

## Prop. A Embarcadero Seawall Earthquake Safety Bond

6138-EN-N18-CP61

The above statement is an impartial analysis of this measure. Arguments for and against this measure immediately follow. The full text begins on page 104. Some of the words used in the ballot digest are explained starting on page 58. This measure requires 66⅔%+1 affirmative votes to pass.

### Local Ballot Measures – Proposition A

b) In FY 2024–2025, following issuance of the last series of bonds, and the year with the highest tax rate, the best estimate of the tax required to fund this bond issue would result in a property tax rate of \$0.0117 per \$100 (\$11.70 per \$100,000) of assessed valuation. c) The best estimate of the average tax rate for these bonds from FY 2019–2020 through FY 2042–2043 is \$0.00767 per \$100 (\$7.67 per \$100,000) of assessed valuation. d) Based on these estimates, the highest estimated annual property tax cost for these bonds for the owner of a home with an assessed value of \$600,000 would be approximately \$69.39. These estimates are based on projections only, which are not binding upon the City. Projections and estimates may vary due to the timing of bond sales, the amount of bonds sold at each sale, and actual assessed valuation over the term of repayment of the bonds. Hence, the actual tax rate and the years in which such rates are applicable may vary from those estimated above. The City's current debt management policy is to issue new general obligation bonds only as old ones are retired, keeping the property tax impact from general obligation bonds approximately the same over time. How "A" Got on the Ballot On June 26, 2018, the Board of Supervisors voted 11 to 0 to place Proposition A on the ballot. The Supervisors voted as follows: Yes: Breed, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Sheehy, Stefani, Tang, Yee. No: None.

62 38-EN-N18-CP62

Arguments are the opinions of the authors and have not been checked for accuracy by any official agency. Arguments are printed as submitted. Spelling and grammatical errors have not been corrected.

### Local Ballot Measures – Proposition A

A Stronger Seawall for a Safer San Francisco. Please Vote YES on A. San Francisco's 100-year-old Seawall is the foundation of our waterfront. Constructed before engineers built infrastructure to survive earthquakes, it stretches three miles under the Embarcadero from Fisherman's Wharf to AT&T Park. Over the years, it has settled, cracked and eroded. Today, the Seawall is at-risk to earthquakes, disasters and increased flooding due to sea level rise. Proposition A is the first step to strengthen the Seawall:

- Protect against earthquakes and disasters. There is a 72% chance that a major earthquake will strike San Francisco in the next 30 years. When it hits, our current Seawall is likely to fail unless we take action.
- Prevent flooding of downtown and MUNI/BART tunnels. A major storm event (a 500 year storm) could flood the BART and MUNI tunnels today, paralyzing regional transit.
- Safeguard emergency water supply and evacuation routes. We need the Embarcadero in a disaster to allow evacuation of hundreds of thousands of people and land critical emergency supplies.

- Prepare for sea level rise due to climate change. Climate change is predicted to increase water levels as much as 6 feet by the end of this century. Without action, daily high tides will overtop the Seawall and coastal flood risk will extend into most of Downtown before century's end. The City carefully

manages its bond program so that Proposition A will NOT increase property tax rates. There will be independent citizen oversight of spending and regular financial audits. To keep San Francisco safe, please join us and vote YES on A. Mayor London Breed Supervisor Aaron Peskin Assessor-Recorder Carmen Chu Port Commissioner Doreen Woo Ho\* Fire Chief Joanne Hayes-White\* Fire Commission President Ken Cleaveland\* San Francisco Firefighters Union Local 798 San Francisco Police Chief William Scott\* Sheriff Vicki L. Hennessy \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization.

If the Embarcadero baywall has been settling, cracking and eroding for decades as Prop. A proponents claim, the Port Commission should have started budgeting for repairs decades ago. But no – they ‘d rather spend taxpayers’ money on 6-figure salaries and benefits for Port officials, and stick the public with the bill for a revamped “Wall on the Waterfront”. Estimates of sea level rise advanced by Prop. A proponents are likely inflated. They predict an increase of “as much as 6 feet” by the year 2100. But a study published by the U.S. Geological Survey in 2006 (<https://pubs.er.usgs.gov/publication/70157139>) contained a more sober estimate: “Relative to sea levels in 2000, by the 2070–2099 period, sea level rise projections range from 11–54 centimeters” at the low end, to “17–72 centimeters for the highest” amount of increase – i.e. just over 2 feet of increase at most by 2100.

