon, but as a regular Bamah, which doesn't need the one bringing the Korban to wear Bigdei Kehuna.]

R' Chisda also says: any Taanis that you don't finish fasting until sunset doesn't have a status of a fast.

The Gemara asks from a Mishna later (that, for the earlier fasts), the members of the group of Kohanim who go up for the week to do the Avoda, fast some of the day, but didn't finish the fast. (so, we see that you can have a fast that doesn't last until sunset.) The Gemara answers: (they don't fast for the sake of keeping some kind of fast), rather, it's just to pain themselves (to join in the pain of the congregation).

The Gemara asks from a Braisa: R' Elazar b. Tzadok says; I was from the descendants of Sinav b. Binyamin (who had a Yom Tov for bringing the gift of wood to the Mikdash on the tenth of Av), and Tisha B'av fell on Shabbos and was pushed off until after Shabbos. (Since the fast fell on their Yom Tov) they fasted part of the day, but they didn't finish the fast. The Gemara answers the same way: it was only to pain themselves (but not in order to keep the fast).

Tosfos is bothered by the question: we say in Mesechta Avoda Zara that, after the Beis Hamikdash was destroyed, they canceled keeping Megilas Taanis. This story of R' Eliezer b. Tzadok happened after the Mikdash's destruction, because if it was before, we say that when there is peace and no foreign kings decreeing upon us, (there are no fasts). So, why is he keeping this Yom Tov?

Tosfos answers: (in truth, it's an argument if Megilas Taanis was canceled), and this Tanna holds like the opinion that it was never canceled.

The Gemara asks: R' Yochanan said that he should be in a fast until he got to his house (so you can fast for a short time). The Gemara answers: he only did that to push off the Nassi's household from inviting him to eat (but it wasn't a true fast).

Shmuel says: any Taanis that he didn't accept the day before doesn't have the status of being a Taanis. If he does fast, what is it? Rabbah b. Shila says that it's like a bellow full of air (i.e., it's nothing).

The Gemara inquirers: at what point (the day before) must you accept the Taanis? Rav says: by Mincha time (the afternoon). Shmuel says: you must accept it during the Tefila of Mincha. R' Yosef says that Shmuel seems to make sense since it's written in Megilas Taanis (the book that counts days that miracles happened to the Jews, they commemorated it with a Yom Tov that you're not allowed to fast on it); “any person that had accepted a fast before the enactment for the Yom Tov 'Yaiser.' (If not, you're not allowed to fast.)” Doesn't it mean to Yaisir (**Rashi: you make it forbidden**) in your Davening? The Gemara answers: no, it means that Yeaser (it becomes Assur by itself, even without Davening).

Tosfos explains: 'Yeaser' is written with an 'Aleph' which is a term of being Assur, prohibited, that they forbade themselves to eat. 'Yisar' is a term of 'Hasara,' removal. i.e., you remove the vow, and it will be permitted to eat on the next day since it will be a Yom Tov and you shouldn't fast.

R' Chiya and R' Shimon b. Rebbi argue whether it's written 'Yaiser' or 'Yeaser.' We already explained it according to the word 'Yaiser.' How is it with 'Yeaser?' Like we learned in Megilas Taanis “any person that had accepted a fast before the enactment for the Yom Tov, then Yeaser. How is this? If an individual accepts on himself to fast all Mondays and Thursdays of the year, and one of those days chances on one of the days written in Megilas Taanis; then, if his vow came before the enactment for making that day a Yom Tov, the vow to fast supersedes the enactment of the Yom Tov. However, if the enactment to make it a Yom Tov comes first, then the enactment supersedes the vow to fast.”

Tosfos quotes Rashi: the vow is completely pushed off, and you don't need to make up the Taanis. However, the Ri was in doubt about it. Therefore, you should be stringent that you shouldn't fast that day, but you need to make it up on the next day. You also need to make sure that you don't fast on Rosh Chodesh, Chanuka and Purim, since the Migilas Taanis wasn't canceled for those holidays.

New Sugya

We learned: (when you can eat and drink at night, and you only fast by day), until what time can you eat and drink to? The Tanna Kama says until dawn and R' Eliezer b. Shimon says until the rooster crows. Abaya says: this is only if you hadn't finished your meal, but if you finished your meal at night (and don't plan to eat afterwards, you can't eat from that time on. Rava asked from a Braisa: if he finished his meal and got up, he can still eat afterwards. The Gemara answers: that's when he didn't give up from eating more (but planned on eating. Therefore, he didn't accepted the fast yet.)

