

There is no kneading after kneading

There is no kneading after kneading (*Taz*; *Beur Halakha*; *Hazon Ish*). Therefore, if one mixed a solid with a liquid and kneaded them before Shabbat, it is permitted to knead them again on Shabbat. In that case, it is permitted even to **add water** and knead, since this does not render the mixture more uniform; rather, this actually separates it. It is prohibited to add **dry ingredients** to an existing dough and

knead them. Consequently, it is permitted to add water and mix it into tahini spread that was prepared before Shabbat, though it is recommended not to prepare tahini from raw tahini paste on Shabbat; and it is permitted to mix in oil floating on top of peanut butter, or the like (pp. 1076–1080).

Is it permitted to add wine to ground nuts and apples designated for *haroset*?

From the **Gemara** (140a) it is clear that it is permitted to mix ground produce with liquids, provided that one mixes them **gently**. A slight variation of that kind is not usually effective, and it is sufficient only with regard to a mixture of ground produce with liquid, since in that case an actual dough is not formed and it is not full-fledged kneading.

In the opinion of several *Rishonim* (based on **Yerushalmi** 7:2), this ruling is limited to a case where one added the liquid before Shabbat, as according to **Rabbi Yehuda HaNasi**, the prohibition of Kneading is in effect even at the stage of adding the liquid to the dry ingredients, and a variation in the manner of kneading cannot render the addition of liquid permitted.

In practice, with regard to this matter there is a dispute between the *Shulhan Arukh* and the Rema. The *Shulhan Arukh* (321:15–16) rules in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yossi bar Yehuda and permits adding liquid to ground produce and mixing them gently on Shabbat, even though a dough-like mixture is formed, and that is the practice of many **Sephardim**. The **Rema** (321:16) rules in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yehuda HaNasi and writes that it is prohibited to add liquid to ground produce and form a dough-like mixture; rather, one must add the liquid **before Shabbat** and mix it gently on Shabbat, or to prepare a runny mixture while altering the order of placement. That is the practice of **Ashkenazim** and some Sephardim.

As we have already seen, if it is not possible to add the liquid before Shabbat (e.g., if the food would spoil), even Ashkenazim

may be lenient, in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yossi bar Yehuda, and add the liquid on Shabbat itself. In that case, one should stir gently or with some other variation, and it is advisable to change the order of placement (pp. 1081–1086).

Is it permitted to add oil to a vegetable salad?

In the case of **vegetables that are finely cut**, where adding liquid to them will cause them to amalgamate, one should be stringent in their regard like with ground produce. Therefore, it is prohibited to add a liquid to them on Shabbat itself, and if it is not practical to prepare it before Shabbat, it is permitted to add the liquid on Shabbat and mix it gently. It is advisable to change the order of adding the ingredients as well. With regard to **larger pieces**, which do not amalgamate into a unified dough, there is no problem of Kneading at all (*Mishna Berura* 321:68).

On that basis, it is permitted to add liquid to a **vegetable salad** or a **fruit salad** and mix the ingredients in the standard manner, since the fruit and vegetables are not cut very finely. It is also permitted to add **dressing to a lettuce salad** and mix them in the standard manner, and it is permitted to add **mayonnaise to small pieces of potato salad** and mix them in the standard manner, because the pieces of potato are not cut very finely. One may also be lenient with regard to a **carrot salad** and add orange juice or the like to it, as there is no real amalgamation of the various pieces; but if the salad is cut very finely it is advisable to mix it gently. Likewise, it is permitted to add **cream to pieces of strawberry**. In a case where the strawberries are **ground**, if one is adding a small amount of cream which thereby causes the pieces to become attached, one should stir gently. But if one is adding a large amount of cream which does not cause the strawberries to become attached but merely to flavor the cream, one may mix them in the standard manner. Likewise, it is permitted to mix **herbs into soft cheese or hummus**, as there is no dough-like substance; they merely contribute flavor (pp. 1087–1088).

Is it permitted to knead cooked vegetables?

According to the **Responsa of the Rambam** (305), it is permitted to knead cooked vegetables. From the formulation of the authorities it is clear that they disagree about whether it is permitted to knead any cooked vegetable (as is implied by the *Beur Halakha*), or whether it is permitted only with a vegetable that is very soft and moist (as it appears from the *Hazon Ish*). As we have seen, with regard to vegetables that are not soft, there is the additional issue of Grinding. Therefore, ideally it is preferable to be lenient only with regard to **very soft cooked crushed** vegetables: It is permitted to mash them even with the tines of a fork and mix them, and even add gravy, but it is preferable to mix them gently, not vigorously (*Mishna Berura* 321:77).

Even if the vegetables were not mashed while being cooked, if they are soft and can very easily be mashed, they may be mashed **immediately before the meal**. If the vegetables are still **hard** they should be mashed in an **unusual manner**. In both cases one may be lenient with regard to Kneading (in accordance with the opinion of the *Beur Halakha*). If Mashing is not necessary, if, for example, one wants to add sauce to rice, one may be lenient especially since there is no kneading that amalgamates the elements; merely the addition of flavor and moisture (pp. 1090–1097).

Is it permitted to knead matza meal or cookie crumbs?

The **Gemara** (155b–156a) determined that according to the opinion of Rabbi Yossi bar Yehuda, it is permitted to knead **flour made from toasted grain**, if one kneads only a **small amount** each time. Matza meal, cookie crumbs, bread crumbs, or the like are similar to flour made from toasted grain. Therefore, according to the Sephardi authorities who rule in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yossi bar Yehuda, it is permitted to pour liquid on them and to knead an amount that is smaller than usual. By contrast, according to Ashkenazi authorities (and some Sephardi authorities), who rule in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yehuda HaNasi, there is no

room for leniency, unless one places the liquid before Shabbat. In that case, it is permitted to add liquid on Shabbat and knead an amount that is smaller than usual. Likewise, one may be lenient and knead in an unusual manner in accordance with the provisions stipulated in the previous paragraphs (pp. 1092–1097).