If some bay water were to spill over the wall and into BART/Muni tunnels, as proponents claim “could” happen in a once-every-500-years storm, it would be far cheaper to simply pump the water out if and when that does happen, than spend billions on a wall which could make little difference and which could be much cheaper to repair in a few years with new construction technology. Incurring massive debt on the basis of dubious predictions will hurt San Francisco residents now, with higher rents and higher property taxes. It’s a bad idea. Vote NO on Proposition A. Libertarian Party of San Francisco [www.LPSF.org](http://www.LPSF.org)

Proponent’s Argument in Favor of Proposition A

Rebuttal to Proponent’s Argument in Favor of Proposition A

6338-EN-N18-CP63

Arguments are the opinions of the authors and have not been checked for accuracy by any official agency. Arguments are printed as submitted. Spelling and grammatical errors have not been corrected.

Local Ballot Measures – Proposition A

Proposition A attempts to make San Francisco property owners and renters pay for the Port Commission’s failure to maintain bayshore infrastructure. “Seawall” is misleading – it’s actually a wall along the bay. The ballot description falsely implies that this waterfront promenade and the rocks and earth underlying it somehow protect the entire city from high tides and flooding. That is nonsense. Only properties along that section of the waterfront would be affected, not the whole downtown area let alone all of San Francisco. If businesses leasing waterfront property from the Port Commission want those properties to be better protected against baywater spillover, they can pay for it themselves. Perhaps officials like the Port Director, who received over \$340,000 in salary and benefits in 2015, could contribute some of their compensation. But politicians prefer to soak taxpayers (a few hundred million dollars now, lest we reject a higher demand) for a project they say will ultimately cost up to \$5 billion – a number which probably lowballs what they

really want to spend, as a former mayor admitted in a July 2013 Chronicle column: “News that the Transbay Terminal is something like \$300 million over budget should not come as a shock to anyone. We always knew the initial estimate was way under the real cost. Just like we never had a real cost for the Central Subway or the Bay Bridge... In the world of civic projects, the first budget is really just a down payment. If people knew the real cost from the start, nothing would ever be approved. The idea is to get going. Start digging a hole and make it so big, there's no alternative to coming up with the money to fill it in.” Don't reward deception and waste. Vote No on Proposition A. Libertarian Party of San Francisco [www.LPSF.org](http://www.LPSF.org)

San Francisco's Seawall is a critical safeguard for our entire city. Keep us safe by voting Yes on A. • Yes on A protects us against earthquakes and disasters. A major earthquake could cause our 100-year-old Seawall to fail, impacting hundreds of thousands of residents and causing billions of dollars in damage. • Yes on A prevents flooding of downtown and MUNI/BART tunnels. Even today, a major storm event could flood the BART and MUNI tunnels, endangering lives and paralyzing regional transit. • Yes on A safeguards emergency supply and evacuation routes. We need the Embarcadero in a disaster to allow evacuation of hundreds of thousands of people and land critical emergency supplies. • Yes on A prepares San Francisco for sea level rise due to climate change. Fixing our Seawall is a critical step that must be taken to prepare for water levels to increase as much as 6 feet by the end of the century.

• Yes on A does NOT raise property tax rates. The City carefully manages its bond program so that Proposition A will NOT increase property tax rates. There will be independent citizen oversight of spending and regular financial audits. To keep San Francisco safe, please join us and vote YES on A. Mayor London Breed Supervisor Aaron Peskin Assessor-Recorder Carmen Chu Port Commissioner Doreen Woo Ho\* Fire Chief Joanne Hayes-White\* Fire Commission President Ken Cleaveland\* San Francisco Firefighters Union Local 798 San Francisco Police Chief William Scott\* \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization.

Opponent's Argument Against Proposition A

Rebuttal to Opponent's Argument Against Proposition A

64 38-EN-N18-CP64

Arguments are the opinions of the authors and have not been checked for accuracy by any official agency. Arguments are printed as submitted. Spelling and grammatical errors have not been corrected.