Another version: Rava says that he can only eat if he didn't sleep yet, but if he went to sleep for the night, he can't eat. Abaya asked from a Braisa; if you sleep and got up (before the time of the fast) you can

still eat. The Gemara answers: that was only when he was drifting off (but didn't get real sleep). The Gemara asks: what's considered to be drifting off?

Daf 12b

R' Ashi says: if he's asleep, but not really asleep. Awake, but not really awake. You call him, and he answers. He can't answer with something logical, but if you remind him of the logic, he'll remember it.

Tosfos quotes 'Rebbi' who explains: "asleep, but not really asleep" refers to when one is waking from his sleep. "Awake, but not really awake" refers to the beginning of his sleep (i.e., when he's falling asleep).

Tosfos argues: this doesn't seem correct. After all, the Gemara in Pesachim says that those from the group eating the Pesach were "somewhat asleep" they may continue eating. However, if they fell into a deep slumber, they can no longer eat. R' Ashi says that "somewhat asleep" means that they were "asleep, but not really asleep (awake, but not really awake.)" Therefore, it seems that "asleep, but not really asleep, awake, but not really awake" refers to before you fell asleep. (After all, if you're coming out of a deep sleep, it's definitely a Hefsid in eating the Pesach and you shouldn't be able to continue eating.)

Therefore, it seems like Rashi's explanation. If it only says "asleep, but not really asleep," I would have said "awake, but not really awake" is considered more asleep (and wouldn't have the same Halacha). The same would be true if it only said "awake, but not really awake," I would have said "asleep, but not really asleep" is considered more asleep. (I.e., I might say that there is two levels of being half asleep, and one may be Halachically considered being like he's completely asleep, so we list both to say that anytime you're half asleep, it's not considered like you're asleep.) Anyhow, both are when you're falling asleep, like it's explained in Pesachim.

The Yerushalmi explains this Braisa: from when do you eat or drink, until the rooster's crowing. The same would apply to dawn (according to that opinion that the fast starts at dawn). This is only so if he made a condition that he'll eat (after he wakes up). However, if he didn't make such a condition and went to sleep, he can't eat.

R' Kahana quotes Rav: an individual that accepted upon himself a fast, he's forbidden to wear shoes, since we're concerned that he accepted upon himself a congregational fast. What should he do (to make sure he only needs to keep an individual fast, which is more lenient)? He should say explicitly that "I accept an individual fast tomorrow."

The Rabanan told R' Sheishes that they saw some rabbis who came to the Taanis wearing shoes, and R' Sheishes was upset. He said sarcastically: do they eat also? (They argue whether they hold of Shmuel's opinion that we'll bring shortly.) Abaya and Rava wore 'Afnosa' shoes. **(Tosfos- a shoe without a heel.)** Mareimar and Mar Zutra switched their right shoe with their left shoe (i.e., wore their shoes on the wrong feet). The rabbis of the house of R' Ashi wore their shoes regularly. They held like Shmuel that there is no true congregational fasts in Bavel except for Tisha B'av (since they have ample moisture, it's not so necessary to fast, so they never had such strict fasts).

R' Yehuda quotes Rav: someone can borrow a Taanis (i.e., eat that day), and pay it back (i.e., and fast another day instead). When they said it in front of Shmuel, he said: did he accept it as a vow to fast that you can't make it up a different day? He only vowed to pain himself. Therefore, if he has the ability to

pain himself that day, he will. However, if he can't (and finds it too hard), he doesn't need to pain himself that day.

Tosfos explains: this is why Shmuel said that you may borrow the fast and pay back, that it's only in a case where he can't bare the pain. However, if he's able to bare the pain, he can't borrow the fast (and must fast that day).

The conclusion is as follows: if he says (by Mincha) that he'll fast tomorrow, he needs to pain himself to do so, and he can't borrow the day to fast a different day for no reason. Even if he forgets and eats, he should finish the rest of the day fasting.

