

שבת קודש פרשת חול המועד סוכות | מסכת כתובות דף קי"א

INSIGHTS FROM OUR CHABUROS

The Blessing of Living in Yerushalayim

מנין ששיבת כרכים קשה, שאמר ויברכו העם לכל האנשים המתנדבים לשבת בירושלים

Sefer notes that the introductory question of the Gemara seems a bit surprising: "How do we know that living in a large city is difficult?" It seems obvious, he claims, that life in the big city has its challenges. Rather, he points out that living in a large city also has its clear advantages. In fact, that is why many people choose to live there. On the other hand, living in a smaller town has its own advantages and disadvantages. Therefore, being that each mode of living has its set of pros and cons, the Gemara needs to cite a verse to prove that living in a large city is the more difficult of the two.

The verse teaches that the residents of Yerushalayim were given a blessing. This implies that they were in need of a special greeting simply due to the fact that they were prepared to live in the larger city. The reason it is more difficult for a person to live under such conditions seems to be due to lack of fresh air and open spaces (Rashi). The verse also suggests that the people volunteered to live there (מתנדבים), which implies that most people actually preferred to not live in the city, but the ones who offered to do so did it out of their being kind (Meiri). This insight, however, is questionable, because the subsequent verses in Sefer Nechemiah (Ch. 11) describe how those who moved to Yerushalayim all came from other cities where they were living. Perhaps the blessing was in order not because of their choice to move to the big city, but rather due to their agreeing to displace themselves and leave their previous locale. Nevertheless, Sefer Zechor LaAvraham explains that the verse actually praises the people due their willingness "to settle (לשבת) in Yerushalayim," and it does not emphasize their willingness "to come (לבוא) to Yerushalayim." This is the insight from the verse which the Gemara detects in order to arrive at its conclusion that it was due to their agreeing to live in the city that earned them this blessing.

POINT TO PONDER

The Mishna says that someone who married a woman in Eretz Yisroel and divorced her in Eretz Yisroel, pays with מעות ארץ ישראל what is the Chiddush? Obviously he can use the currency where they live?

Response to last week's Point to Ponder:

Everyone should try and get a אפטרופוס like the one who came in front of him and knew what to say, is what אבי" said about the caretaker. Wouldn't אבי" have to do the same for the orphans even if this guy didn't know what to claim? The rule is that יתומים speak on behalf of orphans.

The Rishonim give two answers, one is that אבי" was curious to see what he will say, and the second approach is that we don't always claim for orphans and it depends on what they themselves say. Therefore אבי" had to first hear his complaints.

STORIES OF THE DAF

Life in the Big City

ישיבת כרכים קשה

One shochet went to the Divrei Chaim of Sanz, zt"l, for advice. "I live in a small town and earn a minimal living through my occupation, but have been offered a position in a certain large city. I am really in a quandary whether I ought to accept the new position or continue toughing it out where I am. Perhaps the Rav can advise me."

The Rav looked at the man in a surprised manner, "What is the question? In a big city you will make an ample living. Furthermore, it is well known that the city which has offered you the position is much more filled with Yiddishkeit than your present town which has a much smaller community. Why would you hesitate for an instant?"

"Well, my question actually stems from the Gemara in Kesuvos 110b which states clearly that living in a big city is difficult. We are managing. Perhaps the Gemara is enough of a reason to turn the job down?"

The Divrei Chaim responded, "That is not what the Gemara means at all. The meaning of the Gemara is that moving to a big city is very costly since the cost of living is far higher there than it is in a small town. Since not everyone has the money to afford the inflated costs of city life, it is generally a hardship. The Gemara doesn't mean to say that living in a big city is not good. On the contrary, for one who can afford it, it is very good indeed!"

HALACHA HIGHLIGHT

Does a vacation to Israel fulfill the mitzvah of dwelling in Eretz Yisroel?

תנו רבנן לעולם ידור אדם בארץ ישראל

The Rabbis taught: A person should always dwell in Eretz Yisroel...

Poskim¹ dispute whether there is a mitzvah to live in Eretz Yisroel nowadays. According to some it is a Biblical mitzvah whereas according to others it is only a Rabbinic obligation. A third position² is that all opinions agree that one is not obligated to move to Eretz Yisroel, rather it is an optional mitzvah (קיומית מצוה) and the dispute revolves around what mitzvah is fulfilled in the event that one moves to Eretz Yisroel.