Paid Arguments – Proposition A

Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A City Leaders All Agree, Vote Yes On Proposition A As members of State and local government, we often disagree on issues. But we ALL AGREE that Proposition A is the critical first step in the plan to strengthen our Seawall and make our city safer. Our Seawall was built over 100 years ago, and is in dire need of strengthening to modern seismic standards that can withstand what geologists predict will be a massive earthquake within the next 30 years. It is extremely important that we begin the work to strengthen our seawall now. • The Seawall is critical to the City's network of emergency response. In the event of a major earthquake the Embarcadero and waterfront must be safe and available for emergency response and evacuation. • The Seawall is key to our regional transportation network, with BART, Muni, ships and ferries all dependent on a strong, seismically safe Seawall. • The Seawall supports and protects key utility infrastructure and water supplies. • More than

\$24 billion in economic activity is at risk from failure of the Seawall due to an earthquake and sea level rise. Proposition A funds the essential infrastructure work needed to protect our city without raising our taxes. Please join us in voting YES on A. A Stronger Seawall for a Safer San Francisco. State Senator Scott Wiener Assemblymember David Chiu Assemblymember Phil Ting Board of Supervisors President Malia Cohen Supervisor Sandra Fewer Supervisor Catherine Stefani Supervisor Aaron Peskin Supervisor Katy Tang Supervisor Vallie Brown Supervisor Jane Kim Supervisor Norman Yee Supervisor Rafael Mandelman Supervisor Hillary Ronen Supervisor Ahsha Safai State Senator (ret.) Mark Leno Former State Assemblymember Tom Ammiano Former Mayor Art Agnos The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P., Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc.

Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Waterfront leaders urge you to vote YES on A Delancey Street and the San Francisco Giants have been on the waterfront for decades. We have been proud to contribute to the renaissance of this beautiful area and to work with the Port as it works to restore, protect and improve it. We both strongly support Proposition A because it is critical to the future of our waterfront and our city. It safeguards San Francisco against earthquakes, flooding and sea level rise. It is a thoughtful, carefully crafted measure that will dedicate resources effectively and not raise property tax rates. We know firsthand that the Port of San Francisco has a demonstrated ability to manage large projects effectively. We ask you to join with us as we support Prop A, one of the most critical waterfront projects in the history of San Francisco. Larry Baer, CEO, San Francisco Giants, Campaign Co-Chair, Proposition A Mimi Silbert, Chief Executive Officer, Delancey Street The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty L.P., Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Strengthen our Seawall for earthquakes and disasters. Yes on A. Our 100-year-old Seawall has a critical role to play in safeguarding San Francisco from earthquakes and disasters. If it is not strengthened, it could collapse in an earthquake. This would cause irreparable harm to the immediate area, and could lead to flooding of vast parts of downtown, including the flooding of BART and MUNI tunnels which would paralyze regional transit. It would also make it impossible for the city to receive emergency supplies on the Embarcadero, or to conduct necessary evacuations from the Embarcadero. As leaders charged with keeping San Franciscans safe, we urge you to vote Yes on Prop A – a vital safeguard to prepare our city for disaster. San Francisco Firefighters Union Local 798 San Francisco Police Chief William Scott\* Doreen Woo Ho, Port Commissioner\* Vicki L Hennessy, Sheriff \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization.

6538-EN-N18-CP65

Arguments are the opinions of the authors and have not been checked for accuracy by any official agency. Arguments are printed as submitted. Spelling and grammatical errors have not been corrected.

Paid Arguments – Proposition A

The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P., Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Prop A Is The Fiscally Responsible Solution to Strengthen Our Seawall Our Seawall is the foundation of our northeastern waterfront, but is over 100 years old. Now is the time to invest in its rebuilding before disaster strikes when the next large earthquake occurs. Proposition A is the fiscally responsible way to rebuild our crumbling infrastructure. It is City policy to limit the amount of money it borrows by issuing new bonds only as prior bonds are paid off. That means no new taxes for residents while making a critical investment in protecting lives, safeguarding emergency evacuation routes, and protecting \$24 billion in economic activity that is at risk