The Ri had a Safeik if you can borrow the fast and pay back later if you accepted the fast earlier (by Mincha that day before) and he fasted already until midday, or even a quarter of a day, even if he can't bare the pain. However, if he didn't start the fast, he can definitely borrow the day, or if he forgot and started eating right away, he should eat and pay back another day.

If he fasted on Shabbos, like for a bad dream, where he needs to pay another fast for it, like we say that he needs to have a fast to atone for what he fasted (on Shabbos); if it happens (that Sunday) is Rosh Chodesh, you need to fast some other day that week.

Another version of the above give and take: R' Yehuda quotes Rav; someone can borrow a Taanis (i.e., eat that day), and pay it back (i.e., and fast another day instead). When they said it in front of Shmuel, he said: it's simple. After all, it's a vow, and you can always make up your vow on a later date.

R' Yehoshua b. R' Idi visited to the house of R' Assi. He prepared a (tender) calf that was the third born from its mother and he offered R' Yehoshua to partake. He refused saying that he's fasting that day. He said: why don't you borrow today (by not fasting) and pay it back later. Don't you hold of what R' Yehuda quoted Rav, that someone can borrow a Taanis (i.e., eat that day), and pay it back (i.e., and fast another day instead)? He said: it's a fast for a bad dream that Rav says that the fast is good to destroy the dream like fire to strands (of linen) and R' Chisda qualifies that it only works if he fasts that day. R' Yosef says that he should fast even on Shabbos. What's the fix (to atone for fasting on Shabbos)? He should sit another fast during the week to atone for the fast on Shabbos.

New Sugya

If these fast passed and they still weren't answered (with rain), Beis Din enacted three other fasts on the congregation. These, they can only eat during the afternoon the day before, (but not at night). They're forbidden to work, bathe, rub oil, wear shoes or have relations with their wives. They lock up the bathhouses.

If these fast passed and they still weren't answered (with rain), Beis Din enacted another seven fasts, which would be all together thirteen fasts on the congregation. These are stricter than the earlier ones that they blow the Shofar and they close the stores. On the Mondays, they open the stores' doors a little towards nightfall (to buy the provisions of their after-Taanis meal). However, on Thursday, they allowed the store to remain open for the honor of Shabbos (to be able to buy their Shabbos needs).

If these fast passed and they still weren't answered (with rain), people need to lessen their business deals, their building and planting, their betrothing and marrying. They also don't greet each other, just like people who are excommunicated from heaven. The individuals (Tzadikim) continue to fast through

Nisson. After Nisson, it's a sign of a curse if rain falls. As the Pasuk says "isn't it already the time to harvest the wheat. (As a sign of disapproval, I'll make it rain.)"

The Gemara asks: I understand why all the other things, bathing, smearing oil and relations, are forbidden, since there is pleasure. However, work is painful, (so why did they forbid it?) R' Chisda quotes R' Yirmiya b. Abba: the Pasuk says: the fast-day is holy, we should call it a day of 'Atzara' (stoppage), gather the elders." Since it's called Atzeres, just like you can't work on Atzeres (Shvuos or Shmini Atzeres), you can't work on a fast. The Gemara asks: then it should be forbidden to do work on the night of the fast too? R' Zeir answers: R' Yirmiya b. Abba's Pasuk was explained to me; the Pasuk says "gathering elders." Just like the gathering of elders were only done by the day, so too it's only forbidden by a fast during the day.

Tosfos explains: but not at night.

Tosfos asks: if so, why can you only eat and drink during the day before? Why can't you eat and drink the whole night? After all, we should make the Drasha; just as the gathering of elders are by day, so too the fast is during the day and not during the night.

Tosfos answers: we don't learn fasting from the gathering, but we only learn working (since it's written explicitly in the Pasuk). However, it only says in the Pasuk about gathering the elders and making Kodesh the fast day, but it says nothing about eating.

The Gemara asks: perhaps they gather at night? R' Shisha b. R' Idi says that this is a proof to R' Huna who says the time of gathering is during the day.

New Sugya

The Gemara asks: what do you do on a Taanis? Abaya says: they introspected the city's deeds from the early morning until noon. From noon and on, they read the Sefer Torah and Haftarah for the first quarter of the rest of the day. The rest of the day they prayed for mercy. As the Pasuk says: "they stood in their places and they read Hashem's Sefer Torah for a quarter of the day, and the next quarter they confessed and they bowed to Hashem."