Another related dispute relates to whether one fulfills a mitzvah by being in Eretz Yisroel even if one has no intention to remain there. Some authorities³ write that although it is a tremendous merit to spend time in Eretz Yisroel one does not fulfill the mitzvah of living in Eretz Yisroel if he has no intention to remain there. Other authorities⁴ disagree and are of the opinion that one fulfills a mitzvah for every moment that he is in Eretz Yisroel regardless of whether he intends to stay there. Shulchan Aruch Harav⁵ writes that those who travel to Eretz Yisroel for business are considered to be involved in the mitzvah of dwelling in Eretz Yisroel but he is uncertain about those who go merely for a vacation (לייטל) whether they are fulfilling any mitzvah.

There is a well known "halacha" that there is an advantage to traverse a new set of four amos, i.e. on an area that one has not walked upon. The author of the sefer דקיטא⁶ wrote in the name of Rav Chaim Kanievski that there is no source for this "halacha" that one should make an effort to walk on a new four amos. Furthermore, Rav Binyomin Zilber⁷, the Az Nidbaru, ruled that to travel around Eretz Yisroel to see and be familiar with the country has no halachic value and therefore constitutes bitul Torah.

1. ע' פאת השולחן סי' א' באור.
2. אג"מ אה"ע ח"א סי' ק"ב.
3. שלטי גבורים שבועות פ"ג.
4. שו"ת משה הלכות ח"ב סי' י"ו.
5. שו"ע הרב או"ח סי' שמ"ח סע' י"ג קו"א סק"ח.
6. ספר שלהי דקיטא סי' ב'.
7. שו"ת אז נדברו ח"א סי' ל"ד.

YOM TOV CONNECTION

In this week's daf we learn about debts that are the subject of a dispute between two individuals. The מדרש (פרשת אמור, כ"ב) uses a Mashal concerning a community's collective debt to the king to describe the significance of Succos. On the Pasuk מ' (פסוק מ') "ולקחתם לכם ביום הראשון פרי עץ הדור כפת תמרים וענף עץ-עבת (ויקרא)" וערבי-נחל לפני ה' אלהיכם. ושמתם שבעת ימים" The Medrash asks

"וכי ראשון הוא"? Is it the first! Meaning is this the first of the month, which obviously it is not. But says the Medrash it is לחשבון עוונות, it is the first for a new count or a clean slate. The Medrash continues with a mashal to a king whose subjects owed him a lot of taxes. The king decides to go to the people and demand payment. When he approaches the town the town's elders greet him and beg for forgiveness. The king agrees to forgive half of the debt. He continues towards the city and is greeted by the regular town's people who again beg him to forgive the debt, and he agrees to forgive another quarter. Finally all of the women and children come to greet him and forgives the rest of the debt. This the Medrash explains is what takes place between Rosh Hashana and Yom Kippur, before Rosh Hashana the tzadikim fast and Hashem forgives one third, then during the Aseres Yimei Teshuva select individuals fast and Hashem forgives another third and finally on Yom Kippur everyone fasts and Hashem is mocheil everyone. The Pasuk regarding Succos says: אך בחמשה עשר יום לחדש השביעי ביום: באספכם את-תבואת הארץ תחגו את-חג-ה' שבעת ימים הראשון שבתון (ויקרא פרק כ"ג פסוק ל"ט). While it says in other festivals חג לה' meaning TO here it says חג ה' meaning it's His festival. The מדרש (ויקרא פרק כ"ג פסוק ל"ט) explains that Succos celebrates Hashem being truly happy because we are all cleansed of our sins. This is only true of Succos because it comes right after Yom Kippur. This is also the reason why we don't celebrate Succos in the spring which is when Am Yisrael experienced the Succah in the desert, because here we are primarily celebrating Hashem's happiness with Am Yisrael who are now clean from our Aveiros!

REVIEW AND REMEMBER

1. Explain "הפוכי מטרותא למי ליי"
2. What are the different lands pertaining to marriage?
3. Can a person be forced to leave Eretz Yisroel?
4. Why is a person who lives in chutz la'aretz considered as if he is an idolater?

For more points to ponder by Rabbi Yechiel Grunhaus, or insights by Rabbi Yitzchok Gutterman, please visit our website, dafaweek.org, or download the app

To share an insight from your Chabura please email info@dafaweek.org

The shavua matters is published by the Daf a week program under the rabbinical guidance of Harav Meir Stern shlita and Harav Shmuel Kamenetsky shlita

To sponsor a publication, please contact Rabbi Zacharia Adler, Executive Director at info@dafaweek.org or call 507-daf-week. Sponsorship for one week is \$100

Sections reprinted with permission from the Chicago Torah Center