from failure of the seawall due to an earthquake and sea level rise. Voting Yes on Prop A is the responsible fiscal choice. SPUR San Francisco Chamber of Commerce and our 2,500 local businesses. The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P., Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Help San Francisco prepare for sea level rise by voting Yes on A Adapting to sea level rise is no longer something that might happen in the future. Sea level rise is happening NOW, and we expect between 12" and 66" of sea level rise before the year 2100. The next King Tide on December 22nd and 23rd of this year will flood the Embarcadero and force it to close. BART and Muni also would be inundated now from an extreme rainstorm at high tide. Proposition A will allow the City to address sea level rise NOW. We need Proposition A to defend our city from sea level rise today. Please vote YES on A! Save the Bay Sierra Club San Francisco League of Conservation Voters The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc.

Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Asian American leaders support a stronger Seawall to protect San Francisco from Earthquakes and Disasters. Yes on A. San Francisco is in dire need of upgrading our Seawall. This Bond will make the necessary investments to protect our communities from the real possibility of a large earthquake. We need to strengthen the Embarcadero and protect the waterfront from the expected 12" to 66" of expected sea level rise in the next several decades. San Franciscans who live far away from the Embarcadero will also benefit from Prop A. Prop A protects MUNI and BART tunnels from flooding that would paralyze local transit. If you wait until disaster strikes, it is estimated that the post-disaster costs of repairing the Embarcadero, MUNI and BART tunnels, and the loss of economic activity would be four times as expensive as fixing it now. Please Vote Yes on Proposition A. Assembly Member David Chiu Assembly Member Phil Ting Assessor-Recorder Carmen Chu Supervisor Sandra Lee Fewer Supervisor Katy Tang Supervisor Jane Kim Supervisor Norman Yee Mary Jung, Former Chair San Francisco Democratic Party\* \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization. The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Tenant and Affordable Housing Advocates endorse Yes on A If an earthquake hits San Francisco, none of us will be immune. That's why all of us must be prepared – and why we strongly support Proposition A. By strengthening our Seawall, Prop A will prevent disastrous flooding from both a Seawall failure and sea level rise that would impact both commercial and residential areas, impacting many renters. And, it protects every San Franciscan who uses BART or MUNI, both of which are liable to being flooded if the Seawall is not strengthened. Prop A will not raise property tax rates for property owners OR renters.

66 38-EN-N18-CP66

Arguments are the opinions of the authors and have not been checked for accuracy by any official agency. Arguments are printed as submitted. Spelling and grammatical errors have not been corrected.

Paid Arguments – Proposition A

Please join us and vote YES on A. Affordable Housing Alliance Gail Gillman, Chief Executive Officer Community Housing Partnership\* \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization. The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc, Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Working San Franciscans Urge a Yes Vote on Prop A As members of labor, we know that nothing is more important than the foundation of a structure. That's why we are wholeheartedly supporting Proposition A. Our Embarcadero seawall is the foundation of three miles of our northeastern waterfront from Fisherman's

Wharf to AT&T Park. Our seawall was built over 100 years ago, before modern construction standards were in place. The Seawall could fail in the next earthquake, flooding our transit systems and endangering our city's emergency evacuation routes. We urge you to vote YES on A. San Francisco Firefighters local 798 Tim Paulson, Secretary-Treasurer San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council Laborers Local 261 International Longshore & Warehouse Union The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty L.P. Airbnb Inc. Facebook Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Westside leaders support Proposition A The strength of our seawall is critical to the safety of residents citywide. The time to act is now, and Prop A is the first step we can take to rebuild our 100 year old seawall and protect ALL of our city. Rebuilding the seawall will safeguard residents who work downtown and near the Embarcadero when the next earthquake hits, and will ensure that emergency responders are able to address the emergency needs of residents on the Westside and in every corner of the city. As Westside residents, we support Prop A to strengthen our Seawall for earthquakes and disasters. And Prop A does NOT raise taxes!