Is it permitted to knead crushed fruit in its natural juice?

The *Hazon Ish* (58:5, s.v. *yesh*) introduced the novel idea that after a person crushed a fruit in a permitted manner (before Shabbat, with a variation, or a very soft cooked fruit), it may be mixed in its own natural juice. The reason is that the prohibition of Kneading applies only to mixing an external liquid and not to mixing the item with its own juice. In addition, this mixing does not amalgamate different parts into a single unit; rather, it primarily does away with the structure of the fruit and transforms it into something softer (p. 1101).

Is it permitted to mix two doughs together?

The authorities disagreed whether the prohibition of Kneading also prohibits the mixture of **two dough-like mixtures**, e.g., mixing **honey and cheese** together. Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (cited in *Shemirat Shabbat KeHilkhata* 8:13–16) ruled stringently, while Rav Moshe Feinstein (*Iggerot Moshe, Oraḥ Hayim* 4:74, *Lash* 13) and Rav Nissim Karelitz (cited in *Orehot Shabbat* 6, note 21) ruled leniently.

IN PRACTICE: When the item in question is a **dough-like mixture** that it is prohibited to knead by Torah law, it is advisable to prohibit mixing two of them together. Therefore, it is preferable to be stringent and not mix **honey and cheese** that are not pourable. When the item in question is a **runny mixture** that is prohibited to knead by rabbinic law, one may be lenient in its regard.

Likewise, one may be lenient in a case where no additional thickness is generated, especially when one prepares it just before the meal, as that is considered **preparation of food**, not kneading. All

the more so one may be lenient with regard to mixing **while actually eating**, especially when there is no additional thickness discernible. Therefore, it is permitted to mix **whipped cream into chocolate pudding**, or the like.

Similarly, one may be lenient and mix **mayonnaise and ketchup** in order to prepare dressing, since it is a runny mixture, and especially when the mixing ultimately results in a **more liquid** mixture, the mixture can be used as dressing. It is clearly permitted to add water to them in order to dilute them, since that action is the opposite of Kneading; it does not come to combine them; rather, it is specifically to loosen and separate them.

It is also permitted to mix **sugar or cocoa into yogurt** or the like, as there is no dough or amalgamation of parts; rather it merely adds flavor to the yogurt (pp. 1101–1104).

Is it permitted to prepare egg salad or tuna salad?

In order to prepare egg salad, one takes eggs and crumbles them. As explained in the context of the labors of **Selecting and Grinding**, one should peel the eggs just before eating them, and it is permitted to mash them even with the tines of a fork. One also chops an onion into small pieces. As explained in the context of the labor of **Grinding**, one should do so just before the meal, and it is preferable to cut the onion into slightly larger pieces. Then one adds oil or mayonnaise and mixes it all together. Ostensibly, there would be a problem of Kneading, since the egg crumbles into very small pieces, and the mayonnaise or the oil amalgamate them into a single dough.

Nevertheless, **many Jews** customarily prepare egg salad on Shabbat. **Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach** (cited in *Shemirat Shabbat KeHilkhata* 8, note 81) sought to defend that custom and suggested various reasons for leniency. In practice, there are many **who are lenient and prepare egg salad in the standard manner on Shabbat**, and they have authorities on whom they can rely. They should prepare it just before the meal, and they should cut the onions into pieces slightly larger than usual. If possible, it is preferable to mix it

in an unusual manner, with horizontal and vertical movements or gently.

Similarly, it is permitted to prepare **tuna salad** on Shabbat. It is permitted to place the mayonnaise in the standard manner. It is preferable to mix it with horizontal and vertical movements or gently (pp. 1105–1107).

What is the *halakha* with regard to instant meals on Shabbat?

With regard to instant meals, there is a question, both from the perspective of the prohibition of **Cooking** and from the perspective of the prohibition of **Kneading**. From the perspective of the *halakhot* of Cooking, there is room to permit preparation of instant meals in a tertiary vessel. One should not do this often, so that there will not be a feeling of cooking on Shabbat (see the *halakhot* of Cooking in this regard). As for the prohibition of Kneading, there is a distinction between three types of instant meals:

1. Liquidy instant meals – In this case, there is generally no problem of Kneading.
2. Instant meals containing noodles and gravy – If the mixture can be poured from one vessel to another (a runny mixture), it is permitted to prepare it on Shabbat. One should alter the order of placement and stir it in an unusual manner, e.g., horizontally and vertically. If the mixture is thicker and the gravy attaches the noodles to it, or the like (a dough-like mixture), it is preferable not to prepare it on Shabbat. If it is not practical to prepare it before Shabbat and there is a need, it can be prepared by mixing it in an unusual manner, and it is advisable to change the order of the placement.
3. Instant meals that contain powder – At times, the water transforms the powder into a paste **even without mixing**, e.g., powdered **mashed potatoes**. In that case, **everyone agrees that preparing a dough-like mixture is prohibited**, even if one does so with a variation, and there is room for leniency only if one is careful to

add a large amount of water and prepares a runny mixture, with two variations (pp. 1108–1114).

How does one prepare baby formula on Shabbat?

Baby formula – It is permitted to prepare it in the standard manner.

Cereal – If the mixture in question is **runny** (can be poured from one vessel to another) it may be prepared by changing the order of adding the ingredients, even if one mixes them in the standard manner. In a case where the mixture in question is **dough-like**, if it is for a baby, one may be lenient and prepare it by changing the manner of its mixing, provided that the cereal does not dissolve spontaneously without mixing (pp. 1113–1114).