



Points to Ponder

הערות של רב יחיאל גרינהויז

THE FIFTH PEREK OF YEVAMOS IS DEDICATED:

לע"נ דוד בן יצחק איסאק

YEVAMOS DAF 51 IS DEDICATED:

L'Zecher Nishmas Devorah Chaya Bas Yosef Tzvi

יבמות דף נ"א

1. בריתא argues on רב's understanding of גמליאל's opinion and asks from a בריתא regarding 3 יבמות who get וגט, ביאה, ומאמר respectively. According to רש"י if the first מאמר works and is קונה, than the ביאה which follows shouldn't work. How can מאמר which is only דרבנן interfere with ביאה which is מדאורייתא?
2. The גמרא says that רבן גמליאל holds that there is no זיקה and therefore his opinion doesn't contradict שמואל. The גמרא than says that if that is רבן גמליאל's position we should infer that the רבנן who argue maintain that there is זיקה. How are these two positions related? Why can't everyone agree that there is no זיקה and still argue about גט אחר גט and מאמר אחר מאמר? (Like the גמרא itself says according to רב בר רב (הונא)).
3. According to רבן גמליאל if רבן gave both יבמות a גט, only the first one is valid, and he should give the first one a חליצה to free her זיקה. Although he can give either one a חליצה Rashi explains that it's good advice to do it with the first יבמה so that the second יבמה's relatives will not become אסור to him. Why can't רש"י simply say that one should not spill water which other people can use, and in this case the second will remain מותר לכהונה if he does חליצה with the first, who is anyway unable to marry a כהן because her גט was valid.

4. The גמרא asks why according to רבן גמליאל if he gave 2 יבמות מאמר, he can't do יבום with the first יבמה whose מאמר was valid. The גמרא answers that we are concerned about him doing יבום with the second one. If we are concerned with people switching between the 2 יבמות who both got מאמר, why aren't we similarly concerned with him marrying the relatives of the first יבמה in a case where he gave a גט אחר גט according to רבן גמליאל?

If you have any comments or suggestions please email me at
Ygrunhaus@gmail.com

לע"נ אבי מורי הרב יעקב בן ר' קיים משה יצחק ז"ל
רפואה שלימה לרב רפאל צבי ליפא בו אסתר רכאל