Assembly Member Phil Ting Assessor-Recorder Carmen Chu Supervisor Sandra Lee Fewer Supervisor Katy Tang Supervisor Norman Yee Supervisor Ahsha Safai Coalition for San Francisco Neighborhoods The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc., Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Waterfront neighbors and businesses support Yes on A As businesses and communities along the waterfront, we know the urgency of strengthening our Seawall. Every day we are concerned that when the next big earthquake hits, it will damage or destroy the wharves and piers that support our economy, and that our streets are likely to flood. The time to act is now. All of us stand together. Vote Yes on A. Coalition for San Francisco Neighborhoods South Beach District 6 Democratic Club Barbary Coast Neighborhood Association Potrero Boosters Neighborhood Association Lou Giraudo, Boudin Bakeries Bruce Agid, President, Eastern Neighborhoods Democratic Club\* Alice Rogers, Neighborhood advocate Angeles Roy, Mission Bay resident \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization. The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Jobs and Social Justice for San Francisco. Yes on A. Strengthening our Seawall will create 4,000 good paying jobs in San Francisco, helping to ensure working men and women can afford to live in the City. The Port will work with the Office of Economic and Workforce Development and City Build as it bids contracts for Seawall construction work to make sure that these contracts encourage opportunities for Local Business Enterprises and employment for San Francisco residents including First Source Hiring and Local Hiring. This project will create entrepreneurial opportunities, new businesses and economic activity particularly in working-class neighborhoods throughout the City.

6738-EN-N18-CP67

Arguments are the opinions of the authors and have not been checked for accuracy by any official agency. Arguments are printed as submitted. Spelling and grammatical errors have not been corrected.

Paid Arguments – Proposition A

Furthermore, residents who depend most on public transit such as the T-Third Line to get to work and to school would be the most adversely impacted by a disaster that would devastate our transit network. As leaders in our community, we urge you to vote Yes on A Malia Cohen, Board of Supervisor President Hillary Ronen, Supervisor David Campos, Chair San Francisco Democratic Party\* Sophie Maxwell, Former

Supervisor San Francisco Latino Democratic Club \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization. The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc., Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A LGBTQ community is united for Proposition A When disaster strikes, communities must come together as one. That's why the LGBTQ community is united for Proposition A. Prop A is essential to keep every San Franciscan safe. We stand together and ask you to join us in voting Yes on A. State Senator Scott Wiener Supervisor Rafael Mandelman David Campos, Chair San Francisco Democratic Party\* Bevan Dufty, BART Director\* Mark Leno, State Senator (Ret.) Tom Ammiano, Former State Assembly Member Debra Walker, Building Inspection Commissioner\* Alice B. Toklas Democratic Club \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization. The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc, Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Protect public transit, BART and MUNI. Vote Yes on Prop A We must strengthen our Seawall. Every day, over a million people use MUNI or BART transit routes that end downtown or along the waterfront. Over 440,000 people arrive daily by ferry or by the transbay BART tube. All of these lines of transit would completely stop working in the event of a major earthquake and resulting collapse of the Seawall. Even more urgently, a powerful storm today like the one Houston saw last year would cause sea levels to rise over Pier 14 and flow down the Howard Street tunnel. Saltwater would flood the Embarcadero MUNI / BART station and incapacitate regional transit. We would see service delays, and even lines rendered inoperable, all across the city. Proposition A makes the vital investment we need to protect our transit infrastructure from earthquakes and rising sea levels. Vote Yes with us on Proposition A. BART Director Bevan Dufty\* BART Director Nick Josefowitz\* Cheryl Brinkman, Chair, SFMTA\* Lee Hsu, Director, SFMTA\* Thea Selby, Chair, SF Transit Riders \*For identification purposes only; author is signing as an individual and not on behalf of an organization. The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc. Paid Argument IN FAVOR of Proposition A Protect public safety without raising taxes, vote YES on A Investing in strengthening our seawall is a matter of urgent public safety that makes economic sense. The value of assets at risk in the event of a disaster is ten to forty times greater than the investment needed to strengthen the seawall. Due to our thoughtfully planned capital investment program, Proposition A will not raise tax rates. We have the opportunity to invest in our city in a smart, effective way. Conservatives agree, vote yes on A. San Francisco Republican Party The true source(s) of funds for the printing fee of this argument: Kilroy Realty, L.P. Airbnb, Inc. Facebook, Inc.

End of Paid Arguments IN FAVOR of Proposition A

No Paid Arguments AGAINST Proposition A Were Submitted